



Co-funded by the
Erasmus+ Programme
of the European Union



БОЛОВСРОЛ,
СОЁЛ, ШИНЖЛЭХ УХААН,
СПОРТЫН ЯАМ



THE COUNTRY REPORT

submitted by

MECSS, MNCEA, NUM & OTIS

The European Commission's support for the production of this publication does not constitute an endorsement of the contents, which reflect the views only of the authors, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia

Revised in October, 2017



1.1 Brief presentation of the HE and research system

1.1.1 Brief information and statistics on the higher education in Mongolia

Mongolia is located in landlocked plateau of Central Asia between China and Russia, covering an area of 1,566,500 square km. Mongolia has population of 3 millions people. Population consists of 24 different ethnic groups both Mongol and Turkic origin. 86% of which is Halha Mongols, 6% Kazakh (Muslims) and rest are others.

Over the last two decades as Mongolia progressed from a command to a market economy, and experienced rapid growth in the higher education subsector, higher education has fallen behind in its mission of delivering high-quality and relevant education. For the last two decades major changes have been registered in the higher education system of Mongolia such as revision of the approaches to governance of HEIs, move to delivery of a three-tier education of BA, MA and PhD, integration of a credit system, introduction of quality assurance, to name but a few. However, the Mongolian higher education still faces a number of challenges, including: low quality and relevance of higher education; weak quality assurance; low staff quality; inadequate learning and research environment; ineffective governance and management; lack of HEIs' autonomy and weak leadership; inadequate financing; and lack of equity and access. (Regsuren, 2014)

According to the statistic (2016-2017), 95 higher education institutions are operated now. Out of them, 17 are public universities and 74 private HEIs as well as 4 branches of foreign university are functioning in this academic year.

According to the UNECSO (2014) Mongolian school-age population in higher education institutions are only 284,541 in 2,796,000 of population. It means, nowadays, 95 higher education institutions are working for only 284,541 students. Thus, the quality of higher education has become the burning issue in our society.

<i>Indicators</i>	<i>Number of higher education institution</i>	<i>Total students</i>	<i>Undergraduate students</i>	<i>Graduate students</i>	<i>Doctoral students</i>
Total	95	157,138	35,429	20,066	3,849
State	17	91,798	19,764		
Private	74	65,075	15,552		
Branch of foreign universities	4	265	113		

According to the Article 15 of Law on Education, main classifications of the higher education institutions are: university, institute and college. In accordance with the Article 4.2 of the Law on Higher Education, the university is entitled to conduct bachelor, master and doctorate programs or conduct solely master and doctorate programs on the basis of the integration of research – industry included the research-based laboratories.

In accordance with the A/78 Order of the Minister of Education, Culture and Science dated in 2014, the ministry revised and approved the professional disciplines and index pursuant to the ISCED UNESCO and accordingly, it approved the common requirements applied for Bachelor's degree program according to A/170 Order of the Minister of Education, Culture and Science, and for Master's & Doctoral degree programs according to A/370 Order of the Minister of Education, Culture and Science. In accordance with above orders and official decisions, the Mongolian HEIs are conducting 180 programs in Bachelor degree, 416 programs in Master's degree and 257 programs in PhD degree in 10 common categories, 27 sub categories and 82 descriptions (UNESCO, 2011). This reform helped us to decrease overlapped disciplines and mis-description and index that covered over former 800 professions.



In accordance with the respective laws, undergraduate students must learn not less than 120 credits for 4 years, graduate students must learn not less than 30 credits and doctoral students must learn not less than 60 credits.

It specified that basic professional classes must be 12 credit hours, qualifying classes must be 18 credit hours and research and theoretical seminars must be 6 credit hours under supervision of the academic advisors. The diploma thesis must be 24 credit hours.

Undergraduate students must learn 3 credits for research methodology and students, who passed certain requirements, can conduct research work and if they want, they can learn some of Master's degree courses.

The ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sports is just preparing to establish co-working group with the ministry of Labour and Social Welfare to develop National qualification framework.

The NQF and the regulation of evaluation and calculate credit system are being drafted. The faculty development and curriculum review and teaching and learning consultants have proposed novel practice of teaching and learning in HEIs and developed deliverables in the curriculum development. So, we are preparing to approve NQF.

1.1.2 The governmental supports forward to the research and research-based universities

- Statistics on research funded projects and type of owner

The Higher Education Reform Project (Loan 2766-MON), implemented by the Ministry of Education, Culture, Science and Sports (MECSS) and financed by Asian Development Bank (ADB), aims to deliver outputs on improving (i) quality and relevance of higher education programs; (ii) effectiveness of higher education management, financing, and governance; and (iii) equity and access to higher education. The project impact will be increased number of globally competitive higher education graduates that are adequately skilled to the needs of the labor market. The project outcome will be an improved, well-managed, and equitable higher education system.

MECCS and Project Implementation Unit organized discussion sessions on the guideline for the competitive grants to support University–Industry Partnership development and approved the guideline by the Ministerial order A/50 dated 19 February 2016.

MECCS/PIU received total of 63 proposals. As a result of the multi-stakeholder meeting, 16 proposals for Grants and sum of MNT515,000,000.00 awards were selected. The selection report was submitted to ADB for endorsement on 21 July 2016. ADB endorsed 13 grants and declined 3 grants proposals for respective valid reasons. The 13 grants for Partnership Development of the Higher Education Institution and Industry were approved by the Order A/26 dated 09 September 2016. The contract for MNT 485,000,000.00 was signed with the grant recipients on the 21 September 2016. The grant projects will strengthen the Higher Education Institution and Industry partnership, build capacity of the students, lecturers and industries; propose and implement new or novel solutions for the challenges met in the industrial research and experimental development; introduce new student internship. In total 32 new student internships will be conducted; 23 research articles will be published; 16 monographs manuals and one research report will be published; 1 standard; 1 guideline; 4 utility models; 2 patents will be filed. In total 16 product prototypes; 1 license agreement will be signed; 7 technologies will be developed and 1 start-up company will be formed as a result of the partnership grants.

1.2 Overview of the national legal framework and regulations governing quality assurance (QA) of Cycle 3

In accordance 4.2 Provision of the Procedure approved by with the Order of the Minister of Education, Culture and Science of Mongolia dated on 26th January, 2010, the university is allowed to conduct Ph.D. degree programs in not less than 3 disciplines. It is required to have a unit in charge of



the PhD degree programs and classes pertaining to the doctoral programs must be conducted by the Ph.D. degree faculty members.

“General procedure for conducting the Master and PhD degree programs” was approved by the A/370 Order of the Minister of Education and Science in 2014. This procedure specified generic requirements, orientation, curriculums, modules, structure, criteria for admission and faculty, intended learning outcome, assessment, quality assurance and implementation pertaining to the PhD program. For instance: in the 2.3.3 provision of this procedure, it specified that basic professional classes must be 12 credit hours, qualifying classes must be 18 credit hours and research and theoretical seminars must be 6 credit hours under supervision of the academic advisors. The diploma thesis must be 24 credit hours. In accordance with 2.3.8 of this procedure, the PhD candidate students are required to compile results of the research works, write diploma thesis and accordingly, defend it at the “Defense Council for PhD Diploma Thesis”. Upon studied credit hours of Ph.D. classes, they doctoral students must take the final exams before starting the diploma thesis. As specified in 2.3.4 of the procedure, the PhD degree program’s curriculum should be developed by the respective committee and approved by the administration of the given university on the basis on the state central administration body in charge of education affairs. Pursuant to the provision of 2.5.6 of this procedure, the issues regarding developing, approving and making changes in main disciplines of the doctoral research, quality assessment and curriculum should be regulated by the academic procedure of the given university. In 2.5.8 of the procedure, it specified that the requirements and forms for content and structure of the PhD degree thesis can be approved by the university.

In accordance with the amendments made into the Education Law of Mongolia on 14th April, 2016, it specified that the university is entitled to conduct Master and PhD degree programs and can be higher education institution that integrated research - and - academia - industry equipped with required laboratories. Otherwise, it can carry out Master and PhD degree programs alone.

1.3 Strategies and incentives for Cycle 3 at national level

The amendment law on higher education along with law on education was ratified by the plenary sessions of the Parliament of Mongolia on 14 April 2016. The major amendment is to strengthen HEI autonomy and accountability. Some amendments in the law are: the representation in the Board of Trustee for the public HEIs were clearly outlined (representation percentage of the owners, independent members, faculty members, students, graduates for public and non-public HEIs), the follow up actions and responsibilities of the HEI that ceased its operation. HEI can establish Higher education development foundations for research training purposes as well as other purposes upon the endorsement of the Board of Trustee.

1.4 Impact of European Principles, Standards and Guidelines at national level

MNCEA has been studying the Bologna principles and ESG as well as Salzburg principles when it upgraded the criteria and procedure for institutional and program accreditation. Since Mongolia joined in the C3QA project, MNCEA translated the Salzburg principles into Mongolian as well as translated the ESG into Mongolian. Respectively, the MNCEA is aiming to acclimate the benchmarks and good practices that have been arisen from the ESG for fostering the effective internal quality assurance mechanisms in Mongolian higher education institutions.

1.5 Financial conditions

Currently, there aren’t any financial incentives to develop p Cycle 3. Although, “The regulation of research grant for students, studying in master and doctor level” in 2016 by order number A/658 it has never been implemented.

2.1 Main characteristics of Cycle 3 programs



In accordance 4.2 Provision of the Procedure approved by with the Order of the Minister of Education, Culture and Science of Mongolia dated on 26th January, 2010, the university is allowed to conduct Ph.D. degree programs in not less than 3 disciplines. It is required to have a unit in charge of the PhD degree programs and classes pertaining to the doctoral programs must be conducted by the Ph.D. degree faculty members.

“General procedure for conducting the Master and PhD degree programs” , which was approved by the A/370 Order of the Minister of Education and Science in 2014, specified generic requirements, orientation, curriculums, modules, structure, criteria for admission and faculty, intended learning outcome, assessment, quality assurance and implementation pertaining to the PhD program.

Before 1990s or during socialist system, Cycle 3 program in National University of Mongolia (NUM) was the same as that of in former Soviet Union. NUM started transferring to credit system in the mid of 1990s. Finally, from the academic year of 1997 and 1998, NUM changed the education system to bachelor, master and doctor level.

Before 1997, there were many limitations for those who wish to study in doctoral program. For instance they work in universities or research institutes at least 8 year successfully. And vacancy for Doctoral study with fixed research theme was informed in public. After that the applicant should compete on that vacancy. The entrance examination included very hard exam on Communist party history and Marxism.

Since 1997, there were many revisions for doctoral study regulations and curriculum according to need of students and requests from the Ministry of Education. Last revision was made in 2015.

Otgontenger University (OU) has started to run Doctoral Program in Law since 1999 and in Education since 2010 respectively. OTU develops the curricula based on common requirement for Higher Education Curricula at national level, school academic council makes a decision to improve and renew the curricula in specialized dissemination, and educational operation is conducted by graduate academic affairs. However currently OTU hasn't adopted the credit system yet, preparation of this work finished and Management Information System developed fully as well as it is being tested. We are willing to introduce the credit system fully in 2017-2018 academic year.

Graduate degree training activities are run in accordance with Training regulations of Otgontenger University. However the National Dissertation Defense Committee conducts the dissertation defense activity. National Dissertation Defense Committee has own regulation. In these days, Mongolian universities conduct doctoral studies in accordance with the “Regulations of Graduate Study” which is implemented and approved by MECSS.¹ According to this regulation each university's academic council approve their regulation of study. According to this regulation, partner universities of the project have developed and implemented the study plan as follows. General curriculum for doctoral program was shown in the next table.

<i>Curriculum component</i>	<i>Credit hours for Doctoral program NUM</i>	<i>Credit hours for Doctoral program OTU</i>
Professional courses	8-9 credit hours	12
Special courses	14-15 credit hours, here 6 credit hours should be taken from different departments or research institutes, universities	18 credit hours, here 6 credit hours should be taken from different departments or research institutes, universities
Research work	12 credit hours, here 2-3 credit hours should be taken by working as a of advising professor. At least 3 credit hours should be taken by attending as an assistant researcher in the research project.	6 credit hours
Thesis	24 credit hours	24 credit hours

¹ approved in 2014.



Here, 1 credit hour is equivalent to 1.8 ECTS credit hours.

2.2 Characteristics of the Cycle 3 study:

The selection of the candidates at Higher Education Institutions in Mongolia including NUM and OTU is open for all who has master degree. Every HEIs require candidates to take an entrance exam. Enrollment of researchers working at the research institutes or young lecturers at universities is common. For those who has no job and enrolled to doctoral program it is hard to find scholarship. In some cases, supervisor who has research grants gives scholarship to his/her doctorate students.

During the doctoral study if a doctorate student got the required credit hours except the thesis, one can get a certificate of fulfillment of the program. One can defend her/his thesis within 5 years after getting the certificate.

The thesis should be written according the specific requirement before the Counsel Meeting. The thesis defense at the Defense committee Meeting is essential. Curriculum for doctoral program at HEU is planned for 3-4 years. In practice, it prolongs more years depending on research results of the doctorate students.

Procedures:

- Enrolment – register the recruits, take test from recruits, issue an order for recruits,
- Training – general knowledge courses including research methods, research methods in social and law field, to possess a methodology of writing thesis, foreign language,
- Training – Component of common professional courses
- Training – Specialized courses
- To plan the research work in according to the graphic
- To bring up for discussion about the research work at seminars, national and international level conferences and seminars, and to publish the articles on professional journal
- To finalize the thesis, to give professors for editing and review, and to propound the dissertation in related department and team of professors,
- To take a preliminary defense and final defense respectively for defend the thesis.
- To grant the doctor degree in according to the resolution of National Dissertation Defense Committee, to grant the diploma in according to the order of rector of University,
- There is no common rules and regulations for doctoral research work.

Status, competencies and role of the supervisor

Supervisors, head and members of defense committee must have academic degree as well as according to the common rules of MECSS, supervisor of the thesis should have published at least one article related his/her field in the last three years. In addition, University determines the related requirements for the supervisor of the thesis. According to the approved common regulation Ph.D. supervisor should have Ph.D. degree, has been involved in scientific and research organization in the past three years, is recognized as an active researcher who has published at least one article in the professional journals which has SCI and Scopes indices and internationally and domestically acclaimed journal.² A regulation ‘student can offer his/her Ph.D. supervisor’ is in Regulation of Graduate Study of OU. Even though, the supervisor should be approved by the order of the head of faculty. There is no limitation in the number of doctorate students for one supervisor.

Description of the thesis defense mechanisms and regulations (including criteria for the award of doctoral degrees)

²2.8.3 болон 2.8.4



There are only one Defense committee in each specific field in Mongolia. After completing Doctoral program at the universities including NUM and OTU the doctorate student should send all required documents and application to the Defense committee for the Thesis Defense. The secretary of the Defense committee checks the documents and inform to Head of the Counsel. Head and Vice Head, and the secretary of the Defense committee discuss about whether the applicant fulfilled the requirements of the defense and make decision on if whether the student can pass the defense at the final Counsel meeting. If the decision is positive, they fix the Meeting date of the Defense committee. They also make decision on extending members of the Counsel. Before the meeting copies of the thesis should be distributed to all members of the committee. By the recommendation of the head of committee 2 or 4 members of the committee will make review of the thesis. The meeting of the Counsel will be held by fixed agenda. After presenting the ideas and results of the thesis by student, decision will be made by ballot. If more than 75% of members voted for the thesis, the student will be awarded the PhD title.

Before his/her defense of the thesis, candidate should make to submit certain set of documents, academic units of credits, and acceptance of supervisor and university. Secretary of Defense Committee handles these matters.

Defense Committee is appointed for 3 years in accordance with order of MECSS minister. Although number and profession of defense committee members can different, commonly there are 6-15 members. The Education and Psychology defense committee have 15 members including chairman, deputy chair and secretary. If supervisor of thesis is in the committee, he/she cannot vote. The defense is posted as a public hearing 14 days prior to the final defense and copy of thesis will be given to interested parties in the university library. However there is not any ceremony for Final Defense procedure, there is ceremonial event and costume for the granting diploma. After the defense meeting, the doctorate students have a time to revise his thesis according to comments of members of Counsel. After revision, thesis should be finalized aligning with the manual for thesis deliver in HEI. Thesis should be delivered to the Main library of Mongolia, Library of Information and Technology and to the Library of HEI. After this, according to decree of the Director of HEI the certificate of PhD degree will be printed out and sent to doctorate student.

The Ministry of Education approves members of the Defense committee. There are 9-13 permanent members in each Counsel. The Counsel can be extended by other researchers and professors according to thesis theme.

Diversification of Doctoral studies (Are there procedures to validate a “Doctorate at work” Are there definitions of specific skills for a doctorate?)

The requirement of enrollment in accordance with in section 2.7 of Regulation of Graduate Study, including,

- To have master’s degree
- If a student’s previous background is in a different field of study, he/she need to study some preparatory courses and after that can continue the program.
- Foreign student should have required Mongolian language. (If intergovernmental agreement is agreed upon)
- Professional specific requirements could be specifically approved by the university

- should have diploma median grade at least over 2.75 (68%).
- should have over 8 years of training and research experience in university or research organizations through the forms of Doctoral study which are day, corresponde, and external forms,

- should have published over 15 academic articles. If some articles which wouldn’t involved in a dissertation can be calculated as a set unit of professional and specialty courses,
- should have the content has been created to provide 75% of the doctoral dissertation
- if want to study with external form, university academic council will value the research content,



quality, and result, then calculate the set of unit by recruits research works, and finally decide whether he/she will study

Internationalization of Doctoral studies

In Mongolia, there is no specified regulation for foreign students of doctoral training in Mongolian universities. According to the regulations of the MECSS, “Foreign students should have required Mongolian Language knowledge. (If there is intergovernmental agreement, it will be taken into consideration)”

- According to the “Regulation of Graduate Study” of OU, there can be 1:1 joint program with foreign university, postdoctorate training, research student exchange program, and refresher course for OTU graduates. Developing program, defining the course content, selecting students, and providing study condition will be regulated by special regulation.³
- There is a provision that foreign student will study in accordance with universities joint agreement or personal agreement.

OTU pays more attention on involving foreign students in doctoral study and is developing a regulation for foreign students.

Authentication procedures of the Degree and if applicable recognition mechanisms outside the country.

Doctoral course will be accredited domestically. Currently, there isn't any accredited doctoral course.

2.3 Positioning of Cycle 3

- Doctoral school? Research entity in relation with the doctoral student?

NUM (National university of Mongolia) run the doctoral courses through its Graduate school within the higher education. In Mongolia, there is no special and independent structure for Graduate Study, the doctoral course is run as a part of the university.

In OU, graduate courses are run as a form of academic affair.

- Are Doctoral research subjects chosen in partnership with research units and in line with the scientific local, regional and national environment?

According to the regulation of MECSS and OTU, Ph.D. dissertation discusses the objectives of the relevant field of expertise, or the scientifically- oriented (methodical or methodological basis) of country's socio-economic affairs, comparisons with other previous solutions, and creatively innovative aspects of the subject matter and need to be a subject of scientific research that provides new knowledge, rationale, and practical conclusions on the topic

Ph.D. student can choose his /her thesis topic, then department discusses, gives advises and approves the theme. The most Ph.D. students choose the thesis which is related to the unsolved issues in their field.

- Beyond research unities are there operational interactions with the industry sector and/or national, regional or local authorities?

Very few cases for research unities have operational interactions with the industrial sectors. But it is common that workers from state, regional or local organizations are attending in a PhD courses while they are working. In that case students relate their research topics with their organizations activities or goals. By this way there are many interactions with above mentioned bodies.

- What is the ratio of Doctoral workers in the private sector?

According to the data of 2016, in Mongolia, 137 doctoral students graduated successfully and its 87 were female students. Even though, employment surveys of Ph.D. is not officially published. There is a survey that 100% of graduates of OTU are employed in the private sector.

³3.7.9 ба 3.7.10



- *Is there any regulation that favors the employment of Doctoral workers?*

Some organizations give the paid leave for PhD students in relation with thesis defense. After Ph.D. student got the doctoral degree, salary is increased by 15% in according to the National Labor Law.

- *Are there any contribution from the private sector the doctoral curriculum? or to its financing ? of regulation ?*

Currently there is no evidence of support from private sectors is available.

2.4 Follow-up of Doctoral Students and graduates -

Does the university follow up Doctoral students?

“Common regulation of graduate study approved by second appendix of A/370 order about amending the rules, approving regulation, index, and dissemination of Master and Doctoral degree” is followed at national level. There is not certain common criteria. Each school develops and implements their own criteria within the domestic educational operation.

1. Impact Assessment (graduate employment)
2. Quality Assessment (training as analytics)

Ph.D. alumni participated as a part of Alumni Association. Also, they are invited as a teacher for teaching in master and doctoral course, involved in research work and projects, and joined on creature etc.

- *Are there trainings provided to Doctoral students? Are they compulsory to validate a doctorate?*

Doctoral study curricula has 60 units of credit includes 12 units of professional course, 18 units of specialized course, 6 units of scholarly work, and 24 units of dissertation. 12 units of professional course is compulsory course in OTU.

- *Is there a document, a “thesis charter” specifying the mutual commitments between Doctoral students and thesis supervisors?*

There is a scholarly writing standard which relates to the dissertation. Some Defense committees provide the guidance of writing design and formation. According to Regulation of Graduate Study of OTU, Ph.D. thesis must be focused on one topic, decide the objective in his/her field or decide with scientific reason (or find the method) the practical problem related with country interests, economy situation, compare to the prior solution, introduce the new part of issue, and draw a conclusion of new knowledge or information, basis, theory, and practical finding. From this year, OTU developed the academic research paper standard and it is reflected in the doctoral research paper requirement.

Ph.D. dissertation

	Standard	Content
1	Definition	An independent research work, which has contributed to the development of new knowledge in the industry, developed with all the aspects, and has been raised in the field of scientific practice.
2	Main requirement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To complete the research work according to the work plan • To involve the problem of the subject and formulate rationally • Content should be interconnected logically • To develop with advanced process and keep with scientific norm of stylistics • Do not have copyright infringement • Evaluate the findings and conclusions from each side of the study • At least 2 articles of research results should be published



		in foreign and domestic research journals
3	Structure HCERES	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Introduction • Overview of the study • Research methodology • Survey data processing analysis • Conclusions • List of sources • Appendix
4	Writing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Should follow the OTU standard • Summary should be summarized in 3 pages and translated into English or Russian • Should be over 100 pages
5	Discussion Defense	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Supervisor's discussion • Department discussion • Ph.D. Defense committee's Defense
6	Evaluation	Ph.D. defense committee's secret poll / Form CCAC-08/
7	Writing of page layout	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • OTU name and logo • Candidate's first name and last name • Dissertation topic • Major index and name • Degree of thesis • City name
8	Home page	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • OTU name and logo • Candidate's first name and last name • Dissertation topic • Major index and name • Degree of thesis • Supervisor's first name and last name and academic degree and title • After defense, the names, academic degrees, titles and signatures of chair of defense committee, secretary, and members • City name, date

- Are there rules of conduct for doctorate within universities? Are they written? How are they applied? Has the university set up methods against plagiarism? Which tools (software against plagiarism) are used?

The rules conducting doctorate program is in the "Academic and Education rule at NUM" which also conducting Bachelor and Master program. Also there is a regulation for "Assigning and accepting research credit hours for master and doctorate students" at NUM. NUM has so called "A code of ethics" which regulates plagiarism and other ethics related matters.

OTU has student's common code of conduct and ethics and it includes about ethical issues of writing research work and intellectual property rights.

- Are plans set up by the institution to prevent and reduce situations that may lead to dropouts, for example follow-up committees for thesis, defense in the course of a thesis, tutor or referent, mediator in case of conflict, etc.?

NUM has no follow up committee but departments have responsibilities to regulate and follow up PhD and other level students.

However, there is no follow-up committee, OTU has formal committee for ethics and it has



the right to make a decision on the subject matter.

- *Does the institution provide its Doctoral students with theoretical and practical trainings in order to integrate into society at a level corresponding to his/her qualification, in the private or academic sector?*

Ph.D. students study and do research in other department or research institutions for specialized course's 6 units of credit. This can make them to work more close to the society.

- *How many Doctoral receive a scholarship/financing to write their thesis? Where do scholarships/financing come from?*

OTU lecturers receive scholarships for their writing a thesis and it is regulated by OTU regulation.

- *Are there theses financed by private or public firms, or by State bodies, on subjects specified by the financing bodies?*

Currently there is no student from private sector while there is number of students from secondary schools and kindergarten.

- *What is the percentage of students finding a job immediately after their thesis? Six months after? A year after? Later?*

Mainly PhD student has a job before the enrolment. They continue to work the same place after their defense. It's common in Mongolia that students doing PhD while working. Many of such students continue to work at their work places.

- *Are there Alumni associations? Are they highly active?*

There are Alumni association in many programs and their activity varies depending on the program at NUM.

OTU has united structure of Alumni Association includes doctorate graduates. There is no separate Doctorate graduate Alumni Association.

Chapter 3: Internal quality assurance mechanisms

- *Describe the mechanisms, by providing your definition of IQA mechanisms*

OTU has Internal Monitoring and evaluation Office and it is responsible for Graduate study, too. Attestation regulation, approved in 2012, developed with 5 set and 51 criteria for evaluating the teachers' activity. The committee of Graduate study works on the training and pedagogical issue. Academic affairs do analysis on program and curricula delivery and evaluate the quality. Students' grade is analyzed through the teaching classes of lecturers and lecturers are assessed by observing. Each academic year student admission is updated in accordance with ministry rule. Information of Cycle 3 program is publicized in university website and mass media. "Regulation of Graduate Study" of OTU is updated to adjust to the common requirements of graduate study - A/370

In regard of ESG

Standard: 1.1

Institutions should have a policy for quality assurance that is made public and forms part of their strategic management. Internal stakeholders should develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes, while involving external stakeholders.

"Academic and Education rule at NUM", "Assigning and accepting research credit hours for master and doctorate students" and "A code of ethics of NUM" are main regulations which assure quality at NUM. These regulations are placed in the web site of the University and available publicly.

Currently, OTU is developing a quality management policy at all levels of the university. In addition, the program committee has a major role in ensuring the internal quality of the doctoral training and this committee involved the employer and the industry leader.

Standard: 1.2

Institutions should have processes for the design and approval of their programmes. The programmes should be designed so that they meet the objectives set for them, including the intended learning



outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme should be clearly specified and communicated, and refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.

The case of NUM. Department curriculum committee design first draft of PhD or any other level programs. Faculty curriculum committee reviews the program and submits to the University curriculum committee for approval. In recent times, University pays much attention on the implementation of the programs in order to improve quality of programs and 100 percent fulfillment of the programs.

OTU doctoral programs are defining the goals as required by the MECSS and the purpose of each of subjects is within the framework of main objective.

Standard:1.3

Institutions should ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach.

In NUM there is also a teacher training center, which organizes various trainings for development of lecturers and professors teaching skills.

The Program Committees of OTU are responsible for the programs and lecturers' teaching method and academic affair and attestation committee are working for continuous improvement. Even so there is a problem "no student centered but traditional" is common during the training.

Standard:1.4

Institutions should consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student "life cycle", e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification.

OTU approves and follows the admission policy, regulation, and study regulation. Fatherly, OTU need to develop the requirements and specific provisions for applicants. There is safeguard board is at the national level, university attendance is relatively small in ensuring the learning process.

All processes related to the phases of the student life cycle are regulated by the "Academic and Education rule at NUM".

Standard:1.6

Institutions should have appropriate funding for learning and teaching activities and ensure that adequate and readily accessible learning resources and student support are provided

Universities are trying to create appropriate funding to support teaching activities. The creation and accessibility of learning resources are improving by years in NUM and OTU. For example a new library building of NUM is just opened and serves for students.

The 38.5 percentage of total enrollment of OTU are for Ph.D. program and it doesn't provide enough funding for program. This issue is reflected in OTU strategic plan and it needed to be improved.

Standard:1.7

Institutions should ensure that they collect, analyse and use relevant information for the effective management of their programmes and other activities.

However, the institutions analyze their graduate's employment, graduates' career path, needs to have high attention. In addition, HEIs need to pay attention on the dropout or taking excused absence for writing dissertation due to the time limit and study the reason for high rate on this.

Standard:1.8

Institutions should publish information about their activities, including programmes, which is clear, accurate, objective, up-to date and readily accessible

Both universities NUM and OTU provide information on their Ph.D. program to all stakeholders in an open manner and on its website. Program's events or activities are presented by mass media and social sites. Students can also get information through the electronic data through their base code.



Standard:1.9

Institutions should monitor and periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. These reviews should lead to continuous improvement of the programme. Any action planned or taken as a result should be communicated to all those concerned.

At NUM, at the end of each semester students fill satisfaction survey for each subjects they studied. During the surveys students assess the quality of teacher, lesson and learning environment. Moreover curriculum committees of Departments, Faculties and University have to review programs periodically (3 years) and monitor every day.

For OU, this activity is responsible for program for student's satisfaction survey, employer request and demand, and program's committee that involves lecturers and school representatives. There is a priority issue that small number of enrollments and the lack of sufficient financial support for the program.

Standard:1.10

Institutions should undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis.

At the national level, Higher Education organizations need to ensure that the external quality of the program will be validated.

The National accreditation counsel is responsible for external level quality assurance in national level. But very few programs of Master and PhD levels are accredited in national level. Moreover several universities including NUM and OTU are beginning to initiate the accreditation by international accreditation organizations but only in undergraduate levels. We hope there will be also movement of international accreditation in Master and PhD level.

2.1.2 External QA (mechanisms outside the HEI)

The Mongolian Law of Higher Education identifies the National Council for Education Accreditation as the main entity for quality assurance. Thus, MNCEA is mandated to function as the key body for quality assurance in higher education.

In connection with the expansion of the roles and responsibilities of institutional and program accreditation from 1998 to 2014, MNCEA sets its mission as 'to improve education quality, ensure national standards of academic programs, and strengthen the value and visibility of the Mongolian higher education system at the international level'. NCEA should fulfill its mission through the following objectives: (i) enhancing the quality of educational provisions of the Mongolian tertiary education system through its regular inquiries into the system's needs; (ii) conducting official recognition of HEIs and programs through periodic accreditation; (iii) ensuring national coordination of quality assurance bodies – both national and international; and (iv) promoting international visibility of the Mongolian tertiary education.

The Mongolian National Council for Education Accreditation was founded in 1998 and it is sole body for institutional and program accreditation. It has been implementing institutional accreditation since 1998 and started the program accreditation since 2005. In accordance with the amendments into Law on Education and Law on Higher Education, it is entitled to conduct initial accreditation for ex-ante program. Nowadays, MNCEA has revised the accreditation criteria and is starting the pilot accreditation in associated with the ASIIN e.V.

In accordance with the amendments to the Education Law, the university has to submit its request to the Mongolian National Council for Education Accreditation for initial accreditation. For this reason, the university has to prepare and send the self assessment report and on the basis of the self assessment report, the national council makes a conclusion for a permission that enables the given HEI to start the new program. There are no specific criteria and procedure for initial accreditation in Master and PhD degree programs. However, the national council is adhering to the "General procedure for conducting the Master and PhD degree programs" approved by the A/370 Order of the Minister of Education and Science in 2014.



There have not been approved specific criteria for Master and PhD degree programs. All kinds of academic programs should go through the generic criteria for the program accreditation. As of today, the MNCEA has accredited only one PhD program (accredited in 2014).

Academic provisions of Master and PhD degree programs have been briefly specified in the criteria for institutional accreditation that was approved in 2014. In the institutional accreditation criteria, it is specified as HEIs should conduct academic teaching & learning for Master and PhD degree in regard of priority disciplines of the economics, facing challenges and development perspectives of further significant sectors. (Percentage of Master & PhD degree programs, internal and external quality assurance and accreditation status) HEIs are developing the self assessment reports in accordance with the above mentioned criteria.



Chapter 4 – Good practice examples (2-4 pp)

In case of EQA

Regarding to amendments to the Law on education, the MNCEA has revised its policy, procedure and criteria as well as it extended its structure.

The Twinning Program is being implemented with an aim to enable a coherent and sustainable capacity building of Mongolian National Council for Education Accreditation (MNCEA) through long term partnership and knowledge exchange between ASIIN and MNCEA. It included conducting workshops on new standards and procedures, commencing internal quality assurance, and completion of pilot accreditation at selected 6 HEIs. In accordance with approved work plan the following activities were performed. Such as Guidelines for institutional accreditation, program accreditation, and initial accreditation, workshops and trainings on new standards and procedures at NCEA, and the workshops and trainings on Internal Quality Assurance (IQA) at higher education institutions. Developed requirements and criteria, operation manuals with implementation recommendations based on comparative studies conducted by ASIIN on institutional accreditation, program accreditation, and initial accreditation. These renewed requirements and criteria are used. Templates on institutional, program and initial accreditation developed by ASIIN are received by NCEA in June 2017. Preparations for conducting Pilot accreditation at selected HEIs are in progress now.

In case of HEIs

While 18% of total HEIs were universities in 2013, 32% or 31 of total HEIs moved up to the status of university in 2017. Specially, 3 universities were opened in new and 11 HEIs extended to the university. While a number of doctoral students was 2599 (0.02% of total students) in 2013, this statistics increased to 3849 (0.03% of total students) in 2017.

Structural and organizational reforms

Within the reform policy that initiated in the higher education sector starting 2012, most of HEIs formulated the missions to transform from the teaching – based university to research – based university in their strategic plans and are upgrading their policies for graduate and postgraduate courses in connection with the development policy of labor market and socio-economic strategies. In 2014, National University of Mongolia, Mongolian University of Science & Technology and Mongolian University of Life Sciences founded graduate schools as independent and affiliated branch school. These graduate schools are creating preliminary conditions for providing sufficient structure and organizations for enhancing the quality of graduate courses, encouraging partnership between HEIs and industry, supporting growth the number of doctoral students.

Upgrading the programs

In accordance with the “General procedure for conducting the Master and PhD degree programs” approved by the A/370 Order of the Minister of Education and Science in 2014, all of universities have been updating the PhD degree programs according to national and international perspectives during 2 – 3 years.

For instance: the National University of Medical Science upgraded 256 modules and respective curriculums and is realizing when it developed 8 doctoral programs in 2016. Establishments of core laboratory of the National University of Medical Science, Uujin med and pharmaceutical factory is effecting improvements and achievement arisen in the research and scientific works of the university.

Quality assurance

The Mongolian National Council for Education Accreditation has been carrying out the program accreditation since 2004. All kinds of academic programs are accredited according to generic criteria for program accreditation on voluntary basis. There are no specific accreditation criteria



for doctoral program. In addition, there are supplementary supports and allowances for the doctoral degree programs if accredited.

The PhD program on “Business Administration” offered by the School of Business Administration & Humanities was accredited by the Mongolian National Council for Education Accreditation in 2014 and all of other programs were accredited by the ACBSP in 2012.

In recent years, HEIs are striving to foster the internal quality assurance mechanisms and improving the academic programs.