



Co-funded by the
Tempus Programme
of the European Union



Erasmus+
**“Promoting internationalization of research through
establishment and operationalization of Cycle 3 Quality
Assurance System in line with the European Integration” (C3QA)
project**

UKRAINE
COUNTRY REPORT
on
Quality Assurance
of Cycle 3 (doctoral) programmes in Higher Education



**МІНІСТЕРСТВО
ОСВІТИ І НАУКИ
УКРАЇНИ**



**КИЇВСЬКИЙ НАЦІОНАЛЬНИЙ
ТОРГОВЕЛЬНО-ЕКОНОМІЧНИЙ
УНІВЕРСИТЕТ**



Kyiv 2018

CHAPTER 1: Overall landscape – National Higher Education (HE), research and QA context (with focus on Doctorate level)

1.1 Brief presentation of the HE and research system

1.1.1 Country size, number of HE students, number of HEIs, type of HEIs (public/private, general or very specific), missions of the HEIs...

Ukraine is a state in Eastern Europe and partly in Central Europe located in the south-western part of the East European Plain. Its area is 603, 628 sq. km.

Ukraine ranks eighth in Europe in terms of population. According to the latest census of population, over 48.4 million people live in Ukraine, including 77.8% of Ukrainians and 17.3% of Russians. A share of the urban population is 67.2%. The official language in Ukraine is Ukrainian.

According to the Constitution, all citizens are provided with an access to free education. Complete general secondary education is compulsory in public schools, which constitute the overwhelming majority. Free higher education in public and municipal educational institutions is implemented on a competitive basis.

There are 288 higher educational institutions of higher accreditation levels in Ukraine. They include 196 institutions of state ownership, 80 institutions of private ownership and 12 institutions of municipal ownership.

A mission of higher educational institutions (academic institutions) of Ukraine is as follows: to create, systematize, store and disseminate modern scientific knowledge in order to improve the quality of life of people; to train specialists of European and world level in terms of intellectual and personal development. Higher education institutions of Ukraine realize their mission through main areas for development, which include social & pedagogic, international educative & training, scientific & research, innovative productive & business activities and others. These areas are put into practice through particular steps of development.

The Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine is the main body in the system of central executive bodies that ensures the formation and implementation of the state policy in the spheres of education and science; academic, scientific, technical and innovative activities; transfer of technologies as well as ensures the formation and implementation of the state policy in the sphere of state control over the activity of educational institutions, enterprises, agencies and organizations that provide services in the field of education or carry out other activities related to the provision of such services regardless of their subordination and form of ownership.

The National Agency for Higher Education Quality Assurance (NAHEQA) is one of the governing bodies in the sphere of higher education, the creation of which is provided for in the Law of Ukraine on Higher Education. The agency is a permanent collegial body authorized to implement the state policy in the field of higher education quality assurance.

Special academic boards are the main link in the system of certification of academic personnel of the highest qualification, which operate at scientific & research and scientific & technical institutions, higher educational institutions and other organizations and conduct fundamental and applied scientific research and have sufficient level of staffing, financial and logistical support for the training of highly qualified academic personnel.

As of the beginning of 2017, there are 994 special academic boards (727 doctoral boards and 267 candidate boards) involving 572 academic specialties in Ukraine. 763 special academic

boards operate at higher education institutions and, accordingly, 231 operate at research institutions.

- Description of the general architecture of training programs provision and of Degrees awarded

Training of higher education Ph.D. candidates is carried out as follows:

- Postgraduate education program at a higher education institution (an academic institution) involving intramural (day, evening) and extramural forms of study
- Outside the postgraduate education program (for individuals who professionally conduct academic, scientific & technical and scientific & pedagogical activities at the main place of work in the respective higher educational institution (academic institution))
- Self-guided preparation of academic achievements to be presented.

Postgraduate and doctoral educational programs are implemented as follows:

- At the expense of **the state budget** (government contract)
- At the expense of **legal or natural persons** (under the terms of a contract, in particular, **by means of grants** received by a higher educational institution (academic institution) to conduct scientific researches, which provide for the training of higher education Doctor of Philosophy or Doctor of Science candidates).

The Ph.D. training curriculum should contain information on the list and scope of the academic disciplines (30-60 ECTS credits), the sequence of their study, the forms of training sessions and their scope, the schedule of the educational process, the forms of current and final control.

- Articulation between Master and Doctorate level, statistics per level of study and field of study, students /graduates statistics

The Master's degree is an educational degree obtained at the second level of higher education and awarded by a higher educational institution as a result of successful completion of a corresponding educational program by the higher education candidate. Master's degree is obtained on the basis of educational & professional or educational & scientific program. The volume of the educational & professional master's program is 90-120 ECTS credits, and the volume of the educational & scientific program is 120 ECTS credits. The educational & scientific master's program must include a research (scientific) component amounting to at least 30 percent of the whole volume.

The Doctor of Philosophy is an educational degree and, at the same time, the first academic degree obtained at the third level of higher education on the basis of a master's degree. The degree of the Doctor of Philosophy is awarded by a special academic board functioning at the higher educational institution or academic institution as a result of successful completion of the relevant educational & academic program by a higher education candidate and the public defence of the thesis work (doctoral dissertation) against a special academic board.

Graduation of master's and postgraduate students from higher educational institutions of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine for the period of 2012 to 2016

Year	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
Master's students	61,689	67,260	58,006	59,319	37,725

Postgraduate students	4,937	4,819	4,584	4,908	4,289
------------------------------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------

Number of persons entered the postgraduate education program in 2016 by fields of study (at the costs of state budget)

TOTAL, persons	3,000
Education	305
Culture and Art	49
Humanities Courses	299
Theology	0
Social and Behavioural Sciences	445
Journalism	29
Management and Administration	153
Law	170
Biology	81
Natural Sciences	182
Mathematics and Statistics	99
Information Technology	150
Mechanical Engineering	125
Electrical Engineering	71
Automation and Instrument Making	99
Chemical and Bioengineering	66
Electronics and Telecommunications	65
Production and Technology	117
Architecture and Construction	117
Agrarian Sciences and Foodstuffs	155
Veterinary Medicine	68
Health Care	50
Social Work	9
Service Sector	0
Military Sciences, National Security, State Border Security	9
Civil Security	10
Transport	77

References to the national qualifications frameworks

In accordance with the Law of Ukraine on Higher Education the National Qualifications Framework is interpreted as a description of qualification levels that are systemized and structured on the basis of competences.

The third (scientific and research) cycle of higher education corresponds to the ninth level of the National qualification framework.

Scientific and research cycle of higher education allows students to acquire theoretical knowledge, skills, experience and other competences that are sufficient for development of

new ideas, solution of complex problems in profession, research and innovation, to acquire scientific and pedagogic methodology, and also to conduct independent academic research which results include scientific novelty, academic value and practical impact.

1.1.2 National statistics on research and role of the HEIs within the research system (if some), research priorities (at national level or at HEI level)? Role of other actors (if some)

The scientific researches in Ukraine are carried out in accordance with the following principles:

- Priority areas for development of science and technology for the period until 2020 (Law of Ukraine on Priority Directions for Development of Science and Technology № 2623-III dated 11.07.2001 (as amended on 16.01.2016)
- Priority thematic areas of scientific research and scientific & technological developments for the period until 2020 (resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 942 dated 07.09.2011)
- Medium-term priority directions of innovative activity at the national level for the period 2017-2021 (resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 1056 dated 28.12.2016).

Doctors of philosophy are involved in work related to scientific & research topics of higher educational institutions (academic institutions); the research results are further used in their thesis research.

EMPLOYMENT

Full-time graduates in 2012-2016 studied under the government contract

	Graduates				
<i>Years</i>	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
Number of graduates – total	3462	3400	3275	3474	2967
Employment in their own universities and higher educational establishments of the system of the Ministry of Education and Science	2449	2446	2433	2656	2049
Employment in other institutions and enterprises	879	826	776	678	713
No data on employment	134	128	66	140	205

1.2. Brief presentation of the doctorate level

1.2.1 How is doctorate level organized in the country?

The new Regulation on study of doctors of philosophy and doctors of science which determines the procedures of study at the third educational and scientific cycle of higher education in higher education institutions and research institutes in Ukraine (the Regulation), was approved by the resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No.261 dated 23.03.2016.

The study of postgraduate students in higher education institutions (research institutes) that commenced before the Regulation on study of philosophy and doctors of science will continue in accordance with the resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 300 dated 01 March 1999.

Accordingly, postgraduate students who applied for degrees of candidate of science and doctor of science will finish their study under respective programs in 2019.

1.2.2 Number of HEIs providing Cycle 3, Fields of interest at national level, Role of HEI in research and delivery of doctoral programs, award of qualifications, (and if necessary, role of other bodies in charge for the award of doctoral qualifications)

Information about number of HEIs and research institutes (RIs) providing Cycle 3 by fields of study is listed below:

Field of study	Number of HEIs	Number of RIs
Education	142	9
Culture and Art	32	0
Humanities Courses	154	15
Theology	3	0
Social and Behavioural Sciences	226	23
Journalism	14	0
Management and Administration	231	11
Law	60	8
Biology	36	24
Natural Sciences	112	35
Mathematics and Statistics	46	11
Information Technology	118	9
Mechanical Engineering	126	10
Electrical Engineering	46	8
Automation and Instrument Making	49	3
Chemical and Bioengineering	29	1
Electronics and Telecommunications	30	2
Production and Technology	46	2
Architecture and Construction	35	1
Agrarian Sciences and Foodstuffs	48	31
Veterinary Medicine	17	4

Health Care	83	29
Social Work	18	1
Service Sector	7	0
Military Sciences, National Security, State Border Security	16	3
Civil Security	11	1
Transport	31	0
Public management and administration	39	2
International relations	28	2

1.2.3 National statistics on Doctorate studies (Give your source)

Statistics on doctorate students in Ukraine:

Years	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017
PhD students in full-time study	19560	19522	19444	18366	16263	17350	15757	15486
Including PhD students at the cost of state budget (government contract)	18488	18399	18272	17287	15032	13799	12513	12263

CHAPTER 2: Nature and characteristics of doctorate studies

KYIV NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF TRADE AND ECONOMICS (KNUTE)

2.1 Information on Doctorate program design (methodology, ECTS...)

Cycle 3 Programs in KNUTE has been opened since 1966 and trains over 200 postgraduate students per year: candidates of science (equal to PhD). Training of candidates for PhD degree has been started in 2016 to response the changes in the Ukrainian Law “On Higher Education”. The KNUTE Regulations on the Procedure for Studding Candidates for a Degree of Doctor of Philosophy and Doctor of Science No. 1324 of 12.05.2016¹ has been adopted that year. There are 15 Cycle 3 programs in KNUTE now. There is no professional doctorate in Ukraine.

Nature of the doctoral programs.

There are two components of every Cycle 3 program: educational and research ones. The *educational component* involves gaining theoretical knowledge, skills and other

¹ KNUTE Regulations on the Procedure for Studding Candidates for a Degree of Doctor of Philosophy and Doctor of Science #1324 of 12.05.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://knteu.kiev.ua/file/MTc=/d90a6c58922d38c20a080ad6d6b10325.pdf>

competencies sufficient to produce new ideas, to solve complex problems in professional, researching and innovation activity as well as to master the methodology of scientific and teaching activities.

Some educational elements of doctoral programs are broadly defined by the Law “On Higher Education” and the national regulations (e.g. the higher education standards, the guidelines on PhD studies, regulation on academic mobility, etc.). For example, the curriculum for PhD studies must include an educational component lasting from 30 to 60 ECTS credits. KNUTE are autonomous in the creation and content of their respective educational curricula. However, there are some general rules regarding the curricula prescribed by MESU. KNUTE indicates the lists of obligatory courses, which ensures development of the compulsory (transferable and specific/subject) competencies / learning outcomes, and optional courses (at least 25% of the total amount of ECTS credits) in every curriculum.

The *research component* involves prosecution of own research led by one or two supervisors and presentation of the results in a thesis. Doctoral thesis is an independent detailed study that offers a solution to current scientific challenges in a particular area of knowledge or on the verge of some branches, the results of which are original contribution to the body of science and they are published in the relevant publications.

2.2 Characteristics of the Cycle 3 study:

- Describe the way Cycle 3 study is organized

(Selection of candidates and procedures for recruitment? research activities? Thesis to write and defend? National/local Commission to grant the diploma? National or universities regulation regarding minimum and maximum length of a thesis? Etc.)

Cycle 3 programs are well organized at KNUTE and last four years. To enrol in a doctoral programme, the student must have completed a Master course. The general admission requirements are: an exam in line with program subject area and foreign language proficiency at B2 (Common European Framework of Reference for Languages: Learning, Teaching, and Assessment). Candidates are also assessed on the basis of their average grades from the previous levels of studies, their professional skills and previous accomplishments.

PhD programs involve an educational component (up to 60 ECTS), extensive scientific research activities and publication of papers in the scientific journals. A PhD thesis is the final part of a doctoral program. The preparation, procedure and conditions for the defence of the PhD thesis are defined by the general act of KNUTE in line with the regulations of MESU. KNUTE has the obligation to make the thesis and the abstract (synopsis) available to the public on its web site (<https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/blog/read/?pid=6802&uk>), alongside a printed version of the thesis, which needs to be available in the KNUTE’s library, at least 10 days prior to the defence of the thesis. Each HEI is obliged to establish a digital repository containing electronic versions of all defended thesis, abstracts (Ukrainian – Autoreferat, short description of Thesis’ content), along with the Thesis Expertise Reports submitted by the relevant expert commissions and reviewers, the data about the respective mentors/supervisors, reviewers and commission members. All of the foregoing documentation must be available to the public. A copy of each thesis has to be sent to the Central Repository of MESU.

- Status, competencies and role of the supervisor

Each student of Cycle 3 programs is assigned by a supervisor along with its admission to KNUTE with the relevant order of the rector. Usually, a supervisor has a degree of Doctor of

Science (9 level of National Qualification Framework (hereinafter – NQF), which is higher than the 8th level of European Qualification Framework (hereinafter – EQF)). As an exception, the candidate of science (PhD) can also be a supervisor by the decision of KNUTE Academic Council. Supervisor, who is a Doctor of science (9 level of NQF), can perform simultaneous scientific management, not more than 5 degree applicants, including those who acquires academic degree of Doctor of Science (9 level of NQF). Doctor of Philosophy, who received permission from Academic Council of KNUTE, may supervise theses usually no more than 3 candidates of PhD degree.

There are no specific requirements to be met to get the opportunity to supervise the PhD students, but it is preferable to be a Doctor of Science (9 level of NQF) to do that.

In order to receive the academic degree of Doctor of Science (9 level of NQF) is necessary to have:

- *defended doctorate thesis (another than PhD one)*. The thesis, which contains scientific and practice results, need to be accompanied documents of confirming the practice of using research results – implementation in production, production test, obtaining new quantitative and qualitative indicators, significant advantages offered by technology, product samples, materials, etc. The thesis must also contain theoretical scientific results and recommendations of their use. The thesis should have basic text volume about 300 pages, which meets the requirements established by MESU;
- *published monograph*. The monograph is need to be printed without co-authors and contains summary results of author’s research, published earlier in scientific professional editions of Ukraine or other countries;
- *at least 15 publications*. Among them: at least 5 publications in foreign journals or Ukrainian journals included into the international scientometric databases, like Scopus or Web of Science; no more than 5 publications in electronic scientific professional publications; scientific articles in national and international peer-reviewed professional journals, which is recommended by MESU.

Since Cycle 3 programs for PhD degree at KNUTE have been operating just only a year there is no practice when PhD is a supervisor. Anyway, to get the permission for supervising the applicants of Cycle 3 programs Doctor of Philosophy has to meet the following criteria:

- at least 10 articles in national and / or foreign (international) peer-reviewed professional journals, published after defending the PhD thesis;
- at least 3 articles in periodicals included into scientometric databases Scopus or Web of Science;
- experience of guiding a scientific research or participation in its implementation.

In the case of meeting these requirements the Academic Council of KNUTE can authorizes a Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) to supervise PhD students for a period of 5 years.

- *Describe thesis defense mechanisms and regulations (including criteria for the award of doctoral degrees)*

Thesis must be publically defended at the session of Specialized Academic Council (hereinafter SAC) that is accredited by National Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher

Education (hereinafter NAQAHE) (by MESU up to the moment of NAQAHE establishment). There are 6 SACs in the KNUTE.

Thesis defences in a SAC involve the following steps: 1) submission of documents to the SAC; 2) previous examination of the documents, provided; 3) 1st Council meeting. Accepting documents by the SAC; 4) examination of the thesis by experts; 5) 2nd Council meeting. Recommendation the thesis for defence; 6) submission of the advertisement about the thesis' defence; 7) issue of the abstract of the thesis; 8) mailing the abstract to professionals and the libraries; 9) allocation of the thesis and the abstract at the KNUTE website; 10) collection of the responses to the abstract and the thesis; 11) 3d Council meeting. Thesis defence.

Mechanisms of academic management of Cycle 3 programs at KNUTE are determined by:

- Regulations on the Procedure for Studying Candidates for a Degree of Doctor of Philosophy and Doctor of Science (12.05.2016 No. 1324)²;
- Regulations on the Organization of the Educational Process of PhD Students at KNUTE (12.05.2016 №1323)³;
- Regulations on the Certification of Postgraduate and Doctoral Students at KNUTE (07.09.2016 No. 2526)⁴;
- Regulations on the Assessment of Learning Outcomes of Students and Postgraduate Students (05.09.2016 №2439)⁵;
- Regulations on Individual Work of Students and Postgraduate Students of KNUTE (04.10.2016 No. 2962)⁶;
- Regulations on Distant Learning at KNUTE (30.05.2013)⁷;
- Regulations on the Procedure for Realizing the Right to Academic Mobility at KNUTE (01.12.2015 No. 3141)⁸.

²KNUTE Regulations on the Procedure for Studying Candidates for a Degree of Doctor of Philosophy and Doctor of Science #1324 of 12.05.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://knteu.kiev.ua/file/MTc=/d90a6c58922d38c20a080ad6d6b10325.pdf>

³Regulations on the Organization of the Educational Process of PhD Students at KNUTE #1323 of 12.05.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/file/Mg==/ac56d423c4cd43f20f16a644e1b4c4ec.pdf>

⁴Regulations on the Certification of Postgraduate and Doctoral Students at KNUTE #2526 of 07.09.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/file/NzM1OQ==/96add50ab525837bdae8b0302ec96ff5.pdf>

⁵KNUTE Regulations on the Assessment of Learning Outcomes of Students and Postgraduate Students #2439 of 05.09.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://knteu.kiev.ua/file/NzU4MQ==/2e9c68cbe2d8f9a56ecdc32a73eefd29.pdf>

⁶Regulations on Individual Work of Students and Postgraduate Students of KNUTE #2962 of 04.10.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/file/MTc=/031cf20c4bc86b02a8ec3ad3659e5345.pdf>

⁷Regulations on Distant Learning at KNUTE of 30.05.2013. Available in Ukrainian at: http://dist.knteu.kiev.ua/files/pl_dist_30_05_2013.pdf

Specific criteria to defend a thesis in KNUTE relates to the process of preliminary thesis' review (Regulations on the Certification of Postgraduate and Doctoral Students at KNUTE⁹). The purpose of preliminary thesis' review is to make expert analyses of the thesis' readiness for the defence in a SAC. Preliminary review includes thesis discussion on the interdepartmental and departmental seminars.

PhD students (no later than 6 months before the expiry of postgraduate studying) have to submit fully completed and duly executed thesis for discussion at the department, where it was done. The next step is a submission of a thesis for discussion at the interdepartmental seminar. The decision of the interdepartmental board, which is set up for every PhD student on an individual basis, about the readiness of the thesis for defence is one of the documents must be submitted to the SAC. Student, supervisor, and Head of the relevant Department should ensure the passing of these steps up to the end of the studying period.

Head of Department assigns at least 3 reviewers – Candidates of Science (PhD) and doctors of Science (9 NQF level), and determines the date of the departmental seminar. Thesis review is provided no later than 30 days prior to the meeting. PhD student makes a report about main results of the research, focusing on its relevance, methods of research, the differences from prior researches (Ukrainian and worldwide), scientific novelty, practical value, the reliability of the data and the level of testing. If all the reviewers confirm the completeness of the research the thesis refers to the interdepartmental seminar.

Regarding the decision of the departmental seminar the rector set up the interdepartmental board and set a date of interdepartmental seminar. The members of interdepartmental board are highly qualified experts - professors, doctors from departments of the relevant scientific profile. In the case of reviewing the thesis in Economic Science there is a mandatory requirement to include the professor from the Department of Economics and Competition Policy into the composition of interdepartmental board. The thesis must be submitted to the members of interdepartmental board in 30 days before the date of the interdepartmental seminar.

The aim of the interdepartmental seminar is to come up with a considered opinion on the relevance, scientific novelty and practical value of the thesis compared with the existing achievements of national and world science. The list of participants at interdepartmental seminar includes members of departments, PhD students, heads of scientific research, member of the SAC. If it is necessary to involve other professionals, they must be invited.

The scenario of an interdepartmental seminar is similar to the scenario of thesis' defence at SAC. The main results of the thesis must be presented using visual material. Discussion of specific provisions and features of the thesis is made in the form of questions and answers. Reviewers must reveal positive and negative aspects of work and make a clear conclusion about its compliance with the requirements imposed by the Regulation on the Awarding of Academic Degrees¹⁰. PhD candidate must provide thorough answers to reasoned criticism.

⁸Regulations on the Procedure for Realizing the Right to Academic Mobility at KNUTE #3141 of 01.12.2015 <https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/file/MTc=e24af5ebf7aeb2799f6c45b1f20a12f3.pdf>

⁹Regulations on the Certification of Postgraduate and Doctoral Students at KNUTE #2526 of 07.09.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/file/NzM1OQ==/96add50ab525837bdae8b0302ec96ff5.pdf>

¹⁰Regulation on the Awarding of Academic Degrees #567 of 24.07.2013. Available in Ukrainian at: <http://zakon2.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/567-2013-%D0%BF>

The Chairman of the interdepartmental board shall ensure a thorough discussion of the thesis. The discussion / debate is open to all the participants.

There are two options of the decision made by the interdepartmental board with regard to the results of the seminar: to recommend the submission of the thesis to a SAC; to recommend the rework of the thesis. In the latter case the break must be announced for a fixed term. At the end of this term the thesis must be discussed again.

This procedure works in KNUTE for years. It is passed by all the PhD students, who defend thesis in KNUTE (more than 60% of Cycle 3 programs graduates).

Jury consists of 15-25 people. Among the members of the jury are, at least, 5 specialists in each specialty of the SAC profile; among the latter are at least 4 Doctors of Science (9 NQF level), who actively carry out scientific work and have publications in the relevant field of science, while others are professionals with scientific articles, monographs in this specialty which are published in the last five years. Supervisor may be a member of the jury.

Defence is a public event, which takes place in the accordance with the procedure prescribed by Regulations on SAC.¹¹ Meeting of a SAC for thesis defence is conducted in the state language by the following ceremonial presentation: 1) members of a SAC must be acquainted with the draft opinion about the thesis prepared by SAC before the opening session; 2) a chairman according to the members presence from the registration card informs the SAC about legitimacy of meeting and quorum for opening the session; 3) a chairman informs the agreed language of thesis defence; 4) a chairman announces the agenda, thesis title, details about official reviewers; 5) a secretary of the SAC reports about submitted documents and their compliance with the requirements established by law; 6) PhD candidate presents the main provisions of the thesis and answer the questions submitted orally or in writing; 7) the scientific supervisor make a speech; 8) a secretary of the SAC announces the conclusion of an organization where the thesis was developed, and the abstract reviews; 9) the PhD candidate meets the comments contained in the reviews; 10) the official reviewers make speeches; 11) the PhD candidate answers to reviewers' comments; 12) after each answer a secretary of the SAC asks the reviewers about the compliance of the comment of the PhD candidate to the criticism, which is announced in the review; 13) public discussion of the thesis; 14) final word of the PhD candidate; 15) election of Counting Commission to conduct a secret ballot; 16) secret ballot of Council members on awarding scientific degrees to the applicant; 17) announcement of the ballot; 18) approval of minutes of the Counting Commission by a simple majority votes of SAC members, which are present at the meeting; 19) discussing the draft and adoption of Council conclusions.

- Diversification of Doctoral studies (Are there procedures to validate a "Doctorate at work" Are there definitions of specific skills for a doctorate?)

One of the procedures to validate a "PhD at work" and "validation on skills" is an implementation of the research results. Implementation can be confirmed by a number of certificates:

- Certificate on the implementation of the research results in the activity of business and / or state bodies;

¹¹ Regulations on Specialized Academic Council # 1059 of 14.09.2011 Available in Ukrainian at: <http://zakon3.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/z1170-11>

- Certificate on the use of the research results within the wider scientific research of the HEI's department, registered in the State Institution "Ukrainian Institute of Scientific, Technical and Economic Information" (UkrISTEI) (<http://www.uintei.kiev.ua/main.php>);
- Certificate on the implementation of the results of the thesis in the educational process

- Internationalization of Doctoral studies (international mention, cothesis, grants mobility, use of foreign language....)

The PhD students of KNUTE are involved into the Erasmus+, Erasmus Mundus, Jean Monnet programs of academic mobility, as well as programs of academic mobility based on bilateral or multilateral agreements between KNUTE and other universities. However, it is not widespread.

The PhD thesis must be written in the official language (Ukrainian). At the request of the applicant the thesis may be translated into English or other language related to the subject of the study.¹² KNUTE has not such experiences yet.

- Authentication procedures of the Degree and if applicable recognition mechanisms outside the country.

The authentication procedures of the Degree depend on other countries' legal frameworks. Some of them asks for a nostrification, some does not. It is not depend on KNUTE. There is no need for authentication procedures if the scientists of KNUTE cooperate with foreign HEIs under the bilateral agreements between KNUTE and relevant foreign universities.

2.3 Positioning of Cycle 3

- Doctoral school? Research entity in relation with the doctoral student?

There is a doctoral school and 15 doctoral programs in KNUTE. Being specialized in economic studies KNUTE focuses the PhD studies in this field. The KNUTE admission list to the training on Cycle 3 programs in 2016 shows that the most popular specialties are: 051 Economics – 24% of PhD students, Finance, banking and insurance – 11%, Accounting and taxation – 7%, Entrepreneurship, trade and exchange activities – 7%.

KNUTE has a strong team of highly qualified teachers and researchers in the above mention fields, who can help PhD students to conduct research successfully. The share of teachers with scientific degrees of doctor and candidate of sciences (equal PhD), including honored workers of science and technology, honorary figures of higher education, academics and corresponding members of National and branch Academies of Sciences, in the total number of academic staff is more than 80%. Almost all of them are specialized in Economics, being in line with KNUTE specialization. That's why the percentage of PhD students in the above mention fields significantly prevails it in the fields of Politology, Philosophy and Psychology.

- Are Doctoral research subjects chosen in partnership with research units and in line with the scientific local, regional and national environment? - Beyond research unities are there

¹² Ukrainian Law «On Higher Education ». Available in Ukrainian at: <http://zakon2.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1556-18>

operational interactions with the industry sector and/or national, regional or local authorities?

The PhD candidates must justify the relevance and problemacy of their research through critical analysis and comparison with known solutions of the scientific problem. That's why PhD research subjects are chosen according to the research interests of the department, in partnership with different research units. The cooperation with ministries and other state authorities (e.g. the National bank of Ukraine, the Ministry of Economic Development and Trade of Ukraine, the Ministry of Finance of Ukraine, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Ukraine, the State Fiscal Service of Ukraine, the State Treasury Service of Ukraine, Antimonopoly Committee of Ukraine, the State Finance Inspection of Ukraine, the Pension Fund of Ukraine), organizations and enterprises also reflects at the topic of the PhD research.

- What is the ratio of Doctoral workers in the private sector?

KNUTE has not exact information about this ratio. However, knowing that about 60% of PhDs remain to work in the field of education (primarily in KNUTE), we can count that about 40 % of KNUTE's Cycle 3 programs graduates goes into the private sector. Also, we have taken a poll of business entities on this matter. 62.9 % of respondent point the presence of doctoral works among their staff, and 48.4% told about the need for PhD graduates in their socio economic sector.

- Is there any regulation that favors the employment of Doctoral workers?

Everything depends on the sphere of employment. KNUTE's Cycle 3 programs graduates practically do not have problems with finding a job the sphere of education, while in spheres of state administration, trade, production, etc., everything depends on the personal practical abilities.

- Are there any contribution from the private sector the doctoral curriculum? or to its financing ? of regulation ?

Sometimes, studying at Cycle 3 programs is occurring by the expense of private sector or individuals (under contract). But there is any contribution from the private sector to a PhD curriculum. The only thesis reflects the urgency, which was involved.

2.4 Follow-up of Doctoral Students and graduates

- Does the university follow up Doctoral students?

Yes, Postgraduate and Doctoral Studies Department provides this coordination. Students make their scientific research according to the individual plan, which determines the content, deadlines and scope of scientific papers and the schedule of thesis's development. Violation of the individual plan terms without the convincing reason, may be the ground for making a decisions by the Academic Council about the exclusion of the student. There are Follow-up Committees for each PhD student that consist of the supervisor and two professors, whose scientific interests are familiar to the topic of PhD students' research

- Are there trainings provided to Doctoral students? Are they compulsory to validate a doctorate?

Cycle 3 programs include educational component that:

- obtaining a deep knowledge of specialty (group of specialties), on which a PhD student doing research, including mastering basic concepts, understanding of

- theoretical and practical problems, genesis and the current state of scientific knowledge in the field of research, mastering the terminology (12 ECTS credits);
- mastery of general scientific (philosophical) competences aimed at forming a system of scientific philosophy, ethics and general cultural horizons (4-6 ECTS credits);
 - the acquisition of versatile skills of researchers, including oral and written presentation of the results of its own research in Ukrainian language, the use of modern information technology in research activities, organizing and conducting training sessions, management of research projects and / or drafting proposals for research funding, registration of intellectual property rights (6 ECTS credits);
 - gaining knowledge to present and discuss the results of their scientific work in a foreign language (English or another according to the specific specialty) orally and in writing, and for full understanding of foreign scientific texts of the relevant specialty (6-8 ECTS credits).

Some of these trainings are compulsory, some are elective (at least 25% ECTS credits of the full-time Cycle 3 programs). The students of Cycle 3 programs have the right to choose subjects offered by other levels of HE and linked to the subject of their research.

- Is there a document, a "thesis charter" specifying the mutual commitments between Doctoral students and thesis supervisors?

There is a Contract, which is concluded between KNUTE and the post-graduate student. The contract identifies rights and duties of the graduate student, but there aren't rights and duties of the supervisor. The latter are determined by the KNUTE Regulations on the Procedure for Studying Candidates for a Degree of Doctor of Philosophy and Doctor of Science¹³.

- Are there rules of conduct for doctorate within universities? Are they written? How are they applied? Has the university set up methods against plagiarism? Which tools (software against plagiarism) are used?

PhD students shall enjoy the rights and responsibilities of HE applicants determined by the Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education"¹⁴, as well as those pointed in Regulations on the Organization of the Educational Process of PhD Students at KNUTE¹⁵.

According to the code of ethics scholar KNUTE has a system of measures for compliance with scientific ethics, to prevent copyright infringement, unauthorized text loans (academic plagiarism) in the scientific literature. There is a practice of using the software "Antiplagiat".

¹³KNUTE Regulations on the Procedure for Studying Candidates for a Degree of Doctor of Philosophy and Doctor of Science #1324 of 12.05.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://knteu.kiev.ua/file/MTC=/d90a6c58922d38c20a080ad6d6b10325.pdf>

¹⁴ Ukrainian Law «On Higher Education». Available in Ukrainian at: <http://zakon2.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1556-18>

¹⁵Regulations on the Organization of the Educational Process of PhD Students at KNUTE #1323 of 12.05.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/file/Mg==/ac56d423c4cd43f20f16a644e1b4c4ec.pdf>

- Are plans set up by the institution to prevent and reduce situations that may lead to dropouts, for example follow-up committees for thesis, defense in the course of a thesis, tutor or referent, mediator in case of conflict, etc.?

Each department of KNUTE sets up the follow-up committees for each PhD student, that consist of the supervisor and 2 professors, who are the specialists in the field of his research. The follow-up committee establishes at the beginning of PhD student's training. It reviews the research materials twice per year.

If there is a conflict between PhD student and the supervisor, it can be mediate by the Head of the department (with regard to the opinion of the follow-up committee's members) and the Vice-Rector for Scientific Work of KNUTE.

- Does the institution provide its Doctoral students with theoretical and practical trainings in order to integrate into society at a level corresponding to his/her qualification, in the private or academic sector?

The detailed information about theoretical trainings is presented above (the second para of the section 2.4). As for the practical ones, now they are absent in Cycle 3 Programs' curricula, while just 1 year ago it was obligatory for every PhD student to provide practical trainings in academic institutions. It was a part of the individual plan.

- How many Doctoral receive a scholarship/financing to write their thesis? Where do scholarships/financing come from? - Are there theses financed by private or public firms, or by State bodies, on subjects specified by the financing bodies?

87% of PhD students in KNUTE are studying at the expense of the state budget (for government contract) and are obtaining the academic scholarship once a month within proven university funding. Others pay by themselves. The value of an academic scholarship, the procedures of its assignment and payment are determined by the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine. For excellence in studying, significant scientific and public activity PhD students may be granted by personal academic scholarship of KNUTE and personalised academic scholarships of The President of Ukraine, Verkhovna Rada (Supreme Council) of Ukraine, Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, Kyiv City Head. In order to improve living standards and incentives for academic achievements as well as for participation in social, sports and scientific activities, the University has the right to provide financial assistance and encouragement of undergraduate and postgraduate students enrolled under government contract. The Scholarship Commission decides to provide material support and encouragement separately for each person and each payment. Appointment and payment of scholarships to postgraduate students who are foreign citizens and stateless persons shall be in accordance with international agreements of Ukraine and of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine.

- What is the percentage of students finding a job immediately after their thesis? Six months after? A year after? Later?

More than a half of the graduates of KNUTE Cycle 3 programs are directly employed by the KNUTE and other HEIs. As for the data on other graduates' employment, they are not collected by KNUTE. There is only piecewise picture of their employment, created on the data from the Alumni Association and the personal contacts of graduates with KNUTE's personnel, first of all the thesis's supervisors and teachers of the relevant departments.

- Are there Alumni associations? Are they highly active?

There is an Alumni Association in the KNUTE, which is the active party to university life. The alumnuses participate in various activities and initiatives of KNUTE, finance some university's projects. However, KNUTE doesn't provide the regular monitoring of graduates. For those graduates, who continues their scientific career in KNUTE, the Scientific Community of Students, Postgraduate Students, Doctoral Students and Young Scientists is established. Community is a voluntary creative association that promotes science and the emergence of interest to scientific work among youth of the University. It operates independently as well as in collaboration with the University Administration, faculties and institutions, student government, labour union of the University, government agencies, public organizations of Ukraine and other countries, whose activities are not contrary to the principles of the Community. Membership in the Community is free for those who study and work at the University and is carried out on a voluntary basis.

SIMON KUZNETS KHARKIV NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF ECONOMICS (KhNEU)

2.1 Information on Doctorate program design (methodology, ECTS...)

PhD programs involve an educational component (60 ECTS), extensive scientific research activities and the publication of papers in scientific journals. Some elements of the PhD programs are broadly defined by the Law on Higher Education and the national regulations (e.g. the higher education standards, the guidelines on PhD studies, regulation on academic mobility, and the percentage of elective subjects). For example, the curriculum for PhD studies needs to include an educational component lasting 30-60 ECTS credits. Higher education institutions are autonomous in the creation and content of their respective educational curricula. However, there are some general rules regarding the curricula prescribed by the Ministry of Education and Sciences and the National Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education. HEI should indicate the list of obligatory courses that ensure development of the compulsory (transferable and specific/subject) competencies / learning outcomes and optional courses (25% of the total number of ECTS credits) in every curriculum). A PhD thesis is the final part of the doctoral study program.

Doctoral studies (PhD) last four years and complete a research project for the award of PhD. Students also undertake further research skills training and subject to specific training during Years 2-4 of the program. To enroll in a doctoral program, the student must have completed a Master course. PhD programs involve an educational component of 12 courses (60 ECTS credits), among them 6 courses are targeted towards the development of the following transferable competences:

- mastery of generic research competences, aimed at forming a system of scientific philosophy, ethics and general cultural overview, etc. (5 ECTS credits);
- acquiring skills universal researchers, including oral and written presentation of the results of its own research in the Ukrainian language, the use of modern information technology in research activities, organizing and conducting training sessions, management of research projects, etc. (16 ECTS credits);
- extensive transferable competences of a researcher, including oral and written presentation of the results of his/her own research in the Ukrainian language, the use of modern information technology in research activities, organizing and conducting training sessions, management of research projects, etc. (16 ECTS credits);

- gaining language proficiency sufficient to present and discuss the results of his/her own research work in a foreign language (English or another one according to the relevant specialty) orally and in writing, as well as comprehension of foreign scientific texts of the relevant specialty (10 ECTS credits).

Ph.D. cycle curriculum also includes 2 compulsory courses (9 ECTS credits) and 4 electives (20 ECTS credits).

The assessment of students' progress is based on the tests and examinations carried out according to the requirements of ECTS.

Ph.D. cycle curriculum includes Internship programs. Students spend 50 - 200 academic hours undertaking a Professional Internship for PhD Students.

2.2 Characteristics of the Cycle 3 study:

- Describe the way Cycle 3 study is organized (Selection of candidates and procedures for recruitment? research activities? Thesis to write and defend? National/local Commission to grant the diploma? National or universities regulation regarding minimum and maximum length of a thesis? Etc.)

For all types of doctoral degree the requirement is normally a second cycle degree of a good standard.

The preparation, procedure and conditions for the defence of the PhD thesis are defined by the general act of the KhNEU in line with the regulations of the Ministry of Education and Science. The institution where the PhD thesis is defended has the obligation to make the thesis and the abstract (synopsis) available to the public on its web site, alongside a thesis printed version is to be available in the institution's library, at least 10 days prior to the defence of the thesis. Each HEI is obliged to establish a digital repository containing electronic versions of all defended theses (dissertation), abstracts (Ukrainian – Autoreferat, short description of dissertation' content), along with the theses expertise reports submitted by the relevant experts commissions and opponents, the data about the respective mentors/supervisors, opponents and commission members. All of the foregoing documentation must be made available to the public. A copy of each thesis has to be sent to the central repository of the Ministry of Education and Science. PhD requires students to prepare a public defence of their research thesis. If successful, the defence leads to the award of a PhD degree (awarded by the Attestation Collegium of Ukraine upon the request of the corresponding defence council). The decision of defence council is validated if two thirds of its members are present at the defence, more than three Doctors of Philosophy among them.

- Status, competencies and role of the supervisor

Mentors/supervisors of applicants seeking a Doctor of Philosophy' degree and a Doctor of Sciences' degree can be members of the S. Kuznets KhNUE teaching staff of the S. Kuznets KhNUE who meet the selection criteria of the above mentioned University. The selection criteria applicable to PhD and D.Sc. teaching staff of the S. Kuznets KhNUE are in line with the recruitment requirements specified in Annex 12 to the bylaw of CMU, December 30, 2015, № 1187 "On Licensing Conditions of Implementation of Educational Activity of Education Institutions."

Supervision is normally provided by academics, research-active in the area of the candidate's research. Thesis supervisors/directors must have an academic degree. The supervisor may act joint and several, particularly when the research is interdisciplinary. Appointment is normally

approved by the S. Kuznets KhNEU Academic Council at University level. The S. Kuznets KhNEU does not a minimum number of theses each of them can supervise.

The selection criteria developed by the S. Kuznets KhNEU for theses supervisors define a minimum number of publications as well as other requirements to get competences for supervising thesis.

- Describe thesis defense mechanisms and regulations (including criteria for the award of doctoral degrees)

At the end of the fourth year of Ph.D. studies students are expected to submit their theses (dissertations) and no further write up period will be allowed. Students have to defend his/her thesis (dissertation) at the relevant department (Kafedra). If a student succeeds, he/she is permitted to defend the thesis (dissertation) at the corresponding defence council.

The preparation, procedure and conditions for the defence of the dissertations as well as positive decision on the awarding of the academic title is defined by the bylaw of CMU, July 24, 2013, № 567 “On Approval of Guidelines for Academic Degree-granting Decisions” with amendments.

The institution where the PhD thesis is defended has the obligation to make the thesis and the abstract (synopsis) available to the public on its web site, alongside a printed version of the work, which needs to be available in the institution’s library, at least 10 days prior to the thesis defence. Each HEI is obliged to establish a digital repository containing electronic versions of all defended theses (dissertation), abstracts (Ukrainian – Autoreferat, short description of dissertation’ content), along with the theses expertise reports submitted by the relevant experts commissions and opponents, the data about the respective mentors/supervisors, opponents and commission members. All of the foregoing documentation must be made available to the public. A copy of each thesis has to be sent to the central repository of the Ministry of Education and Science. PhD requires students to prepare a public defence of their research theses. If successful, the defence leads to the award of PhD degree (awarded by the Higher Attestation Commission of Ukraine upon the request of the corresponding defence council). The decision of the defence council is validated if two thirds of its members are present at the defence, with more than three Doctors of Philosophy among them.

Guidelines format for dissertations, abstracts (Ukrainian – Autoreferat, short description of dissertation’ content), and other documentation necessary for the defence are available in scientific journals, such as the Bulletin of Higher Attestation Commission of Ukraine, № 5, 2009.

Dissertation format requirements are defined by the bylaw of the MESU January 12, 2017, № 40.

- Diversification of Doctoral studies (Are there procedures to validate a “Doctorate at work” Are there definitions of specific skills for a doctorate?)

Students’ research activities are regularly assessed at the end of each semester at the relevant department (Kafedra) (research laboratory) on the basis of his/her overall research performance. At the end of the fourth year of Ph.D. studies students are expected to submit their theses (dissertations) and no further write up period will be allowed. Students have to defend his/her thesis (dissertation) at the relevant department (Kafedra), if the student succeeds, he/she is permitted to defend the thesis (dissertation) at the corresponding defence council.

General competence: the ability to solve complex problems in professional and/or research and innovative activities, providing a deep rethinking of existing and new integrated knowledge and / or professional activities)

Specific (e.g. transferable) competences:

- Mastery of generic research competences, aimed at forming a system of scientific philosophy, ethics and general cultural overview, etc. (5 ECTS credits);
- acquiring universal researchers skills , including oral and written presentation of the results of its own research Ukrainian language, the use of modern information technology in research activities, organizing and conducting training sessions, management of research projects, etc. (16 ECTS credits);
- extensive transferable competences of a researcher, including oral and written presentation of the results of his/her own research in the Ukrainian language, the use of modern information technology in research activities, organizing and conducting training sessions, management of research projects, etc. (16 ECTS credits);
- gaining language proficiency sufficient to present and discuss the results of his/her own research work in a foreign language (English or another one according to the relevant specialty) orally and in writing, as well as comprehension of foreign scientific texts of the relevant specialty (10 ECTS credits).

- *Internationalization of Doctoral studies (international mention, co-thesis, grants mobility, use of foreign language....)*

KhNUE PhD students can take part in the programmes as international thesis or co-thesis as well as can an opportunity to enter KhNEU and international HEI PhD programme. In this case, defence takes place under the terms of the inter-institutional agreements.

There are 2 examples of successful experience in writing an joint international thesis by KhNUE PhD students:

- in 2008 – thesis on the topic «[Business intelligence for small and middle-sized enterprises](#)» by specialty 08.00.11 Mathematical methods, models and informational technology in economics (in collaboration with University Lyon 2 scientists);
- in 2013-2016 – thesis on the topic «Evaluation of tourism potential of Ukraine» by specialty 08.00.03 Economics and management of national economy (under the terms of an individual contract for writing a joint international dissertation between KhNUE and University Lyon 2).

Academic mobility of PhD students is regulated by the Bylaw of CMU, August 12, 2015, №579 and clarified by the document “On Certain Issues of the Approval of the Procedure for Academic Mobility” by the MESU.

KhNUE PhD students can take part in Erasmus +: KA1 programs (in particular, with University Lyon 2 based on ratified a study / internship agreement aimed at facilitating international mobility of students, PhD students, faculty and staff in higher education), as well as programs of academic mobility based on bilateral inter-institutional agreements between KhNUE and other foreign HEIs (in particular, Friedrich-Alexander University Erlangen-Nürnberg (Germany)).

In addition, KhNUE PhD students can take part in projects and programs that are opened by various funds and receive appropriate scholarships for implementation of their own research projects.

Thesis have to be written and defended in the official Ukrainian language.

2.3 Positioning of Cycle 3

- Doctoral school? Research entity in relation with the doctoral student?

Research schools play the leading role in the development of S. Kuznets KhNEU research activity, raising its status in foreign and domestic ratings and education of proficiency level staff.

The applicants of research schools carry out their thesis research; take part in fundamental and applied scientific achievements; take part in problem research teams; take regular part in international and national scientific research conferences, scientific and methodological seminars and round tables (together with the representatives of research schools of S. Kuznets KhNEU and other Kharkiv region's institutions.

- Are Doctoral research subjects chosen in partnership with research units and in line with the scientific local, regional and national environment?

KhNEU undertakes considerable range of research activities focused on certain directions of research in various fields related to the development of Ukraine.

Agreements between public and private economic entities of different forms of ownership and S.Kuznets KhNEU researchers were concluded to carry out applied research projects in 2016. The funding from economic entities have increased by almost 75% and amounted to 324, 300 UAH

In 2016 S.Kuznets KhNEU researchers worked at 4 fundamental and 4 applied research projects that were state-funded.

- Beyond research unities are there operational interactions with the industry sector and/or national, regional or local authorities?

S.Kuznets KhNEU organizes internship for students to gain experience through professional practice assignment together with a consulting project and an internship placement, both of which are conducted with private or public companies. Transferable skills training is a vital part of the intership program. Interactions with the economic entities are conducted through events, such as:

- workshops with invited guests;
- company visits;
- seminars with invited guests;
- yearly vacancy fairs;
- conferences;
- social events, and others...

- What is the ratio of Doctoral workers in the private sector?

The ratio of PhD researchers in private sector numbers 16% for full-time students and `100% for extra-curriculum students (the situation as of 2016-2017 academic year).

- Is there any regulation that favors the employment of Doctoral workers?

If PhD researchers are state-funded, they are obliged to work three years in the corresponding HEI.

- Are there any contribution from the private sector the doctoral curriculum? or to its financing ? of regulation ?

Private sector is interested in the relationship between theory and practice, and PhD programs improvement regarding the realities of today's labour market'.

2.4 Follow-up of Doctoral Students and graduates

- Does the university follow up Doctoral students?

PhD student's postgraduate studies are monitored and considered in a special case by responsible departments of KhNEU.

Besides the project chairman or tutor control, PhD student studies in the form of a sister individual plan report are monitored by the relevant department.

PhD students and their work on thesis by checking them every semester. Doctoral students and their work on thesis by checking them every year. Doctoral studies are monitored every year by doctoral candidate reports on the individual plan execution at KhNEU academic council.

Moreover postgraduate and doctoral studies department of KhNEU organizes PhD students training according to current legislation and 11 licensed special research subjects. The department also controls educational and research program execution (it has 2 components: educational and research) according to the relevant specialty and individual plan (terms and results of examination and test period, scheduled research work, assessment, in-depth training, defence, etc) and job placement during postgraduate studies.

In case of need or opportunity to study abroad (to study or carry out research) the arisen organizational issues are coordinated with KhNEU international relations department.

Information interesting for Doctoral students & graduates.

1. The best Doctoral students' are employed at the University as research and pedagogical employees with opportunity to carry out research and lecturing activity.
2. Graduates are involved in the University research work and public events.
3. Graduates are involved in PhD students' theses peer review carried out by specialized academic councils of the University.

- Are there trainings provided to Doctoral students? Are they compulsory to validate a doctorate?

PhD programs involve an educational component (60 ECTS). HEI is autonomous in the creation and content of their respective educational curricula. HEI should indicate the list of obligatory courses that ensure development of the compulsory (transferable and specific/subject) competencies / learning outcomes and optional courses (25% of the total number of ECTS credits) in every curriculum).

Data from interviews

5. *What would you propose to improve the training of graduate (doctoral) in your university / country?*

Responses	percentage of responses, %
The introduction of foreign practices to learn from the experience of research in developed countries	20
Redistribution of academic hours in the curriculum, by reducing the number of hours related to courses and increase number of hours for research work	50
Increase the number of academic hours related to in methodology and organization of research	20
Accessibility to various statistical data needed for the research analysis	10

- Is there a document, a “thesis charter” specifying the mutual commitments between Doctoral students and thesis supervisors?

There is no specific document, which presents “thesis charter” pointing out PhD students and their advisers mutual obligations.

But the majority of duties and responsibilities of every party (graduate, scientific adviser/ tutor) about graduate/ doctoral candidate training are clarified in postgraduate and doctoral studies department agreement which is signed between the applicant and the University.

- Are there rules of conduct for doctorate within universities? Are they written? How are they applied? Has the university set up methods against plagiarism? Which tools (software against plagiarism) are used?

KhNEU graduate training agreement is executed with each applicant who obeys University behaviour rules. The behaviour rules are detailed in each graduate individual plan, which a graduate receives just after being enrolled in the graduate school.

KhNEU regularly verifies the uniqueness of all university graduates’ yearly essays and project works (including PhD thesis copies submitted to KhNEU specialized academic councils), scientific papers (collected scientific articles, monographs) published teaching and methodological support (textbooks, educational supplies, teaching aids to conduct different studies), etc.

Verification aims to prevent plagiarism, to improve educational, methodological and scientific issues, favours to activate independence and individualization of scientific and pedagogic employees’ works. It stimulates honest competition, which is directed to forming the respect for intellectual property and conscientious academic ethic compliance. To follow academic moral principals at the University means that in the process of training or research work teachers and scientists use principals of honest work first of all. Plagiarisms, unlawful writing off, borrow ideas and writing under an assumed name is not recognized at our University. Since 2014 unified electronic vault of bachelors’, specialists and masters diploma papers (project works) has been carried out. Its aim is to provide the possibility of all papers preliminary (before the defence) plagiarism control. The electronic vault is every year replenished. A number of replenished diploma papers (project works) is 5 838 on 13.12.2016.

Electronic vault of textbooks, educational and teaching aids, monographs becomes 10 327 files by the end of 2016.

Furthermore the work in the bilateral agreement format with international company LTD «Plagiat» begins in order to disassemble the system (computer programs and database) to verify plagiarism of documents contents.

- Are plans set up by the institution to prevent and reduce situations that may lead to dropouts, for example follow-up committees for thesis, defence in the course of a thesis, tutor or referent, mediator in case of conflict, etc.?

To prevent conflict situations and graduates displeasure staff psychologist works in KhNEU, who will listen to the graduate and give an appropriate advice.

In case of being displeased or conflict situation arisen, a graduate can turn to postgraduate and doctoral studies department and vice-chancellor (pro-rector) on scientific and education work at any time. They will gather conflict committee consisting of key specialists who will consider the arisen conflict situation.

University management is always open to the constructive dialogue and comes to the conflict decision.

- Does the institution provide its Doctoral students with theoretical and practical trainings in order to integrate into society at a level corresponding to his/her qualification, in the private or academic sector?

To integrate gradually into the academic community and to become acquainted with the order and peculiarities of the graduate school training KhNEU holds a meeting of the first year graduates (PhD students) just after their entering the graduate school. Besides the graduates there are also KhNEU key specialists, education and scientific programs guarantees, functional departments' heads, who take part in PhD students training.

The first year graduates (PhD students) meetings are of periodic character and are appointed as the need arises.

Moreover the graduates (PhD students) turn to KhNEU Young scientists' council and Association of students, graduates and doctoral candidates, who advise them on peculiarities of the professional scientific research activity, promote more close connections between young and elder generation, providing the continuity of the research activity, refresh information database of young scientists interests area, etc.

The key scientists, who attend the graduates (PhD students) (the attendance is not included in the plan agreement), also deliver lectures and conduct trainings. As a result, the graduates (PhD students) can get relevant certificates.

Thus, Dr. Yan Urban Sandal from Norway lectured at KhNEU in March 2017. Lectures cycle included three disciplines: social entrepreneurship, innovation and service management. After successful completion of a course, listeners got relevant certificates of international model.

- How many Doctoral receive a scholarship/financing to write their thesis?

All applicants, who are preparing to enter KhNEU full-time tuition graduate school, get state research grants (from the state budget of Ukraine) at the rate of about 90% of the teacher's official salary, namely 4014 hryvnas. The state research grant is fixed to the whole period of graduate school training. The exclusive was 2016 students' admission. Among those who entered the graduate school that year there were evening classes graduates (PhD students).

The state research grant is not fixed to this form of education. Thereby a number of grants the latest year admission amounted 96%.

- *Where do scholarships/financing come from?*

Primarily funded from the State budget.

- *Are there theses financed by private or public firms, or by State bodies, on subjects specified by the financing bodies?*

Financed by private or public firms & by State bodies.

- *What is the percentage of students finding a job immediately after their thesis? Six months after? A year after? Later?*

According to the conditions of individual agreement between graduates and KhNEU all full-time tuition graduates (PhD students) must obtain positions in higher educational establishments. These agreement conditions provide full job placement of KhNEU Postgraduate and Doctoral students, who completed the whole training period and submitted their works for consideration.

Almost all full-time tuition graduates remain working at KhNEU (the average 95, 4% for the last 5 years) taking positions of department teachers (78, 3%), junior and senior research workers (10, 4 %) and functional departments' workers (6, 7%). The majority of KhNEU Postgraduate and Doctoral Studies (teachers, research workers and part of functional departments' workers occupy positions in their theses subject area.

KhNUE does not have official statistics on the percentage of students finding a job six months (or a year) after their thesis.

- *Are there Alumni associations? Are they highly active?*

KhNEU Young scientists' council and Association of students, graduates and doctoral candidates take an active part in supporting initiatives directed to young researchers strengthening and setting up linkage between young and old generation of researchers providing continuity of research activity.

CHAPTER 3: Internal quality assurance mechanisms

KYIV NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF TRADE AND ECONOMICS (KNUTE)

3.1 Are there any IQA mechanisms at institutional level? At Doctorate level?

To provide the QA of Cycle 3 programs KNUTE arranges the processes of:

- development and publication at the KNUTE web-site (<https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/blog/read?n=Viddil%20aspiranturi%20i%20doktoranturi&uk>) all the regulations of Cycle 3 programs;
- detailed scheduling of the students' research and education activity;
- creation of the follow-up committees for every PhD student that consist of the professionals in the field of his research activity;
- periodical (twice a year) reports of the students about the progress in the research;
- delivering profession-oriented scientific seminars;
- delivering lectures by the eminent scientists, etc.

3.2 Using ESG Part1, provide your self-evaluation of your doctorate programs and give explanation and references to ESG standards. (This will be used as examples, case studies, best practices in the report)

ESG and Bologna Principles are taken as basis of the educational programs' management in Ukraine. They are used for development of regulations of external and internal quality assurance. The strategy of HE development in Ukraine provides the practice of the European principles to satisfy the growing needs of potential consumers of educational services. The ESG principles and standards underlie the reforms in Ukrainian HE, specified by Ukrainian Law "On Higher Education", being applicable to all HEIs. KNUTE's following the spirit of ESG is evident from the above mentioned. Besides, Quality Management System (QMS) at KNUTE was first among Ukrainian universities certified for compliance with ISO 9001:2009 in 2009. In 2016 there was restart of QMS at KNUTE in accordance with ISO 9001:2015, which came into a force in Ukraine in July 2016. An independent external audit, performed by the certification body, confirmed the effectiveness of SQM of KNUTE for compliance with ISO 9001: 2015. The certificate of the conformity is issued for five-year period.

KNUTE has developed the internal HE standards through all the Cycle 1, 2 and 3 programs, which consists of the following sections: educational program; curriculum; availability requirements of internal quality assurance; professional standard requirements (if any); Additional requirements (if necessary), etc. The standards were confirmed by interdepartmental working groups, which consist of lead professors, as well as by students' representatives and representatives of employers. Among the latter are public authorities, institutions, civic and business entities.

SIMON KUZNETS KHARKIV NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF ECONOMICS (KhNEU)

3.1 Are there any IQA mechanisms at institutional level? At Doctorate level?

- Describe the mechanisms, by providing your definition of IQA mechanisms

The internal QA of educational activity at KhNUE is based on the system of strategic planning, monitoring and self-evaluation at all levels of the university management structure. It is governed by the Regulations on internal quality assurance in Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics¹⁶.

The basic procedures of internal QA in KhNUE are as follows:

- development of a system of indicators of the quality of education according to priority directions;
- development and implementation of monitoring procedures for determining the dynamics of the quality of educational processes and results;
- self-evaluation of the quality of educational activity by stakeholders of the educational process for self-organization;

¹⁶ Regulations on internal quality assurance in Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics. Available in Ukrainian at:
http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2016/Polozhennya-pro-VZYaO-15.07.2016.pdf

- preparation and conduction of marketing and monitoring research to determine the labor market needs as well as the requirements of stakeholders;
- preparation and conduction of socio-psychological studies to analyze the quality of educational services and level of satisfaction from them;
- assessment of the activities results to stimulate and motivate the participants of educational process.

- *Explain what standards are used (ESG or the ones defined by the institution?)*

Internal quality assurance procedures implemented by KhNUE are in line:

- with Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area which have an impact on QA policy, the architecture of PhD programs, student-oriented learning, student assessment, admission requirements, students' progress, certification, the selection criteria applicable to PhD teaching staff, educational resources and students' consulting, knowledge management, public outreach, constant monitoring and expertise of Ph.D. programs, external QA procedures;
- with Salzburg Principles that are realized as follows: an intended learning outcome-based individual research plan for a doctoral candidate has been developed; the accountability of processes of the doctoral education (research topic approval process, monitoring the progress of doctoral candidates through progress reports etc.) has been increased; doctoral candidates are encouraged to have publications in peer reviewed scientific journals; selection criteria for supervisor's qualification requirements (professional, research) have been set; doctoral thesis and main results are accessible and available for the public; etc.

3.2 Using ESG Part1, provide your self-evaluation of your doctorate programs and give explanation and references to ESG standards. *(This will be used as examples, case studies, best practices in the report)*

The ensuring the internal QA in KhNUE follows the ESG standards.

For ESG 1.1. Policy for quality assurance.

KhNUE has own policy to guarantee internal quality of the Degrees delivered. It has public character and is a part of KhNUE strategic management. The main priorities, guidelines and indicators of the internal quality assurance of scientific and educational activities are identified by Conceptual Framework of Development of Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics till 2020¹⁷, as well as Strategic Plan of Development of Kharkiv National Economic University for 2013 - 2020¹⁸.

¹⁷ Conceptual Framework of Development of Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics till 2020. Available in Ukrainian at:

http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/zasadu.pdf

¹⁸ Strategic Plan of Development of Kharkiv National Economic University for 2013-2020.

Available in Ukrainian at:

http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Strategic-Plan-HNEU-2013-2020-years.pdf

The ensuring the quality of educational activities in KhNUE takes place at the level of departments, dean's offices and corresponding departments as department of quality assurance of education and innovative development, methodological and educational departments, department of post-graduate and doctoral studies, research and development).

For ESG 1.2. Design and approval of programmes.

Basic rules for developing educational programs at each level of HE are explained and approved at the national level (according to the Bylaw of Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine (CMU), March 23, 2016, № 261 “On Approval of Guidance for Training Graduates of Higher Education Institutions seeking a Doctor of Philosophy’ degree and a Doctor of Sciences’ Degree in Higher Education Institutions (Special Research Institutions), to the Bylaw of CMU, December 30, 2015, № 1187 “On Licensing Conditions of Implementation of Educational Activity of Education Institutions”, explanatory letters from the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine, etc.), and contently are determined at the university level considering:

- goals and results of training, level of competencies that Ph.D. student has to obtain for each specialty;
- constant increase of professional skills of Ph.D. students and their development during mastering educational and scientific programs;
- ECTS terms in determining the training load of applicants;
- experience of leading universities.

For ESG 1.3. Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment.

The student-centered learning at KhNUE is aimed to attracting students to the educational process for motivation, self-examination, personal and professional self-development.

Individualization and personalization of students' learning is provided by the system of organization of the educational process with the free choice of the variable component¹⁹. Ph.D. cycle curriculum includes 4 electives (20 ECTS credits).

Academic mobility of aspirants is regulated by the Bylaw of CMU, August 12, 2015, №579 and clarified by the document “On Certain Issues of the Approval of the Procedure for Academic Mobility” by the Minister of Education and Science of Ukraine. This is facilitated by the participation of the university in the international programs of academic mobility Erasmus +.

In KhNUE the different forms and types of educational activity (e.g. training classes (lectures, seminars, workshops and seminars with invited guests, trainings, master classes, individual tasks, individual work, professional internship for Ph.D. students, etc.) and the research activity of applicants (participation in joint/group research, conferences, symposia, exhibitions, competitions, scientific seminars, publications) are used.

¹⁹ Methodical approaches to the formation of the variable component of educational programs in Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University fo Economics Semen Kuznets University.

Available in Ukrainian at:

http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2016/Metody_chni-pidhody-do-formuvannya-variantyvnoyi-skladovoyi-osvitnih-prohram-1.pdf

Twice a year the department of postgraduate and doctoral programs conducts an anonymous survey of the level of satisfaction/dissatisfaction of applicants with the quality of educational process and scientific activity. In particular, pedagogical methods and methods of delivery are assessed by on-line questionnaires.

University assesses the success rates at the doctorate with criteria that public on the Aspirantura website by an internal examiners.

For ESG 1.4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification.

The rules of admission to study at HEI of Ukraine (at 1,2, and 3 levels) approved by the order of the Minister of Education and Science of Ukraine on October 13, 2016 /No. 1236, and Rules of admission to the postgraduate studies and doctoral studies of the KhNUE in 2017²⁰, are determined and published annually on the official website.

In addition, the site hosts the Programs for each entrance test, which includes a list of questions and criteria for evaluation.

According to the Rules of admission to the postgraduate studies and doctoral studies of the KhNUE applicants admitted to the postgraduate study pass an additional test in the form of an interview with the Head and members of the subject committee, which is based on the presentation of abstracts of scientific doctoral project.

The assessment of applicants progress in the KhNUE is transparent and impartial. Procedure for assessing the success of the candidates of the KhNUE clearly defined the Provisional Regulations "On the Procedure for Assessing the Learning Outcomes Based on the Accumulated Rating System"²¹ (approved by the order of the rector on August 30, 2013 /No. 1) published in print and on the official website of the University. All exams are held in the written form²² and verified anonymously by the members of subject committee. The criteria for evaluation are brought to the attention of the applicants in advance, and the consultation before the exam is conducted. The appeal procedure is clearly defined in the Regulation on the organization of the educational process in the credit-module system of specialists training in KhNUE²³ (approved by KhNEU Academic Council, 21.12.2015), published in print and on

²⁰ Rules of admission to the postgraduate studies and doctoral studies of Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics in 2017. Available in Ukrainian at: http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/Abiturient/Pravila_priema_HNEU/2017/Pra_vyla_vstupu_do_aspirantury_2017_zi_zminamy.pdf

²¹ Temporary provision for assessing the learning outcomes based on the accumulated rating system. Available in Ukrainian at: http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2016/Tymch_asove-polozhennya-Pro-poryadok-otsinyuvannya-rezultativ-navchannya-studentiv.pdf

²² Regulations on conducting written examinations at the Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics Available in Ukrainian at: http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2016/POLO_ZHENNYA-pro-provedennya-pys%CA%B9movyh-ekzameniv-u-HNEU.pdf

²³ Regulation on the organization of the educational process in the credit-module system of specialists training in KhNUE. Available in Ukrainian at: http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2016/Tymch_asove-polozhennya-pro-orhanizatsiyu-osvitnoho-protsesu-v-HNEU.pdf

the official site of the university. The Aspirantura determines the conditions on retaking exams of Ph.D. students, including the number of exam passage attempts.

The procedure of state certification of graduates of KhNUE and their qualification at all levels are set out in the Regulation on the certification of graduates of Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics²⁴ (approved by KhNEU Academic Council, 21.12.2015) and published on KhNUE official website.

For ESG 1.5. Teaching staff.

The quality of the teaching staff at KhNUE is regulated by transparent procedures for selection²⁵, appointment to the post and firing, for qualification requirements and requirements for professional competence, and advanced training system. Procedures for the recruitment of staff are fair and transparent. Admission criteria for the recruitment of staff are equivalent to those anticipated for any other student applying for a higher education programme.

The preparation of scientific and pedagogical staff for obtaining scientific degrees is carried out within the framework of scientific schools of KhNUE with defense in specialized councils on the basis of the university, other HEIs of the country and abroad.

The improvement of qualification of scientific-pedagogical and pedagogical staff in KhNUE is carried out in the form of advanced training courses and internships for advanced training programs.

The quality of educational activities of scientific and pedagogical staff is determined by the results of the rating assessment according to "Methodology of quantitative assessment of scientific and pedagogical activity of teachers of the University"²⁶.

An assessment procedure of supervisor by PhD student and by HEIs is foreseen. HEI assesses the supervision of the director of thesis by monitoring the Ph.D. students' performance. The PhD students assess the supervision of his/her director during his/her thesis and if the PhD student is unsatisfied with the supervision he/she can claim to change the supervisor.

For ESG 1.6. Learning resources and student support.

Material and technical provision meets the licensing and accreditation requirements.

Educational and methodical provision of scientific and educational activity is represented by:

- regulatory framework for training PhD students,

²⁴ Regulation on the certification of graduates of the Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics. Available in Ukrainian at:

http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2016/Polozhennya-pro-atestatsiyu-vypusknykiv-HNEU.pdf

²⁵ Requirements for supervisors of higher education degree candidates of Ph.D. and Doctor of sciences. Available in Ukrainian at:

<http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/NAUKA/aspiranture/Vymohy-do-naukovykherivnykiv.pdf>

²⁶ Methodology of quantitative assessment of scientific and pedagogical activity of teachers of the University / comp. Ponomarenko V.S., Afanasyev M.V., Yermachenko V.Y., others. – Kharkiv : Publishing House of KhNUE, 2012. – 32 p.

- free access to electronic institutional repository of KhNUE (e.g. to articles, abstracts of dissertations, collections of conferences materials , patents, tutorials, collections of scientific works of students, reports on scientific researches, monographs) ;
- assess to resources of KhNUE scientific and technical library.

The transition of teaching and learning process to IT technology is actively implementing. It includes the production of innovative electronic multimedia interactive editions (textbooks of the new generation): 20 publications are available for online access in electronic resources of the library, online courses are developed. The database of articles, dissertations and abstracts; electronic multimedia editions was created and constantly replenished in the library. The database "Books Provision" was created, which provides an opportunity to receive information about the structure of all academic disciplines of the University; review disciplines in specialties and departments and related literature.

As a participant of the project "Structuring cooperation in postgraduate studies, teaching universal skills and academic writing at the regional level of Ukraine" (hereinafter referred to as DocHub) KhNUE participates in the development of a model and the implementation of a regional training center for PhD students - educational clusters which, through the DocHub project, will have material and methodological support for quality teaching and learning, responsible scientific guidance. It promotes the formation of innovative structures that will provide interdisciplinary training and the development of universal competencies of PhD students, their geographical and interdisciplinary mobility, as well as international cooperation within the framework of collaboration between universities and other partners.

For ESG 1.7. Information management.

KhNUE operates a corporate system that contains information on all types of activities (information about the contingent of applicants, the schedule and plans of educational processes, current and final progress, financial and economic indicators, etc.). HEI collects analyses and uses relevant information for the management of Cycle 3. The availability of such operational information and the ability to analyze it ensures the adoption of effective management decisions.

For ESG 1.8. Public information.

According to Law of Ukraine "On access to public information" (<http://zakon2.rada.gov.ua/rada/show/2939-17>) and Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area, KhNEU official website (<http://www.hneu.edu.ua>) provides easy access to information about university activities, specialties, educational programs.

It has all the necessary and actual information about his own activity, which is structured and presented taking into account the needs of different levels of applicants, graduates, employers and public organizations.

Official Page of Department of Postgraduate and Doctoral Studies (http://www.hneu.edu.ua/Postgraduate_Study) includes all the necessary and actual information about regulatory framework for training applicants; educational, methodical and informational support of preparation of applicants of the PhD for each specialty; mandatory and variable disciplines of preparation of applicants for PhD; project groups responsible for the preparation of PhD applicants in each specialty, educational process schedule for PhD students, etc.

For ESG 1.9. On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes.

In order to maintain the relevance of educational and scientific programs (within the framework of the current legislation) KhNUE is constantly reviewed them in response to changes in the priorities and needs of applicants and employers. All the Cycle 3 programs are well-monitored. The Cycle 3 programs are reviewed and modified by the demands of stakeholders. PhD students can make their own evaluation of skills acquired throughout their thesis by the descriptors of competences.

For ESG 1.10 Cyclical external quality assurance

For educational activities at the third level of higher education in a particular specialty HEIs must obtain a corresponding license from the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine (according to the Licensed conditions for the implementation of educational activities approved by the Decree of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine dated December 30, 2015, No. 1187). The KhNUE has been licensed²⁷ for training applicants for higher education seeking a Doctor of Philosophy' degree in 11 fields of study and programme subject areas (adopted in 2015) in compliance with the Bylaw of CMU, May 30, 2016, № 590 "On Licensing Educational Activity at the Third Education and Scientific Level".

Also, external QA is based on participation of KhNEU in international and national rankings (such as QS World University Rankings, U-Multirank, Webometrics Ranking of World Universities, HEI Ranking «TOP-200 Ukraine», etc.)

CHAPTER 4: External quality assurance mechanisms and national policies

4.1 National strategy in terms of Doctorate level and QA of Doctorate level : state of the art

Doctorate level in Ukraine was introduced with the purpose to stimulate and further to reform and to develop at the national level education and research study programs of Cycle 3 in accordance with the Bologna process through development and implementation of amendments in national laws and regulations of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine, and also through development and implementation of rules and procedures for Doctorate level studies in the universities. It was also another purpose to form a critical mass of researchers (including integration of capacities of research institutes of the National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine with active researchers and professors in universities) for providing education of doctors of philosophy.

In accordance with the Law of Ukraine on Higher Education, study of specialists with higher education is carried out under appropriate professional, research and scientific programs at the following cycles of higher education:

- Initial level (short cycle) of higher education;
- First (bachelor) cycle;
- Second (master) cycle;
- Third (educational and research) cycle;

²⁷License and certificate of accreditation of Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics. Source: http://www.hneu.edu.ua/License_and_Accreditation

- Scientific cycle.

Doctor of philosophy is an academic, but at the same time, first scientific degree awarded at the third cycle of higher education based on master degree. Doctor of philosophy degree is awarded by special academic board of higher education institution or research institute in result of successful completion by doctorate student of relevant education and research program and public defense of thesis with the special academic board.

4.2 Future incentives for Cycle 3 at national level

- Did your government recently decide new policies for Cycle 3? If yes, what are the main reasons for this? And what are the main changes?

The government resolution No. 261 dated 23 March 2016 approved a new Procedure on study at doctor of philosophy or doctor of science levels that set up the main principles of study of higher education students at the third (research) and at the scientific cycle respectively in higher education and research institutions in Ukraine.

The study of doctorate students (postgraduates) in higher education institutions (research institutes), which was commenced before the Regulation on study at doctor of philosophy or doctor of science levels entered into force, shall be continued in accordance with the procedure set up by the resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 300 dated 01 March 1999.

In accordance with the new Regulation on doctoral studies for provision of educational services at the third (educational and scientific) cycle of higher education, higher education institutions (research institutes) are obliged to receive a special license.

In accordance with article 24 of the Law of Ukraine on Higher Education, and under the Law on Licensing of Several Types of Business Activities educational services in higher education are provided by higher education institutions and research institutes based on license issued by the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine. In order to receive the license, higher education institutions (research institutes) have to submit copies of constituent documents of legal entity; information about quantity and quality of their staff, material and technical resources for educational services; information about educational, methodological and informational resources; educational and scientific program and study plan, on the basis of which educational services will be provided.

In accordance with the new Regulation, starting from the academic year 2016

Study of doctors of philosophy proceeds:

- internally in full-time (day-time or evening-time study) or part-time forms;
- externally (by postgraduate students who professionally combine research and teaching activities at the primary place of work).

Study of doctors of philosophy is funded:

- at the cost of state budget (government contract);
- at the cost of individuals and legal entities (based on contracts, grants of higher education institutions (research institutes) for research received for study of doctors of philosophy).

Study of doctors of philosophy under government contract proceeds only internally in full-time (day-time or evening-time study) form. Study of doctors of philosophy in part-time form proceeds only under individual contracts.

- *Change of study time for postgraduate students*

The normative study time of doctors of philosophy is four years.

- *Supervision of postgraduate students*

Under resolution of academic board, doctor of philosophy can have two academic supervisors with appropriate sharing of study time and obligations (50 hours for two supervisors).

- *Enrolment examinations:*

Enrolment examinations for doctor of philosophy studies of higher education institution (research institute) include:

- enrolment examination in special subject (in accordance with master study program in special subject);
- enrolment examination in foreign language (upon choice of academic board of institution) at B2 level in accordance with Common European Framework of Reference for Languages;

Applicants who confirm language proficiency, especially in English, with an actual test certificate TOEFL, International English Language Testing System or Cambridge English Language Assessment, are excluded of the enrolment examination in foreign language.

- other forms of enrolment examinations (tests, interviews, presentations of research proposals or achievements as determined by academic board of the institution.

The enrolment rules of higher education institutions can be subject to change every year.

- *Education and research program*

Study of doctors of philosophy proceeds in accordance with education and research program and study plan to be approved by academic boards of institutions in each special subject.

Education and research program and study plan for doctors of philosophy include:

- education program consisting of a number and volume of disciplines, their sequence, forms and volumes of study sessions, study plan, forms of current and final control (30-60 ECTS);
- research program consisting of scientific fields of research for a thesis in a special subject.

The study plan of doctor of philosophy student must include list of disciplines upon choice of postgraduate student in a volume of at least 25 percent of total volume of ECTS credits. For this purpose postgraduate students are allowed to choose disciplines, which are offered at other cycles of higher education and related to the subject matter of a thesis, in agreement with their academic supervisors.

Studying of disciplines by postgraduate students is possible in their home higher education institution (research institute) where they are enrolled, and also within their right for academic mobility in other higher education institutions (research institutes).

Education and research program for doctors of philosophy in higher education institutions (research institutes) must include at least four integral parts, which ensure obtaining by doctor of philosophy of the following competences in accordance with the National Qualifications Framework:

- advanced knowledge in special subject, in particular knowledge of main concepts, understanding of theoretical and practical problems, history of development and actual situation with research in special subject, proficiency in terms of research field (at least 12 ECTS credits);
- general academic (philosophy) competences which are focused on forming of systemic research approach, professional ethics and general worldview (4-6 ECTS credits);
- universal research skills, in particular verbal and visual presentation of results of individual research in Ukrainian language, use of modern information and communication technologies in research, conducting of training events, management of research projects and applications for funding of research projects, registration of intellectual property rights (6 ECTS credits);
- language proficiency sufficient for presentation and discussion of research results in a foreign language (in English or other language according to special subject) in verbal and visual form, and for complete understanding of research texts in special subjects (6-8 ECTS credits).

Academic board of higher education institution (research institute) has the right to allow ECTS credits in one or several disciplines, which were obtained in other higher education institutions (research institutes).

- Is the development of Cycle 3 encouraged by other ways?

- Is there any gender balance at doctoral level and any regulation or mechanism to favour it?

Training of scientific-pedagogical staff, conducted in higher education institutions of Ukraine and the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine					
Years	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
Number of students (persons) who entered postgraduate study funded by state budget (total)	19307	17945	15894	15230	13132
Number of students (persons) who entered postgraduate study under contract (total)	3045	2015	2014	3534	3466
% of students who entered postgraduate study with a master degree at the same university	85	87	88	90	92
% of men who entered postgraduate study	40	33	31	34	32
% of women who entered postgraduate study	60	67	69	66	68

Number of persons who entered postgraduate courses of higher education institutions (total)	5700	4650	3835	3887	3000
Number of graduates who studied under the government contract (of all students)	4937	4819	4584	4908	4289
Number of graduates who received diplomas of Candidate of Science (PhD) (total number in Ukraine, persons)	7383	7654	7701	7009	6549
Male graduates (persons,%) in Ukraine	3088 (42 %)	3092 (40%)	3115 (41%)	2836 (41%)	2682 (41%)
Female graduates (persons,%) in Ukraine	4295 (58 %)	4562 (60%)	4586 (59 %)	4173 (59%)	3867 (59%)

- Are companies looking for Doctoral graduates? Do they consider Doctoral graduates as an added-value? Do doctoral graduates have advantages in terms of salary, responsibility...?

4.3 External quality assurance policy

In accordance with the Law of Ukraine on Higher Education, the system of external quality assurance of educational activity of higher education institutions and external quality assurance of higher education includes the following procedures and measures:

- support of efficient processes and procedures of internal quality assurance of educational activity of higher education institutions and internal quality assurance of higher education;
- maintenance of implementation system of procedures for external quality assurance;
- preparing and publishing of criteria for decision making in accordance with the standards and recommendations of quality assurance in the European Higher Education Area;
- establishing of available and transparent reporting system;
- conducting of regular revisions of system activities of quality assurance and implementation mechanisms of received recommendations;
- other procedures and actions.

The National Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (NAQAHE) is a permanent collective body, which is authorized by law to implement quality assurance policy in higher education.

Next fundamental pillar of external quality assurance policy in Ukraine is based on principles of academic integrity. Academic integrity means package of ethical principles and legal rules to be followed by all actors in education, teaching and research (arts) with the purpose to secure trust regarding learning outcomes and/or research (artistic) results. Compliance with academic integrity rules of teachers, researchers and pedagogical staff includes use of references to information sources in case of use of ideas, research results, statements and other information; compliance with the legal norms of copyrights and related rights; disclosure of reliable information about research methods and results, source of applicable

information and personal teaching (research, creative) activity ; control over compliance with academic integrity rules by students; objective evaluation of learning outcomes.

For infringement of academic integrity rules teachers, researchers and pedagogical staff may be hold liable as follows:

- refusal to award an academic degree or scientific rank;
- termination of awarded academic (artistic) degree or scientific rank.

In accordance with the resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 541 dated 19 July 2017 the Regulation on National Repository of Academic Papers was approved.

The National Repository is a countrywide structured digital data base, in which all academic texts will be collected, stored and systemized. The main purpose of the National Repository is support for educational, research, technical and innovation activities through open access to academic texts and facilitation of academic integrity.