



Co-funded by the
Erasmus+ Programme
of the European Union



Minutes of the Monitoring Meeting to Ukraine under the Erasmus+ “Promoting internationalization of research through establishment and operationalization of Cycle 3 Quality Assurance System in line with the European Integration” (C3QA)

Date: 15-18 April, 2019

Participants:

- the project’s EMT represented by Arayik Navoyan
- the project partner Hceres represented by François Pernot
- working groups from: Kyiv National University of Trade and Economics (KNUTE),
Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics (KhNUE),
Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine (MoES Ukraine)
National Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (NAQAHE)

- **Addressing current stage of activities and concerns of partners**

The project coordinator addressed current stage of activities and concerns of partners. All partners expressed their satisfaction on the quality of the project correspondence, daily management and coordination by the EMT which efficiently guides the partners through the project activities. As mentioned, this aspect also concerned the documentary support which is useful for the project implementation as well. Furthermore, this is especially true for the process of self-accreditation, preparation and procedure of self-evaluation. Concerning the latter it was a good occasion to formalize the processes related to the C3 (doctoral) programs under accreditation through documentation as well. Mr. Navoyan also informed that by the end of May the EMT will make mutual check-up of the expenses with all the partners in order to check the balance of payments. It was also highlighted that it is important to present the corresponding expenses carried out by the Ukrainian partners so far as co-financing and it was agreed that the template of the intermediate report can be used in order to fill in all the expenses on co-financing.

- **Discussing the Agenda of C3QA project activities for the period March - October 2019**

The question of advance payment of per diems was raised with regard to the expert panel participants from KNUTE and KhNUE to visit the 2 Mongolian universities. It was agreed that the EMT will discuss with the project coordinating Institution’s Financial and Administrative Department

on the possibility of advance per diems payment for Mrs. Borova (KhNUE) and Mrs. Gerasymenko (KNUTE).

The representatives of the both Universities expressed a concern about the conditions of the final payments under the project. It was explained that the last payments are expected to be performed after evaluation of the project's final report by the EACEA. In order to accelerate the procedure the Ukrainian partners asked about the possibility to sign an agreement with regard to the last payments conditions as the financial authorities of the 2 Ukrainian Universities requested. The representatives of the 2 Universities even proposed to use the existing template from another project which could be adapted within the current project. Therefore, it was decided that the project coordinator will prepare 2 separate agreements on the last payment to be signed with KNUTE and KhNUE, although the conditions of the last payment are already defined in the PAs. Mr. Navoyan reminded the partners about the necessity to provide pay slips for any expenses, particularly for the staff costs that might be requested by the project audit or the EACEA. It was also mentioned that the project coordinator agreed with the BDO Armenia, project's auditing organization, that there is no need to send the originals of the requested pay slips, instead the latter can be demonstrated during the skype call. The Ukrainian project partners ensured that all the needed pay slips will be provided on time. Afterwards, Mr. Navoyan presented the main activities foreseen for the period of October 2019 with the expected deliverables and concrete deadlines. All the Ukrainian project partners have expressed agreement with the updated agenda for the activities for the remaining period.

- **Discussing the preparation of monitoring visit of the National Erasmus+ Office in Ukraine scheduled on May 14, 2019**

In this regard, all the project partners from Ukraine ensured that the documents requested by the NEO Ukraine office are ready, the respective discussion are performed within the working groups and the corresponding working groups from the partner Institutions are ready for the Monitoring visit (in May).

- **Involvement of NAQAHE in the project and finalizing the “National level guidelines, standards and procedures of QA for cycle 3 programs”**

Mr. Navoyan stressed the importance of the NAQAHE involvement which is currently fully functioning. It was suggested to present the project deliverables to the NAQAHE for further consideration and all the project partners agreed to organize the works accordingly and to discuss all these aspects with the NAQAHE representatives during the foreseen meeting.

- **Organization of national dissemination conferences in Ukraine**

The partners agreed with the idea to have national dissemination conferences in Kyiv and Kharkiv before the end of the project to disseminate the project outcomes to the Ukrainian stakeholders.

- **Organization of the final conference in Yerevan**

It was noted that all the project partners are requested to nominate 2 participants from their Institutions *by May 10, 2019* at the latest. In addition, as part of their involvement in the final conference the participants would be requested to come up with their corresponding inputs. This would mean that each partner institution from the partner countries will need to present their own experience, perspectives and outcomes carried out and reached within the project. As to the EU partners, it is suggested to assign them the role of moderation and wrap up after each presentation session. Furthermore, the EU partners would also present their overall perspectives on the QA of C3 (doctoral) programmes in their countries and address their involvement in the project.

- **Extended meeting with the representatives of the NAQAHE**

One of the important aspects was also the extended meeting with the NAQAHE held at KNUTE involving the all the Ukrainian project partners, the EMT and the project partner Hceres representative. In the framework of the meeting the project's objectives, working methodologies and carried out activities were presented by the project coordinator. In addition, Mr. François Pernot, the Hceres representative, attached a special focus to the results achieved under the project in Ukraine. In particular, it was highlighted that the project has achieved the following results to be considered by the NAQAHE for further developments

- Capacity building for the staff of the MoES Ukraine and the 2 Universities on the QA of C3 (doctoral) programs
- Fact-finding country report on C3 (doctoral) programs
- Issues and propositions for the QA programs in Ukraine
- Pilot accreditation using the French guidelines and standards for the C3 (doctoral) programs accreditation at the 2 Ukrainian Universities, i.e. KhNUE and KNUTE

In this regard, Mr. Navoyan informed that after accreditation the project team will prepare recommendations including guidelines, standards and methodological tools for the C3 (doctoral) programs accreditation which will be presented to the MoES Ukraine for further adoption. Mr. Navoyan also invited the NAQAHE representatives to use these deliverables for further usage and The NAQAHE representatives expressed the hope for further fruitful cooperation with the project and as they are working on the methodological aspects with regard to the accreditation procedures and expressed willingness to consider the experience of the project.

- **Other questions**

- On behalf of Hceres Mr. François Pernot presented the Hceres perspective and stressed the fruitful cooperation between the 2 Universities in terms of application of the French standards and guidelines for the QA of the C3 (doctoral) programmes. He also expressed his willingness to sum up the experience of the 2 Ukrainian Universities in the framework of the accreditations under the Erasmus+ C3QA project so that the results could be presented to the NAQAHE, the MoES Ukraine and other Ukrainian relevant stakeholders.
- The MoES Ukraine representative presented the global developments within the field of QA of HE in Ukraine. In particular, Mrs. Driuk mentioned that the draft tools and procedures for the QA are already elaborated being under public discussion and hence the project can very timely bring its contribution to the whole process. Therefore, it was agreed that the project team will present its recommendations to the MoES Ukraine and NAQAHE by May 15th 2019.
- In addition, the MoES Ukraine representative was also interested in the experience of the project partners in terms of the usage of the QA standards as basis for administrative decisions. In this regard, Mr. Navoyan presented the Armenian example where according to the government decision on accreditation the HEIs that do not have institutional accreditation cannot be funded by the state budget or participate in international grants under auspices of the MoES Armenia.
- The MoES Ukraine representative also informed about the conference on the QA organized by the MoES Ukraine in Kyiv on June 11-12, 2019. The conference will host about 400 participants and the project representatives were also invited to participate. Mr. Navoyan noted that this can be an excellent opportunity to discuss the project results instead of organizing separate dissemination event. Also, it was mentioned that the project is ready to fit in the format of the conference and brief information and expectations regarding the dissemination from the project's point of view would be shortly presented. In this regard, further logistical issues will be decided later, once the MoES Ukraine decides on the final format of the project's participation (workshop, session, presentation, etc.) and all partners agreed to do their best for the participation in the above-mentioned conference on June 11-12th, 2019.
- Also, the problem of the staff costs payment was discussed with the MoES Ukraine team. It was mentioned that a solution to this is currently under discussion and the project coordinator will be informed once the decision is made. Mr. Navoyan proposed that if the solution is not found, the already transferred 960 Euro staff costs will be used for the travel and stay costs for the MoES Ukraine participation in the final conference in Yerevan (September, 2019).



Co-funded by the
Erasmus+ Programme
of the European Union



ERASMUS +

“Promoting internationalization of research through establishment and operationalization of Cycle 3 Quality Assurance System in line with the European Integration” (C3QA) project

Project number: 574273-EPP-1-2016-1-AM-EPPKA2-CBHE-SP

**Monitoring Visit by Grant Holder /
Meeting with the C3QA team from Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of
Economics**

April 15









Date: 15 April, 2019

Venue: Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics

List of attendance









	Name, position	Signature
1	Arayik Navoyan , C3QA project coordinator	
2	Iryna Zolotaryova , KhNUE coordinator, professor of IS Department	
3	Svetlana Nazarova , PhD, Head of Postgraduate and Doctoral Department, member of C3QA project team;	
4	Galina Nazarova , Head of PhD programme Economics, member of C3QA project team;	
5	Oleksii Besedovskyi , PhD, Associate professor of IS Department, member of C3QA project team;	
6	Kateryna Zaslavskaya , PhD, Associate Professor of Management, Logistics and Economics Department, member of C3QA project team;	
7	Tetyana Borova , DSc, Professor, Head of Pedagogy and Foreign Philology department	
8	Ganna Belokonenko , PhD, QA department, member of C3QA project team	
9	Viktoria Petrenko - PhD, Senior Lecturer of the Department of Pedagogy and Foreign Philology	










List of Participants on C3QA Monitoring Meeting

No	Last name	First name	Position	Institution	Signature
1.	Shkabrko	Serhii	Internat. Coop- Department	Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine	
2.	Lolotareva	Iryna	C3QA coordin.	KNUEU	
3.	Lugha	Liudmyla	member	NADEHE	
4.	Serapymenko	Anzhelika	C3QA national coordinator	KNUTE	
5.	Ivanova	Olena	Partner	KNUTE	
6.	Bozhko	Tatiana	Head of C3QA	KNUTE	
7.	Sai	Valerii	Vice-Deputy	KNUTE	
8.	Arayon	Narayan	C3QA EMT	C3QA part	
9.					
10.					
11.					
12.					
13.					
14.					

List of Participants on Meeting with NAQAHE members



No	Last name	First name	Position	Institution	Signature
1.	Bozhko	Tatiana	Head of Curriculum and Instruction Department, Associate Professor	Kyiv National University of Trade and Economics	
2.	Dluhopolskyi	Oleksandr	Member	National Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education	
3.	Fesenko	Lidiia	Member	National Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education	
4.	Gerasymenko	Anzhelika	C3QA Project Coordinator	Kyiv National University of Trade and Economics	
5.	Harmash	Anatolii	Member	National Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education	
6.	Ivanova	Olena	C3QA Performer	Kyiv National University of Trade and Economics	
7.	Kvit	Serhii	Director	Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine	
8.	Mazaraki	Anatoliiy	Rector	Kyiv National University of Trade and Economics	
9.	Mazaraki	Nataliia	C3QA Performer	Kyiv National University of Trade and Economics	

10.	Melnychenko	Svitlana	Vice Rector on Scientific Work	Kyiv National University of Trade and Economics	
11.	Mruha	Maryna	Directorate of Higher Education and Adult Education Official	Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine	
12.	Nakonechna	Neonila	Member	National Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education	
13.	Navoyan	Arayik	C3QA Coordinator, Vice-Rector on External Relations and Quality	“French University in Armenia” Foundation	
14.	Panich	Olena	Directorate of Higher Education and Adult Education Official	Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine	
15.	Pernot	François	Head of European and International Department	French High Council for Evaluation of Research and Higher Education	
16.	Prikhna	Tetiana	Member	National Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education	
17.	Prytulska	Natalia	First Vice Rector on Scientific and Pedagogical Work	Kyiv National University of Trade and Economics	
18.	Sai	Valeriy	Vice Rector on Scientific and Pedagogical Work and Foreign Affairs	Kyiv National University of Trade and Economics	
19.	Shapoval	Svitlana	Vice Rector on Scientific and Pedagogical Work	Kyiv National University of Trade and Economics	
20.	Skabko	Serhii	Official	Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine	