



International evaluation and accreditation

## EVALUATION REPORT

**Kyiv National University of Trade and Economics  
(KNUTE), Ukraine**

**Economics PhD Programme**

**June 2019**



Within the framework of the Erasmus+ programme "Promoting internationalization of research through establishment and operationalization of Cycle 3 Quality Assurance System in line with the European Integration Agenda" (C3QA), Kyiv National University of Trade and Economics (KNUTE), Ukraine, has mandated Hcéres to perform its Economics PhD Programme evaluation. The evaluation is based on the "External Evaluation Standards for doctorates out of France", adopted by the Hcéres Board on March 26, 2018. These standards are available on the Hcéres website ([hceres.fr](http://hceres.fr)).

**For the Hcéres<sup>1</sup> :**

Michel Cosnard, President

**On behalf of the experts committee<sup>2</sup> :**

Gilles Jacoud, President of the committee

In accordance with the decree n°2014-1365, November 14th, 2014:

<sup>1</sup> The president of Hcéres "contresigne les rapports d'évaluation établis par les comités d'experts et signés par leur président." (Article 8, alinéa 5) – "countersigns the assessment reports made by the experts' committees and signed by their president" (article 8, alinea 5)

<sup>2</sup> The evaluation reports "sont signés par le président du comité". (Article 11, alinea 2) – "are signed by the president of the committee" (article 11, alinea 2)

# CONTENTS

## I. National context and Institution identity sheet

General context and Higher education.....	3
Institution.....	6
Methods and results of the previous accreditation(s).....	7
Student population: evolution and typology over the last 4 years.....	7

## II. Evaluation procedure

History of the request for evaluation and accreditation.....	7
Composition of the committee.....	7
On site visit description.....	8

## III. Presentation of the programme

1 – Presentation of the study programme.....	9
2 - Presentation of the programme's self-evaluation approach.....	10

## IV. Evaluation report

AREA 1 – THE POSITIONING OF THE DOCTORATE.....	11
Area 1-1: The doctorate's distinct features and objectives are clearly defined.....	11
Area 1-2: The positioning of the doctorate is consistent with its environment.....	12
AREA 2 – ORGANIZATION AND MANAGEMENT OF THE DOCTORATE.....	13
Area 2-1: Effective organization and management is in place for the doctorate.....	13
Area 2-2: There is an explicit policy for recruiting and funding doctoral students, which is adapted to the PhD programme.....	14
AREA 3 – SUPERVISION AND TRAINING FOR DOCTORAL STUDENTS.....	15
Area 3-1: The doctorate applies a strict doctoral student supervision and follow-up policy.....	15
Area 3-2: The doctorate offers diverse teaching and organizes supplementary events.....	16
Area 3-3: The doctorate is based on explicit rules for thesis duration and defense.....	16
AREA 4 – INTEGRATION OF DOCTORS INTO THE JOB MARKET.....	17
Area 4-1: The doctorate includes mechanisms to promote the integration of doctors into the job market.....	17
Area 4-2: The doctorate has effective monitoring of the integration of doctors into the job market.....	17
Area 4-3: The data collected is analyzed, communicated and used.....	18

## V. Conclusion

Past achievements:.....	18
Today's challenges:.....	18
Outlook to the future:.....	19
Strengths:.....	19
Weaknesses:.....	19
Recommendations:.....	19

## VI. Comments of the institution

# I. NATIONAL CONTEXT AND INSTITUTION IDENTITY SHEET

## GENERAL CONTEXT AND HIGHER EDUCATION

Ukraine is a country in Eastern Europe. Its capital and largest city is Kiev and the second largest city is Kharkiv. "Ukraine is a developing country and ranks 88th on the Human Development Index. As of 2018, Ukraine has the second lowest GDP per capita in Europe (\$3,133). At US\$40, it has the lowest median wealth per adult in the world (real estate not counted, but many Ukrainians possess real estate). It also suffers from a high poverty rate. However, because of its extensive fertile farmlands, Ukraine is one of the world's largest grain exporters. Ukraine also maintains the second-largest military in Europe after that of Russia."<sup>1</sup>

In 2018, the Ukrainian higher education system had more than 800 institutions and a thousand subsidiaries in provincial cities. These institutions are divided into 4 "accreditation levels" (*riveni akreditsii*). Indeed, since the Education Act of 1996, higher education institutions have been differentiated as follows: level 1 and 2 for technical higher education institutions (*technikum, colleges...*); level 3 for institutes and level 4 for universities and academies. Level 4 delivers the following training and diplomas: *Bakalavr, Specialist* or *Magistrate, Science candidate, Doctor of Science*<sup>2</sup>.

Of the nearly 350 level 3-4 establishments, 65% are public (more than 110 have "national" status, a label granted by presidential decree), 4% are municipal and 31% private<sup>3</sup>.

In parallel with the public higher education system, an alternative private higher education system has developed since the 1990s: more than a hundred private institutions at levels 3-4 offer training, mainly in management, marketing, international law and finance.

Ukraine is one of the last countries in continental Europe to join the Bologna Process (May 2005); it has continued to implement the European Credits Transfer System (ECTS) modules and the generalisation of the *Bakalavr / Magistr / Kandidat* division.

Despite a very demanding academic tradition, the level of schools and universities remains heterogeneous, mainly because of the low attractiveness of the teaching profession.

With 4.6% of its students enrolled in degree mobility abroad in 2016, Ukraine is particularly international-oriented. In 2016, Ukraine received 54,144 international students, a number that is increasing from year to year. Ukraine is a dynamic partner of the Erasmus+ programme, particularly in its exchanges with France<sup>4</sup>.

Germany, the 3<sup>rd</sup> destination country for Ukrainian students, has developed its attractiveness thanks to the active presence of *Deutscher Akademischer Austauschdienst* (DAAD) in Ukraine and a network of readers in 16 cities. In addition, Germany provides approximately 2,000 scholarships to Ukrainian students. France, the seventh host country, attracted 1,822 Ukrainian students in 2017-2018, an increase over five years<sup>5</sup>. As the average Ukrainian salary is among the lowest in Europe, the cost of studying abroad and the availability of scholarships are decisive factors in the implementation of a mobility stay abroad project.

There are two university entrance exams, one giving access to free studies, the other to paid studies (and logically less difficult), which results in disparities in level which can be significant in some institutions. But paying students contribute on average (but there are significant differences from one discipline to another or from one institution to another) to 50% of the budget of Ukrainian institutions<sup>6</sup>.

In general, in Ukraine, universities are higher education institutions with a wide range of scientific activities offering a wide range of study programmes in the natural, social, technical and economic sciences, as well as in the field of culture or the arts. In Ukraine, there are classical and specialized universities: technical, technological, medical, agrarian, cultural and arts universities. As a general rule, academies offer studies in the concrete field of science, production or teaching.

<sup>1</sup> <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ukraine>.

<sup>2</sup> Fiche Curie Ukraine, p. 1. [https://www.diplomatie.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/UKRAINE\\_Fiche\\_Curie\\_13\\_11\\_03\\_cle87f327.pdf](https://www.diplomatie.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/UKRAINE_Fiche_Curie_13_11_03_cle87f327.pdf), p. 8.

<sup>3</sup> Focus Pays Ukraine, n° 26, mars 2019, Campus France, p. 3.

<sup>4</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 5.

<sup>5</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 6.

<sup>6</sup> Fiche Curie Ukraine, *op. cit.*, p. 8.

Ukraine is still a bit divided between its Soviet academic heritage and the desire to renew its higher education system in order to achieve greater integration into the European Higher Education Area, of which it has been a member since 2005.

In doctoral studies, there are also two categories of students in Ukraine, those who are admitted on the quota of places known as "on budget" (taken care of by the State) who do not pay for their schooling and those who pay for their schooling and return "on contract". The allocation of budget places by discipline and institution is the prerogative of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine (hereinafter MESU).

At the end of 2017, there were just over 30,000 doctoral students.

There are two stages in the organization of doctoral studies, that of thesis writing and defense, which is largely the responsibility of the Universities and laboratories of the Academy of Sciences (and their Scientific Councils), and that of the validation and award of the diploma under the so-called "executive attestation" department of the Ministry which manages the administrative processing. An expert council then issues an opinion on the scientific quality of the thesis defended and a college of attestation actually awards the diploma.

It exists two types of training and diplomas at level 8 (UNESCO): the PhD and the Doctorate of Sciences; the latter is different from a doctorate in French sciences and can be compared to the authorization to supervise research (*habilitation à diriger des recherches*, in French<sup>7</sup>), the purpose of which it shares.

The table below provides a better understanding of each of the two systems.

**PhD and Doctoral Students Preparation<sup>8</sup>**

	<b>"Doctor of Philosophy"</b>	<b>"Doctor of Sciences"</b>
Study Mode	Full-time (day, evening); part-time	Full-time (day)
General Information	It is both an educational and the first academic degree that is acquired at the third level of higher education on the basis of a Master's degree. The Doctor of Philosophy degree is awarded by a specialized academic board of a higher education institution or a research institute as a result of the successful completion of a relevant educational and scientific programme by a student and public defense of a thesis in a specialized academic board.	This is the second academic degree obtained by a person on the basis of the Doctor of Philosophy degree. It involves gaining the highest competences in the field of development and implementation of research methodology, conducting individual research, obtaining scientific results that solve important theoretical or applied problems, have a national or international significance and are published in scientific journals.
Duration	Four years	Two years
Students' Training	The state order for the training of PhD students majoring in different specialties is distributed on a competitive basis among higher education institutions and research institutes. In case the higher education institutions and research institutes have a license for providing the third level educational services in the corresponding specialty at the moment of the competition, they are allowed to apply for the state order.  The number of self-funded students and the training cost are determined by the Academic Council of the University, taking into account the number specified in the university license, under which it carries out the third level educational services, the possibilities of providing qualified research supervision and meeting the educational needs of students in the corresponding specialty.  Under educational program. Curriculum.	The state order for the training of doctoral students majoring in different specialties is distributed on a competitive basis among higher education institutions and research institutes with specialized academic boards in the corresponding specialties. Information about the distribution of the state order is published on the official web-site of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine and on the websites of higher education institutions and research institutes that received a state order for the training doctoral students.  Academic program.
Work plans	Individual curriculum. Individual research plan.	Individual research plan.
Students Responsibilities	To acquire theoretical knowledge, skills and other competences to generate new ideas, to solve complex problems in the field of professional, research and innovation	To defend in a specialized academic board the scientific achievements results in the form of a thesis, or a published monograph, or a scientific report based on the articles published in national and international peer-reviewed journals,

<sup>7</sup> It means a degree above the doctorate, necessary to obtain to become a university professor (full professor) in France.

<sup>8</sup> This table was provided by Kyiv National University of Trade and Economics (KNUTE).

	<p>activities, to master the methodology of scientific and pedagogical activities, as well as to conduct individual scientific research, containing a scientific novelty, theoretical and practical value, and to defend the thesis.</p>	<p>the list of which is approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine. The thesis (monograph, scientific articles) of the doctoral student must contain independent conclusions related to the significant scientific problem (groups of problems) within one or several fields of knowledge. They shall provide the solution of an important theoretical or practical problem, have a national or international value, and be credible and practically tested.</p>
<p>Educational Component</p>	<p>The curriculum contains information on the list and number of disciplines (60 ECTS credits), the order of disciplines, types of classes and their number, the curriculum schedule, the forms of current and final control. The individual curriculum of the student contains a list of optional disciplines not less than 25 percent of the total number of ECTS credits. Besides, students have the right to choose the disciplines provided at other cycles of higher education but related to the thesis subject. It shall be approved by a research supervisor, the head of the department and the dean of the corresponding faculty. The student has the right to change his individual curriculum with the approval of the research supervisor in the order confirmed by the Academic Council. Both full and part-time students are required to attend classes and undergo all forms of current and final control envisaged by the student's individual curriculum, educational and scientific programme.</p>	<p>No</p>
<p>Educational and Research Component</p>	<p><b>Educational component</b> includes at least four components that provide such competences in accordance with the National Qualifications Framework:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- obtaining profound knowledge of the specialty (the group of specialties) of the research, in particular understanding basic concepts, theoretical and practical problems, history of development and the current state of scientific fundamentals, mastering the terminology of the research subject;</li> <li>- mastering the general scientific (philosophical) competences, aimed at forming a systemic scientific outlook, professional ethics and general cultural outlook;</li> <li>- acquiring universal skills of the researcher, in particular oral and written presentation of the results of the scientific research in the Ukrainian language, using modern information technologies, organizing and conducting training sessions, managing scientific projects and / or making proposals for research funding, registering intellectual property rights;</li> <li>- obtaining the linguistic competences sufficient for presentation and discussion of the results of their scientific work in a foreign language (in English or another one according to the specialty characteristics) in oral and written form, as well as for a full understanding of foreign scientific texts in the corresponding specialty.</li> </ul> <p><b>Scientific component.</b> Conducting the individual scientific research under the supervision of one or two research supervisors and summarizing the results in the form of a thesis. The dissertation for obtaining the Doctor of Philosophy degree is an individual research offering the solution of the significant</p>	<p><b>Scientific programme.</b> Conducting an individual research in the form of a manuscript or a published monograph. A thesis prepared for defense shall contain scientifically grounded theoretical or experimental results, scientific statements, shall be integral and coherent and reflect doctoral student's personal contribution. Theses (scientific reports), having no plagiarism, can be defended.</p>

	scientific problem in one or several fields of knowledge. Its results shall constitute the original contribution to the relevant field of knowledge and be published in relevant journals. Theses, having no plagiarism, can be defended.	
Attestation of Students	Attestation of PhD students is carried out by a permanent or ad hoc specialized academic board on the basis of public defense of scientific achievements in the form of a thesis. A thesis supervisor (or two supervisors) shall approve the thesis to be defended. A compulsory condition for defense is the successful completion of a student's individual curriculum.	Attestation of doctoral students is carried out by a permanent specialized academic board in the corresponding specialty of the students' university. If there is no specialized academic board in the corresponding specialty at the students' university, a permanent specialized academic board in the corresponding specialty of another higher education institution (research institute) may attest and award the doctoral degree at the request of the university, which trained the doctoral student, or at the request of a doctoral student.

## INSTITUTION

1. University: Kyiv National University of Trade and Economics (hereafter **KNUTE**)
2. Programme's title: Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)
3. Training/speciality: Study field 05 "Social and Behavioural Science" Specialty 051 "Economics"
4. Year of creation and context: 1966
5. Site(s) where the programme is taught (Town and campus): Kyoto 19, Kyiv, Ukraine
6. Programme director: Vasyl Lahutin, Doctor of Science, Professor (academic coordinator and study programme director)

## METHODS AND RESULTS OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION(S)

7. Methodology and agency: ex-ante accredited by MESU (Ministry Order #655 dated 10 June 2016).
8. Results: period of programme validity, four years.

## STUDENT POPULATION: EVOLUTION AND TYPOLOGY OVER THE LAST 4 YEARS<sup>9</sup>

### Enrollment statistics

	2015	2016	2017	2018
Number of applicants	25	12	6	8
PhD Students enrolled	22	11	5	7
State-funded	16	11	5	6
Women	9	9	3	3
Men	13	2	2	4

### Graduation statistics

	2015	2016	2017	2018
Total number of graduates	8	13	11	10
Number of successfully graduated PhD students	3 (1 found a job in a private company, 2 in higher education institutions)	10 (4 have found a job in a private or public company, 4 in higher education institutions)	11 (4 found a job in a private or public company, 5 in higher education institutions, 1 continued in post-doc studies)	9 (4 found a job in a private or public company, 2 in higher education institutions and 1 in a research institution)
Average	3.5	3.4	3.7	3.1

<sup>9</sup> Self-assessment report (SAR hereinafter), p. 103.

duration of a PhD study/thesis research years				
---	--	--	--	--

## II. EVALUATION PROCEDURE

### HISTORY OF THE REQUEST FOR EVALUATION AND ACCREDITATION

Two Ukrainian universities — Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics (KhNUE) and KNUTE — are partners in a European programme with Erasmus+ funding, launched in 2016 and led by the French University in Armenia. The Erasmus+ programme is called "Promoting internationalization of research through establishment and operationalization of Cycle 3 Quality Assurance System in line with the European Integration Agenda" (C3QA). This programme aims to improve the PhD level programmes of four countries: Armenia, Kazakhstan, Mongolia and Ukraine. In addition to universities, evaluation agencies and ministries of these four countries, the European project also involves France (Lyon III University, the University of Clermont-Auvergne and Hcéres), Spain (Alcala University) and Poland.

The final phase of this project is to conduct pilot evaluations and it is in this context that KhNUE and also KNUTE were evaluated by a panel of experts selected among the partners of the European project, to which was added a high-level expert in the scientific discipline (economics), Professor Gilles Jacoud from the University of Saint-Étienne, who also has experience in evaluation and accreditation procedures.

After the evaluation, the two universities — KhNUE and KNUTE — also wished to apply for accreditation of their PhD programme in economics by Hcéres.

### COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE

- Mr. Gilles Jacoud, Dr., Full Professor of Economics, University of Saint-Étienne, (Subject-specific Expert), France, chair of the committee;
- Mr. Armen Budaghyan, Dr., Associate Vice-Rector, Director of Quality Assurance, Yerevan State University and President of the National Centre for Strategic Research in Higher Education (YSU) (General Academic Expert), Armenia;
- Ms. Tsogtsuren Bayasgalan, Doctor in public administration, Mongolian National Council for Education Accreditation (MNCEA) (Representative from QA agency), Mongolia ;
- Mr. Alexis Yourtchenko, Community Manager, Leroy-Merlin Ukraine, Kiev, (professional, representative of the socio-economic sector), Ukraine ;
- Ms. Viktoriia Melnychuk, PhD Student in Economics (Igor Sikorsky Kyiv Polytechnic Institute, Kiev), Ukraine;
- Mr. François Pernot (Hcéres), Dr., Full Professor in History, Paris-Seine University and Director of the Europe and International Department of the High Council for Evaluation of Research and Higher Education (Hcéres), (General Academic Expert who accompanied also the committee as science advisor at the Hcéres), France.

### ON SITE VISIT DESCRIPTION

The committee, together with the Hcéres representative, visited KNUTE from April 17 to 18, 2019.

The first three interview sessions were plenary sessions attended by all committee members; for subsequent sessions, the group of six experts was divided into two groups of three persons conducting parallel sessions, the distribution of experts having been previously organized according to the themes to be addressed.

<b>KNUTE site-visit schedule</b>
----------------------------------

Time	Interviewed	Name and Position
<b>April 17th</b>		
9h15 – 9h45	Briefing (committee only)	
9h45 – 10h00	Welcome note	<b>Anatolii Mazaraki</b> - Rector of KNUTE
10h00-11h00	Presentation of the institution and doctoral issues	<b>Svitlana Melnychenko</b> - Vice rector for Scientific Work
11h00 – 12h00	Presentation of the doctoral programme	<b>Anzhelika Gerasymenko</b> - Professor of Department of Economics and Competition Policy, member of the Assurance Group of the Cycle 3 programme "Economics"
12h00-13h30	Lunch and discussion	
13h30-14h00	Visit of the campus	
14h00-15h00	Representatives of Assurance group of Cycle 3 Programme "Economics"	<b>Vasyl Lahutin</b> - Director of the Cycle 3 programme "Economics", Head of the Department of Economics and Competition Policy, <b>Ganna Blakyta</b> - head of the Department of Economics and Business Finance, <b>Andrii Roskladka</b> - Head of the Department of Cybernetics and System Analysis
	Representatives from Center of Career Development	<b>Oksana Nazarenko</b> - Head of the Center of Career Development
15h00-16h00	Panel of supervisors	<b>Anzhelika Gerasymenko</b> - Professor of the Department of Economics and Competition Policy, <b>Ganna Sytnyk</b> - Professor of the Department of Economics and Business Finance, <b>Yurii Umantsiv</b> - Professor of the Department of Economics and Competition Policy
	Panel of PhD Students	PhD students of the Cycle 3 Programme "Economics": <b>Oksana Kuzmenko</b> , <b>Svitlana Afendikova</b> , <b>Volodymyr Glushko</b> , <b>Pavlo Sakulin</b> , <b>Tetiana Butova</b>
16h00-16h30	Break and discussion	
16h30-17h30	Representatives of the Academic Board	<b>Nataliia Prytulska</b> - Deputy Head of the Academic Board, the 1st Vice-rector for Scientific and Pedagogical Work, <b>Mykhailo Tarasiuk</b> - Academic secretary of the Academic Board, <b>Oleksandr Minyailo</b> - Member of Academic Board
	Representatives of doctoral school administration	<b>Yuliia Anishchenko</b> - Head of the Doctoral School Administration, <b>Lesya Melnyk</b> - Doctoral School Administration official, <b>Valentyna Kostjuk</b> - Doctoral School Administration official
17h30-18h30	Meeting session of the committee only	
18h30-19h30	Dinner	
<b>April 18th</b>		
8h30 – 9h00	Briefing (committee only)	
9h00 – 09h30	Panel of research partners	<b>Olha Kudlasevych</b> - Senior Researcher of Department of the History of Economic Thoughts Institute of Economics and Forecasting of the National Academy of Science of Ukraine; <b>Vadym Yemets</b> - Expert of Institute of Strategic Studies "New Ukraine"
	Integrity and antiplagiarism Responsibles	<b>Oleksandr Kharchenko</b> - Deputy Head of the Committee of Ethic and Integrity, <b>Serhii Bai</b> - Committee Member, <b>Mykhailo Tarasiuk</b> - Committee Secretary
09h30 - 10h00	Representative from Follow-up committees	<b>Ganna Sytnyk</b> - Professor of the Department of Economics and Business Finance, <b>Olena Matusova</b> - Associate Professor of Department of Economics and Business Finance, <b>Iryna Sokolovska</b> - Associate Professor of Department of Economics and Competition Policy
	Panel of teaching team	<b>Andrii Roskladka</b> - Head of the Department of Cybernetics and System Analysis, <b>Anzhelika Gerasymenko</b> - Professor of the Department of Economics and Competition Policy, <b>Oksana Golik</b> - associate professor of the Department of Journalism and Advertising, <b>Vitalii Razitskii</b> - associate professor of Department of Philosophy and Social Sciences
10h00 – 11h00	Panel of public/private partner institutions	<b>Veronika Popova</b> - HR manager at LLC "L'Oreal Ukraine", <b>Olha Karpiuk</b> - Head of Department at Antimonopoly Committee of Ukraine, <b>Iryna Dzhulai</b> - Operational Manager at "11 Mirror Design Hotel"; <b>Alevtyna Beletska</b> - Communications Head at Foxrot Group of Companies, <b>Maryna Bondarchuk</b> - HR Manager at LLC "Sakhara", <b>Ganna Mykhailichenko</b> - founder of Tourist Company "Svitovyda" and a professor of KNUTE.

	Representative from specialized academic councils	<b>Vasyl Lahutin</b> - Head of the Specialized Academic Council "Economic Theory and History of Economic Thoughts", <b>Tetiana Tkachenko</b> - member of Specialized Academic Council "Economics and Management of Business Entities", <b>Natalia Barabash</b> - Academic Secretary of Specialized Academic Council "Economics and Management of Business Entities", <b>Olha Kharchenko</b> - Technical Secretary of KNUTE Specialized Academic Councils.
11h00-12h00	Panel of PhD graduates, representatives from KNUTE Graduate Association	<b>Tetiana Tkachuk</b> -senior lecture of the Department of Hotel and Restaurant Business at KNUTE, <b>Vadym Yemets</b> -expert of Institute of Strategic Studies "New Ukraine", <b>Olha Karpiuk</b> - Head of Department at Antimonopoly Committee of Ukraine, <b>Maryna Bondarchuk</b> - HR Manager at LLC "Sakhara", <b>Ganna Mykhailichenko</b> - founder of Tourist Company "Svitovyd" and a professor and Professor of Department of Tourism and Recreation at KNUTE
	Representatives from Dpt of International Relations	<b>Valerii Sai</b> - Vice-rector of KNUTE for Scientific, Pedagogical Work and International Relations, <b>Tetiana Dupliak</b> - Director of the European Education Center, <b>Klavdiia Yatsyshyna</b> - Leading Specialist of Department of International Relations
12h00-13h00	Lunch and discussion	
13h00 - 13h50	Meeting session of the committee only	
13h50 - 14h00	WRAP-UP SESSION	

On the last day of the on-site visit, the whole committee discussed with the Programme Director of the PhD programme in Economics for clarifying the points that came to its attention during the two days of interviews and campus visits.

The committee acknowledges the efficient organization of the visit by KNUTE.

### III. PRESENTATION OF THE PROGRAMME

#### 1 – PRESENTATION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMME

The history of KNUTE starts from Kyiv branch of the all Union Correspondence Institute of Soviet Trade founded in 1946. In 1994, the educational institution was converted into Kyiv State University of Trade and Economics. The same year, it got the highest IV<sup>th</sup> level of State accreditation. By a Decree of the President of Ukraine of September 11, 2000, the University was granted the status of National University. The university includes also five institutes, ten colleges and higher commercial schools<sup>10</sup>.

The Cycle 3 Programme in Economics has been launched in 1966 and transformed several times. An important transformation took place in 2015 in terms of Bologna process and within Salzburg principles. On this occasion, the Cycle 3 Programme in Economics has incorporated several ex-programmes (Economics theory and the history of economic thoughts, Economics and governance of national economy, Economics and management of enterprises (according to the types of economic activities), Development of productive power and regional economy, Statistics, Mathematical methods, models and informational technologies in economics). In 2015, another university -Ukrainian State University of finance and international trade- has merged with KNUTE. The merger reflected in PhD students population and completion statistics<sup>11</sup>.

In accordance with the legislation of Ukraine, the Autonomy is granted to the University:

- "to develop and implement educational (scientific) programmes within the framework of a licensed specialty. Within realization of this right the Cycle 3 programme "Economics" has been developed;
- to make the final decision on awarding academic degrees by accredited specialized councils.

In this way, and given the functioning at KNUTE of the seven specialized scientific councils for the defense of theses, the university has formed a full cycle of PhD training from enrollment to the defense and awarding a degree.

<sup>10</sup> [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kyiv\\_National\\_University\\_of\\_Trade\\_and\\_Economics](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kyiv_National_University_of_Trade_and_Economics)

<sup>11</sup> SAR, p. 3.

Cycle 3 program "Economics" corresponds the KNUTE General Strategy of University development till 2030, which includes, among other, the following tasks of strategic development of the University as:

- training of highly skilled specialists maximally adapted to the tasks of professional activity, business-oriented, intellectually and creatively developed and language competent, etc.;
- ensuring the quality of academic and teaching staff, increasing the level of effectiveness of training of scientific personnel, internships, and advanced training;
- development of scientific activity, approximation to the parameters of the research institution of higher education; constant updating of subjects of scientific research aimed at social and economic development of the country; Identification and filling of niches of the demand for scientific results<sup>12</sup>.

## 2 – PRESENTATION OF PROGRAMME'S SELF-EVALUATION APPROACH

The KNUTE PhD programme has submitted a clearly organized self-assessment report which follows the four-part structure of the Hcéres PhD evaluation framework:

Area 1 – The positioning of the doctorate;

Area 2 – Organization and management of the doctorate;

Area 3 – Supervision and training for doctoral students;

Area 4 – Integration of doctors into the job market.

Each of these four items has been concisely described on 21 pages backed by extensive appendices, providing additional information on individual points, often in the form of tables. The self-assessment report is accompanied by a SWOT analysis.

---

<sup>12</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 4.

## IV. EVALUATION REPORT

### AREA 1 – THE POSITIONING OF THE DOCTORATE

#### Area 1-1: The doctorate's distinct features and objectives are clearly defined

The KNUTE Economics PhD Programme aims at educating the next generation of leaders in Economics research and services in Ukraine. At the same time, the university must consider the positioning of its doctorate to enhance its attractiveness and attract motivated candidates from regional higher education institutions and industries.

The objectives of the KNUTE Economics PhD Programme are generally well defined. The university has an impressive list of documents and handbooks that govern and guide doctoral studies, including for the programme under evaluation, as evidenced by the site visit. These documents are published and made available to all the parties involved in paper and electronic modes.

The Cycle 3 programme specification defines the aim and characteristics of the programme, the list of competencies and programme learning outcomes, as well as the programme matrix showing the graduate's expected competencies and programme modules.

The committee of experts had all these documents at its disposal in the self-assessment report. In particular, the profile of the Cycle 3 programme in Economics<sup>13</sup> is organized in order to further knowledge in the field of economics, renew economic analysis methodology, develop practical recommendations for improving the efficiency of enterprises or other organizations, and increase the effectiveness of economic policy. The committee of experts also noted that the list of general and professional skills of PhD students is given in the programme description.

The purpose of the Cycle 3 programme in Economics is defined as "the acquiring by PhD students of in-depth knowledge, skills, qualifications and other competencies that are sufficient to generate new ideas, solve complex problems in the field of professional and/or research and innovation activities, mastering the methodology of scientific and pedagogical activities, as well as conducting scientific research..."<sup>14</sup>

In accordance with the Rules of Admission to PhD and doctoral studies, persons with a master's degree or the educational qualification level of a specialist diploma are eligible for enrolment on the doctoral programme. However, in the self-assessment report and other official documents, the expert panel could not identify who the main potential applicants/students of the programme are – KNUTE graduates, graduates from other higher education institutions or practitioners from local or regional industries. Also, the number of applicants and enrolled doctoral students has fallen dramatically (almost divided by three) over the past five years, according to the statistics on PhD student numbers.<sup>15</sup>

The university notes in its self-assessment report that "despite the publication of all the relevant information on the KNUTE website and visibility of the doctorate school in the Ukrainian scientific community, there is a lack of targeted activities to attract PhD applicants. Though the number of applicants usually exceeds the number of enrolled PhD students, a more active promotional strategy will ensure a greater number of motivated applicants",<sup>16</sup> and the committee of experts was also able to observe this during the interviews.

The objectives of the KNUTE Economics PhD programme are clearly defined in the self-assessment report and are consistent with the information provided during interviews of faculty members during the site visit. Nevertheless, a major effort to promote doctoral studies in Economics at KNUTE must therefore be made and the university is fully aware of this need. Special attention should be paid to attracting more talented doctoral applicants from outside the university, especially from regional industries and university graduates.

---

<sup>13</sup> SAR, Annex 2.

<sup>14</sup> SAR, p. 4.

<sup>15</sup> SAR, Annex 8.

<sup>16</sup> SAR, p. 5.

The programme is consistent with the university's scientific policy, as set out in the "Advancement of Science & Innovations" part of the KNUTE Development Strategy through to 2030. It states that regular activities are required to identify the most talented students with the motivation to conduct research and engage in doctoral research activities. At the same time, the university is always seeking cooperation with the leading research and higher education institutions of the country to implement a new paradigm for the training of doctoral students.<sup>17</sup>

## Area 1-2: The positioning of the doctorate is consistent with its environment

The KNUTE Economics PhD programme is well integrated into the general KNUTE strategy of scientific and intellectual quality, and totally integrated into the regional and national socio-economic market, but the international aspect is to be further developed.

The KNUTE Economics PhD programme is in line with the current research strategies of the university, which are directed towards fostering scientific quality. It interacts effectively with the institution's relevant structural units and has well-established formal links with the internal stakeholders.

The main administrative unit responsible for the admission and further administration of doctoral students is the Doctoral School. However, the two main professional departments are fully engaged in recruitment of doctoral students, teaching and supervising activities, monitoring of student progress, preparation of theses for defense, etc.

For the Economics PhD programme, KNUTE has entered into numerous cooperation agreements with many State research institutions, private companies and public organizations, as the expert committee was able to observe without any difficulty in the self-assessment report and during the site visit interviews. For the implementation of these agreements, lectures and master classes are held upon request by practitioners for the students of the Cycle 3 programme in Economics, as well as students of other educational programmes. Research is carried out by KNUTE PhD students at the request of cooperating organizations that are interested in the specific topics.<sup>18</sup> Some 40-50% of the successful graduates find jobs in State or privately-owned companies, but not in research institutions outside of KNUTE.<sup>19</sup> At the same time, professionals from industry who hold a doctoral degree are eager to supervise PhD students to acquire the results of research work in their areas of interest.

There are no direct contracts with private companies for funding PhD research at KNUTE and some PhD students self-finance their research to use the results in their workplace.<sup>20</sup> KNUTE has also entered into cooperation agreements with research institutes of the National Academy of Science. The main funding of PhD students (about 90%) comes from the State budget.

25 to 30% of the Cycle 3 Economics programme graduates each year stay on to work at KNUTE, joining the scientific and teaching staff of the University.

The Careers Development Center (started in 2017) is in charge of interactions with the socio-economic and socio-cultural environments. This Center organizes "student practical training courses, helping graduate students find work placements and adapt to practical work, maintaining feedback with them, monitoring the development of their careers, administering work with partners of KNUTE, holding a vacancies fair, involving representatives of partner organizations in training for educational programmes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> cycle, organizing master classes, open lectures and other capacity-building activities by involving representatives of the socio-economic and socio-cultural worlds".<sup>21</sup>

With regard to the international dimension, KNUTE has signed and implements bilateral agreements: "currently more than 100 agreements on cooperation with higher education institutions, international centers and institutions from 30 countries around the world, as well as an agreement with the Chinese Trade Association, have been signed. These agreements provide, among other things, for the management of joint research, the

<sup>17</sup> SAR, Annex 1 (Development Strategy), p. 40.

<sup>18</sup> SAR, p. 5.

<sup>19</sup> SAR, Annex 10.

<sup>20</sup> SAR, p. 6.

<sup>21</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 7.

exchange of scientific and educational-methodical literature, the organization of joint scientific conferences, joint publications, the exchange of PhD students, etc."<sup>22</sup>

The self-assessment report indicates that "each year, the Cycle 3 Economics PhD programme students take part in international scientific conferences held by KNUTE partners and other institutions of higher education abroad. Typically, a PhD student participates in 2-3 international conferences in Ukraine and abroad."<sup>23</sup> PhD students have the possibility to work abroad, but such activities are in fact very limited.<sup>24</sup> At the same time, the small number of foreign visiting researchers and incoming or outgoing doctoral students, the lack of foreign supervisors and international internships are amongst the weaknesses of the KNUTE Economics programme, as evidenced in the SWOT analysis.<sup>25</sup> The national requirement for PhD theses to be written and presented only in the Ukrainian language also hinders internationalization of doctoral research.

In the self-assessment report, as in all the interviews, the expert committee noted that the internationalization of the PhD programme in Economics is supported by KNUTE. However, although the internationalization process is already well under way, KNUTE must increase its efforts in this direction. Students' credit mobility programmes and doctoral students' involvement in these programmes are still lacking because of the restrictive regulations at national level for doctoral students.

## AREA 2 – ORGANIZATION AND MANAGEMENT OF THE DOCTORATE

### Area 2-1: Effective organization and management is in place for the doctorate

Administrative support and scientific organization of the Economics PhD programme are good and satisfy all standards applied at European universities.

The organizational structure of the PhD programme involves the interaction of scientific, teaching and administrative staff.<sup>26</sup> The scientific team includes "scientific supervisors, reviewers, the KNUTE Scientific Experts Council, the Cycle 3 'Economics' project team, academic staff of departments",<sup>27</sup> the teaching teams of the academic departments and members of programme assurance groups, and the KNUTE administration team: the Academic Board, the Rector, Vice-Rectors, support service staff (Doctoral School Administration, Careers Development Center, International Department, library, etc.).

The Academic Board handles KNUTE's general management and in particular the activities of the PhD programme.

Regarding human resources, in 2017 and 2018, almost all the supervisors were Doctors of Science. Regarding the material resources, the PhD students are provided with classrooms, literature, access to information and a range of educational facilities: 31,300 m<sup>2</sup> of educational buildings, a special dormitory for them, more than one million titles of academic and scientific literature in the library, free access to all open research information (Scopus, Web of Science or other data bases), computers with basic and specialized software, a distance learning laboratory with almost one thousand educational courses, the University website and the Technology Transfer Center.

The university is adapted for students with disabilities and practical psychologists can provide support to PhD students with special needs for their social adaptation.

The internal quality assurance of educational activity at KNUTE is well developed. The basic internal quality assurance procedures are the following:

- Since 2017, annual surveys conducted by the Doctoral School Administration enable PhD students to communicate their satisfaction or dissatisfaction with the Cycle 3 programme, more precisely concerning availability, efficiency and clarity of information on the programme.

<sup>22</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 7-8.

<sup>23</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 8.

<sup>24</sup> As the committee of experts noted during the interviews.

<sup>25</sup> SAR, Annex 11.

<sup>26</sup> SAR, Annex 5.

<sup>27</sup> SAR, p. 9.

- The results of the annual surveys on the quality of PhD training are taken into account to make changes to the programme.

The internal regulations guarantee the participation of PhD students and also of external stakeholders in development of the programme and ensure its compliance with the needs of PhD students and the requirements of the socio-economic environment.

To summarize, the academic and administrative organization of the KNUTE PhD Economics programme is very well established and executed to European and international standards.

## Area 2-2: There is an explicit policy for recruiting and funding doctoral students, which is adapted to the PhD programme

The KNUTE Economics PhD programme recruitment procedure is well organized as required by Ukrainian law, but needs to be improved for the recruitment of international students.

The rules of admission are developed annually by the KNUTE Admission Committee in accordance with the national regulations. They define the competitive selection procedure for candidates and the admission procedure for entrance exams.<sup>28</sup>

Candidates with a master's degree are admitted to take the entrance exams if they submit all necessary documents for admission on time and in accordance with the rules of admission. The selection procedure for PhD studies and the decision on enrollment are collegiate and may be consulted on the University's website.<sup>29</sup>

Ukrainian and foreign candidates, even if they have completed their master's degree abroad (thanks to the recognition of foreign diplomas by KNUTE Academic Board), may be enrolled in the programme. International students can benefit from the assistance of the Department of International Relations of the university. If necessary, many academics could teach in English or conduct scientific supervision in this language, but in practice this is not done much.

The PhD students are enrolled within the limits set by the MESU. A significant number of thesis defenses were recorded in 2015 because students from another university were added at that time. The number then went down as fewer supported places were given by the MESU.

Studying in the Cycle 3 programme in Economics can be financed either on the State budget (there is State funding in Ukraine to stimulate PhD training and research: in December 2018, 92% of PhD students were financed by the State budget) or at the expense of private funds (8% of PhD students). In 2018, the cost of studying for the Cycle 3 programme in Economics amounted to UAH 86,900.<sup>30</sup> This cost includes the salary of the thesis supervisor and the teachers of the educational courses (78%) and the university (overhead) costs (22%).<sup>31</sup> PhD students are also eligible for different types of State scholarships, as well as for participation in Erasmus+ KA1 international exchange programmes.<sup>32</sup>

The international strategy of the PhD programme is very limited due to the lack of financial resources of both students and the university. PhD students on government funds cannot leave. One solution is to rely on Erasmus+ exchange and mobility programmes and to encourage students who are funded to spend a semester abroad. Agreements have been made to exchange PhD students with France, Germany and Poland, but it is difficult to find French, German and Polish students who speak Ukrainian and are prepared to take part in these exchanges. Another very severe limitation is that the thesis must be written in Ukrainian.

There is also an exchange project with the University of Clermont-Ferrand for co-directorships of theses, as well as with Grenoble. University officials believe that the situation should improve in 2020. It should be noted that the European Education Center was created five years ago with the help of the University of Clermont-Ferrand.

It may be regretted that although cooperation exists with several European universities, it is mainly at bachelor and master levels and is scarce at the doctorate level. Student mobility at KNUTE also takes place before the

<sup>28</sup> SAR, p. 13.

<sup>29</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>30</sup> Circa €3,000.

<sup>31</sup> SAR, p. 13.

<sup>32</sup> SAR, p. 7.

doctorate. The committee recommends strongly to KNUTE to change this situation: increase student and teacher mobility, seek special funding to boost the level of internationalization, official invitations from the university for foreign students (which is not currently possible), efforts to facilitate the formalities to come and study in Ukraine.

## AREA 3 – SUPERVISION AND TRAINING FOR DOCTORAL STUDENTS

### Area 3-1: The doctorate applies a strict doctoral student supervision and follow-up policy

The KNUTE Cycle 3 programme in Economics applies strict doctoral student supervision and follow-up policy to a high standard. There is a system for preventing any forms of conflict and controlling integrity

Supervision and training on the KNUTE Cycle 3 programme in Economics are organized and managed at several levels. The monitoring of KNUTE PhD students includes the participation of administration, scientific and teaching staff. There are structural units that supervise PhD students.<sup>33</sup> They are the Doctoral School Administration; Academic Board; Faculty Academic Council; Specialized Academic Council (fifteen to twenty members); Academic Departments (supervisors, follow-up committees and teachers). The supervisor may carry out simultaneous research supervision for a limited number of doctoral students: a maximum of 5 PhD students for a Doctor of Sciences and of 3 PhD students for a PhD.<sup>34</sup> In addition, the supervisor must have a recommendation from the Faculty Scientific Council for supervising the thesis, experience in the field of specialty (participation in international conferences or internships abroad etc.) and at least 10 research works (three of them must be included in the scientific databases, such as Scopus, Web of Science etc.).

It must be noted that the supervisor is attached to the PhD student simultaneously on acceptance to the Cycle 3 programme, although, as it was pointed out, the Academic Department has an opportunity to appoint an individual follow-up committee (at least two academics among members of the department) who will consult with the PhD student in the relevant research sphere. This committee is involved in the evaluation of thesis readiness and can serve as mediators in cases of conflict between the student and the supervisor.

The KNUTE Cycle 3 programme provides continuous monitoring of PhD students in scientific and educational areas. The supervisor and members of the follow-up committee examine accomplishment in the scientific component by the PhD student. This includes control over the writing of a thesis, scientific articles, conference reports and fulfilment of the individual plan. The education component of the Cycle 3 programme should also be completed properly. Having discussed the evaluation processes with PhD students, it was confirmed that they present the results of their research twice a year to the Academic Department. PhD students may only be certified for a given period once the scientific and educational components have been passed. PhD student certification is confirmed at the meeting of the Faculty's Academic Council (twice a year) as well as on transfer of the PhD student to the next year of study (once a year).

The rights and obligations of PhD students on the Cycle 3 programme are outlined in the PhD Student Handbook.<sup>35</sup> It explains the process of studying and carrying out research work by highlighting the main important information about studying and thesis defense, international mobility, support, etc.

There is a system of measures for preventing copyright and academic plagiarism at KNUTE. The Regulations on research integrity for academics, teaching staff and students set out the research integrity requirements and must be signed by all the members of the scientific and educational process of the university. There is a strict mechanism for checking the thesis and scientific articles. Supervisors and PhD students are responsible for the content of their work. The students are informed about the checks on their research results. KNUTE uses the UNICHECK, CompareSuite, 'Plagiarism' and 'Anti-plagiat' programmes to check the thesis for plagiarism.<sup>36</sup> Members of specialized academic councils and those responsible for scientific work are taught to detect plagiarism by specialized training.

---

<sup>33</sup> Annex 5 of the SAR.

<sup>34</sup> Regulation on training of PhD and doctoral students.

<sup>35</sup> Annex 9 of the SAR.

<sup>36</sup> SAR p. 16

The PhD student has the right to appeal the examination results of any discipline from the educational component list of the Cycle 3 programme,<sup>37</sup> as well as the certification at the Academic Department. All PhD students have equal rights and free access to KNUTE resources.

### Area 3-2: The doctorate offers diverse teaching and organizes supplementary events

Cycle 3 programme teaching activities are well-organized and students are able to choose several educational components. There is a wide range of supplementary events in which PhD students can take part, but it is difficult for them to participate in scientific events abroad.

The educational component of the Cycle 3 programme consists of 60 credit points (ECTS).<sup>38</sup> One credit formally corresponds to 30 hours. The 60 ECTS are subdivided into 42 ECTS of mandatory educational components, 15 ECTS of elective educational components and 3 ECTS of teaching internship. The mandatory component includes "Foreign Language", "Philosophical Worldview of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century", "Research Methodology", "Bibliography", "Proofreading and Editing of Scientific Texts", "Modern Economic Theories", "Professional Foreign Language", "Macroeconomic and Microeconomic Analysis (scientific workshop)", "System Analysis of Economic Processes (scientific workshop)". The elective educational component allows PhD students to choose four subjects from the list. It includes 1.1. component - "Mathematical Modelling in Scientific Studies" or "Statistical Methods of Analysis and Forecasting", 1.2. - "Public Speaking" or "Tertiary Teaching", 2.1. - "Information Technologies in Scientific Studies" or "Intellectual Property Commercialization", 2.2 - "International Statistics" or "Legal Support for Research".

The Cycle 3 programme provides 120 ECTS for the research component (writing the thesis). The educational component relates to the thesis content directly and carries out the supplementary function. For instance, mandatory educational components can enrich PhD students' research with important scientific units.

KNUTE organizes open lectures, conferences, round tables, workshops and training courses with representatives of business or well-known worldwide scientists and lecturers. Participation of PhD students in such events is recommended for the purpose of the approval of thesis research results. Publication of abstracts for PhD students is free of charge.

PhD students are satisfied with the programme but regret that there is too little opportunity to participate in scientific events abroad. Even if these limits are only partially dependent on KNUTE, there are improvements to be sought in order to facilitate this participation.

### Area 3-3: The doctorate is based on explicit rules for thesis duration and defense

The committee considers the rules for thesis duration and defense at KNUTE Cycle 3 programme to be highly legible and executed to an excellent level that is compliant with high educational standards.

The normative duration for the KNUTE Cycle 3 programme is four years, but PhD students have the right to defend their thesis earlier if they fulfill both educational and research programme components. As was mentioned above, the PhD programme requirements are clearly described in the PhD Student Handbook<sup>39</sup>. The PhD student can be expelled for reasons such as a transfer to another educational institution, non-fulfilment of the curriculum, non-renewal after the end of academic leave, violation of KNUTE regulations, etc. Expelled PhD students must reimburse the scholarship if they were enrolled on the Cycle 3 programme at the expense of the State budget.

In case of successful fulfilment of the educational and scientific components of the Cycle 3 programme, PhD students are allowed to defend the thesis in front of a Specialized Academic Council. Meanwhile, there is a strict mechanism of thesis evaluation before the defense. First, the supervisor and follow-up committee evaluate the completeness of the thesis. Then, the head of the Academic Department organizes a public discussion of the thesis (only for members of Department). After that, there is an interdepartmental meeting with members of other departments. Only after successful public discussions can the thesis be given to the

<sup>37</sup> Annex 2 of the SAR.

<sup>38</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>39</sup> Annex 9 of the SAR.

Specialized Academic Council that appoints the external experts. The duration between the approval of thesis completeness and the defense is a minimum of 2 months. The commission of internal experts is made up of members of the Specialized Academic Council. They examine the completeness of thesis, its scientific level and check the number and content of published materials. The Specialized Academic Council appoints official opponents, approves the circulation list and allows the synopsis to be printed.

The detailed procedure for admitting a thesis for defense are described in the Regulation on the PhD and Doctoral Student Attestation Procedure at KNUTE. Members of the Specialized Academic Council mentioned that the greatest attention is given to scientific novelty and approval of the thesis results. Public defense of the thesis takes place at a meeting of the Specialized Academic Council.

The committee considers that the thesis duration and defense rules of the Cycle 3 programme are highly legible and executed to an excellent level that is compliant with high educational standards. However, openness (outside KNUTE and abroad) could be improved during the years of preparation of the thesis and at the time of the process leading to its defense. The committee encourages the Cycle 3 programme to pursue the same high standards and to look for improvements in enhancing national and international openness.

## AREA 4 – INTEGRATION OF DOCTORS INTO THE JOB MARKET

### Area 4-1: The doctorate includes mechanisms to promote the integration of doctors into the job market

KNUTE cooperates with different local and national organizations in various areas in order to strengthen student development and broaden connections between the job market and the university.

The doctorate has partnerships with legal institutions (some State committees and government research establishments) to integrate doctors into scientific or teaching duties. All these needs are covered by the arrangements between partners. Some private companies participate in lectures during the University Open Day or during the Career Day to present themselves, but this is not specially focused on future doctors. Some companies are ready to pay a special budget to KNUTE and to have their own doctors, but not in the near future.

There are some relations between private business and the doctorate in that PhD students conduct their researches and draw their conclusions with data from the company. The private company can then use these conclusions in everyday work.

International partnerships for careers integration of doctors were not mentioned in the self-assessment report or during the visit.

The information of doctoral students about requirements and conditions for accessing all potential positions is disseminated within scientific departments at KNUTE by future tutors or via the KNUTE website.

There are no special tools to evaluate the skills acquired by doctors. All evaluations are made during exams and finally when the PhD diploma is obtained. It is therefore the decision of the KNUTE Scientific Council which grants the final evaluation or not.

### Area 4-2: The doctorate has effective monitoring of the integration of doctors into the job market

KNUTE has an effective tool for monitoring PhD student employment and development. Interaction between the university and graduates is to a high level.

The choice to be a PhD student is generally made because the students want to continue their scientific or teaching careers (for 80% at KNUTE). PhD students mention that the Cycle 3 degree increases their salaries and gives them a higher scientific standing in Ukraine.<sup>40</sup>

---

<sup>40</sup> Information given during the visit.

The KNUTE Careers Development Center has the task of monitoring the employment of its graduates and then attracting them to different activities conducted by the university. The Center provides research and compiles statistics about the employment of PhD students. The survey determines the proportion of graduates employed in educational institutions, private and State-owned companies.

Moreover, every student who obtains the KNUTE diploma automatically becomes a member of the KNUTE alumni association. There is an Association database with addresses, phone numbers and e-mails of graduates.

### Area 4-3: The data collected is analyzed, communicated and used

KNUTE collects information on the job market and communicates it to members involved in the programme, as well as to students.

Since 2017, an annual survey has been conducted with KNUTE's business partners on their assessment of KNUTE Cycle 3 programme efficiency. They have to answer questions on any PhD graduates they might have in their staff, a possible need for PhD graduates in their socio-economic sector, their companies' involvement in the programme, cooperation in training and research activities, the positive and negative aspects of the programme.<sup>41</sup>

The results of these surveys are communicated at different levels in the university and the information collected via this survey is useful to improve the programme.

When planning their careers, PhD students can also consult the large amount of data at the Careers Development Center.

---

## V. CONCLUSION

### PAST ACHIEVEMENTS

KNUTE launched its Cycle 3 programme in Economics in 1966, twenty years after the creation of the university. This programme has undergone several transformations over time. The last transformation, in 2015, coincided with an institutional transformation of the university, with the integration of the Cycle 3 programme into the Bologna process framework.

Since then, KNUTE has seen a decline in both the number of applicants, students recruited and graduates, followed by a slight recovery recently. PhD students follow a four-year programme mainly consisting in its educational component in the first two years and its scientific component in the last two years. The first component consists of courses on various aspects of economic science, foreign languages and research training. The second component aims to enable PhD students to conduct their scientific research. Most of the students who have so far completed the programme and graduated have gone on to work in the academic world.

### TODAY'S CHALLENGES

An important challenge is to offer an attractive programme to applicants. The sustainability of the programme depends on its ability to attract PhD students choosing KNUTE to carry out their project. To do this, KNUTE must be able to continue to offer a strict training programme, allowing PhD students to familiarize themselves with the different dimensions of contemporary economic analysis and to benefit from a framework to carry out their research that puts it on a level that conforms to international standards.

---

<sup>41</sup> Annex 4 of the SAR.

This alignment with international standards presupposes that students can emerge from a certain form of isolation. For this to happen, those who aim for a career at the University or in other academic institutions must be able to embark on thesis topics of interest beyond local, or even national, concerns. In the course of their training, they may benefit from visits abroad. And in a context where not all graduates will automatically find a place in economic circles, industry, in the broad sense, must offer real opportunities for integration in the labor market.

## FUTURE OUTLOOK

By submitting its Cycle 3 programme in Economics for an international evaluation, KNUTE wants to take advantage of the opportunity to make it evolve towards excellence. The strengthening of internationalization is an essential dimension of the future outlook. KNUTE is already considering launching joint doctorates and double-diploma programmes. KNUTE also wants to improve the quality of the educational and research components of the programme, and to increase the level of educational and scientific activities.

The national regulatory environment limits KNUTE's opportunities but several improvements are possible. In the educational component of the programme, an increasing part of courses should be delivered by foreign academics on mobility. The participation of PhD students at conferences or other scientific events abroad should be facilitated. The publication of the first results of a PhD student or graduate's research in recognized international reviews should be preferred to articles in local journals. At the time of the defense of the thesis, the presence of foreign academics as reviewers or members of the board of examiners should be systematized. The committee's visit showed that people involved at different levels in the Cycle 3 programme in Economics were aware of these possible avenues of improvement, although some measures are not easy to implement for historic, regulatory or financial reasons.

## STRENGTHS:

- The university premises and administrative, scientific and teaching staff provide a good framework for PhD preparation.
- The path leading from enrolment of students to the defense of the thesis is clearly established.
- The educational programme completes the knowledge already acquired by students in Economics in several ways.
- The thesis supervision of PhD students is well organized.
- Graduates find academic opportunities and business connections can lead to other jobs.
- KNUTE is willing to integrate its development strategy into an international framework.
- The students and teaching staff are motivated.
- KNUTE shows a genuine interest in quality assurance.

## WEAKNESSES:

- The number of PhD students and graduates has declined considerably in recent years.
- The international mobility of PhD students is low.
- For the moment, most theses are on topics that are of little value abroad.
- By State regulations, the thesis can be written only in Ukrainian so PhD students are not recognized by the international scientific community.
- The general environment, more precisely the political situation of Ukraine, is likely to deter foreign candidates.
- There is no database for PhD students to simplify the search for external experts, specific job positions, etc.

## RECOMMENDATIONS:

- The choice of thesis topics, participation in scientific events, mobilization of economists involved in the defense of the thesis and selection of reviews for pre- and post-thesis publications should systematically take the international perspective into account.
- The PhD student international mobility support mechanism needs improvement.
- The existing partnership agreements with foreign universities should be developed at doctoral level and additional partnerships could be considered.
- The curriculum (in other words, the educational component of the Cycle 3 programme) should be reviewed in order to minimize and specify the list of subjects.
- Interaction between the university and companies should be strengthened.

## VI. COMMENTS OF THE INSTITUTION

The evaluation reports of Hcéres  
are available online : [www.hceres.com](http://www.hceres.com)

**Evaluation of clusters of higher education and research institutions**  
**Evaluation of higher education and research institutions**  
**Evaluation of research**  
**Evaluation of doctoral schools**  
**Evaluation of programmes**  
**International evaluation and accreditation**



2 rue Albert Einstein  
75013 Paris, France  
T. 33 (0)1 55 55 60 10

[hceres.com](http://hceres.com)

[@Hceres\\_](https://twitter.com/Hceres_)

[Hcéres](https://www.youtube.com/Hceres)