



International evaluation and accreditation

EVALUATION REPORT

**Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of
Economics (KhNUE), Ukraine**

Economics PhD Programme

June 2019



Within the framework of the Erasmus+ programme "Promoting internationalization of research through establishment and operationalization of Cycle 3 Quality Assurance System in line with the European Integration Agenda" (C3QA), Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics (KhNUE), Ukraine, has mandated Hcéres to perform its Economics PhD Programme evaluation. The evaluation is based on the "External Evaluation Standards for doctorates out of France", adopted by the Hcéres Board on March 26, 2018. These standards are available on the Hcéres website (hceres.fr).

For the Hcéres¹ :

Michel Cosnard, President

On behalf of the experts committee² :

Gilles Jacoud, President of the committee

In accordance with the decree n° 2014-1365, November 14th, 2014:

¹ The president of Hcéres "contresigne les rapports d'évaluation établis par les comités d'experts et signés par leur président." (Article 8, alinea 5) – "countersigns the assessment reports made by the experts' committees and signed by their president" (article 8, alinea 5)

² The evaluation reports "sont signés par le président du comité". (Article 11, alinea 2) – "are signed by the president of the committee" (article 11, alinea 2)

CONTENTS

I. National context and Institution identity sheet

| | |
|--|---|
| General context and Higher education..... | 3 |
| Institution..... | 6 |
| Methods and results of the previous accreditation(s)..... | 6 |
| Student population : evolution and typology over the last 4 years..... | 6 |

II. Evaluation procedure

| | |
|--|---|
| History of the request for evaluation and accreditation..... | 7 |
| Composition of the committee..... | 8 |
| On site visit description..... | 8 |

III. Presentation of the study programme

| | |
|---|---------------------------------------|
| 1 – Presentation of the study programme..... | 11 |
| 2 - Presentation of the programme's self-evaluation approach..... | 1 Error! Bookmark not defined. |

IV. Evaluation report

| | |
|--|---------------------------------------|
| AREA 1 – THE POSITIONING OF THE DOCTORATE..... | 13 |
| Area 1-1: The doctorate's distinct features and objectives are clearly defined..... | 13 |
| Area 1-2: The positioning of the doctorate is consistent with its environment..... | 1 Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| AREA 2 – ORGANIZATION AND MANAGEMENT OF THE DOCTORATE..... | 15 |
| Area 2-1: Effective organization and management is in place for the doctorate..... | 15 |
| Area 2-2: There is an explicit policy for recruiting and funding doctoral students, which is adapted to the PhD programme..... | 16 |
| AREA 3 – SUPERVISION AND TRAINING FOR DOCTORAL STUDENTS..... | 16 |
| Area 3-1: The doctorate applies a strict doctoral student supervision and follow-up policy..... | 16 |
| Area 3-2: The doctorate offers diverse teaching and organizes supplementary events..... | 17 |
| Area 3-3: The doctorate is based on explicit rules for thesis duration and defense..... | 18 |
| AREA 4 – INTEGRATION OF DOCTORS INTO THE JOB MARKET..... | 19 |
| Area 4-1: The doctorate includes mechanisms to promote the integration of doctors into the job market..... | 19 |
| Area 4-2: The doctorate has effective monitoring of the integration of doctors into the job market..... | 20 |
| Area 4-3: The data collected is analyzed, communicated and used..... | 20 |

V. Conclusion

| | |
|-----------------------------|----|
| Past achievements:..... | 21 |
| Today's challenges:..... | 21 |
| Outlook to the future:..... | 21 |
| Strengths:..... | 21 |
| Weaknesses:..... | 22 |
| Recommendations:..... | 22 |

VI. Comments of the institution

I. NATIONAL CONTEXT AND INSTITUTION IDENTITY SHEET

GENERAL CONTEXT AND HIGHER EDUCATION

Ukraine is a country in Eastern Europe. Its capital and largest city is Kiev and the second largest city is Kharkiv. "Ukraine is a developing country and ranks 88th on the Human Development Index. As of 2018, Ukraine has the second lowest GDP per capita in Europe (\$3,133). At US\$40, it has the lowest median wealth per adult in the world (real estate not counted, but many Ukrainians possess real estate). It also suffers from a high poverty rate. However, because of its extensive fertile farmlands, Ukraine is one of the world's largest grain exporters. Ukraine also maintains the second-largest military in Europe after that of Russia."¹

In 2018, the Ukrainian higher education system had more than 800 institutions and a thousand subsidiaries in provincial cities. These institutions are divided into 4 "accreditation levels" (*riveni akreditatsii*). Indeed, since the Education Act of 1996, higher education institutions have been differentiated as follows: level 1 and 2 for technical higher education institutions (*technikum, colleges...*); level 3 for institutes and level 4 for universities and academies. Level 4 delivers the following training and diplomas: *Bakalavr, Specialist or Magistrate, Science candidate, Doctor of Science*².

Of the nearly 350 level 3-4 establishments, 65% are public (more than 110 have "national" status, a label granted by presidential decree), 4% are municipal and 31% private³.

In parallel with the public higher education system, an alternative private higher education system has developed since the 1990s: more than a hundred private institutions at levels 3-4 offer training, mainly in management, marketing, international law and finance.

Ukraine is one of the last countries in continental Europe to join the Bologna Process (May 2005); it has continued to implement the European Credits Transfer System (ECTS) modules and the generalisation of the *Bakalavr / Magistr / Kandidat* division.

Despite a very demanding academic tradition, the level of schools and universities remains heterogeneous, mainly because of the low attractiveness of the teaching profession.

With 4.6% of its students enrolled in degree mobility abroad in 2016, Ukraine is particularly international-oriented. In 2016, Ukraine received 54,144 international students, a number that is increasing from year to year. Ukraine is a dynamic partner of the Erasmus+ programme, particularly in its exchanges with France⁴.

Germany, the 3rd destination country for Ukrainian students, has developed its attractiveness thanks to the active presence of *Deutscher Akademischer Austauschdienst* (DAAD) in Ukraine and a network of readers in 16 cities. In addition, Germany provides approximately 2,000 scholarships to Ukrainian students. France, the seventh host country, attracted 1,822 Ukrainian students in 2017-2018, an increase over five years⁵. As the average Ukrainian salary is among the lowest in Europe, the cost of studying abroad and the availability of scholarships are decisive factors in the implementation of a mobility stay abroad project.

There are two university entrance exams, one giving access to free studies, the other to paid studies (and logically less difficult), which results in disparities in level which can be significant in some institutions. But paying students contribute on average (but there are significant differences from one discipline to another or from one institution to another) to 50% of the budget of Ukrainian institutions⁶.

In general, in Ukraine, universities are higher education institutions with a wide range of scientific activities offering a wide range of study programmes in the natural, social, technical and economic sciences, as well as in the field of culture or the arts. In Ukraine, there are classical and specialized universities: technical, technological, medical, agrarian, cultural and arts universities. As a general rule, academies offer studies in the concrete field of science, production or teaching.

¹ <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ukraine>.

² Fiche Curie Ukraine, p. 1. https://www.diplomatie.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/UKRAINE_Fiche_Curie_13_11_03_cle87f327.pdf, p. 8.

³ Focus Pays Ukraine, n° 26, mars 2019, Campus France, p. 3.

⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 5.

⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 6.

⁶ Fiche Curie Ukraine, *op. cit.*, p. 8.

Ukraine is still a bit divided between its Soviet academic heritage and the desire to renew its higher education system in order to achieve greater integration into the European Higher Education Area, of which it has been a member since 2005.

In doctoral studies, there are also two categories of students in Ukraine, those who are admitted on the quota of places known as "on budget" (taken care of by the State) who do not pay for their schooling and those who pay for their schooling and return "on contract". The allocation of budget places by discipline and institution is the prerogative of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine (hereinafter MESU).

At the end of 2017, there were just over 30,000 doctoral students.

There are two stages in the organization of doctoral studies, that of thesis writing and defense, which is largely the responsibility of the Universities and laboratories of the Academy of Sciences (and their Scientific Councils), and that of the validation and award of the diploma under the so-called "executive attestation" department of the Ministry which manages the administrative processing. An expert council then issues an opinion on the scientific quality of the thesis defended and a college of attestation actually awards the diploma.

It exists two types of training and diplomas at level 8 (UNESCO): the PhD and the Doctorate of Sciences; the latter is different from a doctorate in French sciences and can be compared to the authorization to direct research (*habilitation à diriger des recherches*, in French⁷), the purpose of which it shares.

The table below provides a better understanding of each of the two systems.

PhD and Doctoral Students Preparation⁸

| | "Doctor of Philosophy" | "Doctor of Sciences" |
|---------------------------|---|---|
| Study Mode | Full-time (day, evening); part-time | Full-time (day) |
| General Information | It is both an educational and the first academic degree that is acquired at the third level of higher education on the basis of a Master's degree. The Doctor of Philosophy degree is awarded by a specialized academic board of a higher education institution or a research institute as a result of the successful completion of a relevant educational and scientific programme by a student and public defense of a thesis in a specialized academic board. | This is the second academic degree obtained by a person on the basis of the Doctor of Philosophy degree. It involves gaining the highest competences in the field of development and implementation of research methodology, conducting individual research, obtaining scientific results that solve important theoretical or applied problems, have a national or international significance and are published in scientific journals. |
| Duration | Four years | Two years |
| Students' Training | The state order for the training of PhD students majoring in different specialties is distributed on a competitive basis among higher education institutions and research institutes. In case the higher education institutions and research institutes have a license for providing the third level educational services in the corresponding specialty at the moment of the competition, they are allowed to apply for the state order. The number of self-funded students and the training cost are determined by the Academic Council of the University, taking into account the number specified in the university license, under which it carries out the third level educational services, the possibilities of providing qualified research supervision and meeting the educational needs of students in the corresponding specialty. Under educational programme. Curriculum. | The state order for the training of doctoral students majoring in different specialties is distributed on a competitive basis among higher education institutions and research institutes with specialized academic boards in the corresponding specialties. Information about the distribution of the state order is published on the official website of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine and on the websites of higher education institutions and research institutes that received a state order for the training doctoral students. Academic programme. |
| Work plans | Individual curriculum. Individual research plan. | Individual research plan. |
| Students Responsibilities | To acquire theoretical knowledge, skills and other competences to generate new ideas, to solve complex problems in the field of professional, research and innovation | To defend in a specialized academic board the scientific achievements results in the form of a thesis, or a published monograph, or a scientific report based on the articles published in national and international peer-reviewed journals, |

⁷ It means a degree above the doctorate, necessary to obtain to become a « university professor » (full professor) in France.

⁸ This table was provided by the Kyiv National University of Trade and Economics.

| | | |
|------------------------------------|--|--|
| | <p>activities, to master the methodology of scientific and pedagogical activities, as well as to conduct individual scientific research, containing a scientific novelty, theoretical and practical value, and to defend the thesis.</p> | <p>the list of which is approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine. The thesis (monograph, scientific articles) of the doctoral student must contain independent conclusions related to the significant scientific problem (groups of problems) within one or several fields of knowledge. They shall provide the solution of an important theoretical or practical problem, have a national or international value, and be credible and practically tested.</p> |
| Educational Component | <p>The curriculum contains information on the list and number of disciplines (60 ECTS credits), the order of disciplines, types of classes and their number, the curriculum schedule, the forms of current and final control.</p> <p>The individual curriculum of the student contains a list of optional disciplines not less than 25 percent of the total number of ECTS credits. Besides, students have the right to choose the disciplines provided at other cycles of higher education but related to the thesis subject. It shall be approved by a research supervisor, the head of the department and the dean of the corresponding faculty.</p> <p>The student has the right to change his individual curriculum with the approval of the research supervisor in the order confirmed by the Academic Council.</p> <p>Both full and part-time students are required to attend classes and undergo all forms of current and final control envisaged by the student's individual curriculum, educational and scientific programme.</p> | No |
| Educational and Research Component | <p>Educational component includes at least four components that provide such competences in accordance with the National Qualifications Framework:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - obtaining profound knowledge of the specialty (the group of specialties) of the research, in particular understanding basic concepts, theoretical and practical problems, history of development and the current state of scientific fundamentals, mastering the terminology of the research subject; - mastering the general scientific (philosophical) competences, aimed at forming a systemic scientific outlook, professional ethics and general cultural outlook; - acquiring universal skills of the researcher, in particular oral and written presentation of the results of the scientific research in the Ukrainian language, using modern information technologies, organizing and conducting training sessions, managing scientific projects and / or making proposals for research funding, registering intellectual property rights; - obtaining the linguistic competences sufficient for presentation and discussion of the results of their scientific work in a foreign language (in English or another one according to the specialty characteristics) in oral and written form, as well as for a full understanding of foreign scientific texts in the corresponding specialty. <p>Scientific component. Conducting the individual scientific research under the supervision of one or two research supervisors and summarizing the results in the form of a thesis.</p> <p>The dissertation for obtaining the Doctor of Philosophy degree is an individual research offering the solution of the significant</p> | <p>Scientific programme. Conducting an individual research in the form of a manuscript or a published monograph. A thesis prepared for defense shall contain scientifically grounded theoretical or experimental results, scientific statements, shall be integral and coherent and reflect doctoral student's personal contribution.</p> <p>Theses (scientific reports), having no plagiarism, can be defended.</p> |

| | | |
|-------------------------|---|--|
| | scientific problem in one or several fields of knowledge. Its results shall constitute the original contribution to the relevant field of knowledge and be published in relevant journals. Theses, having no plagiarism, can be defended. | |
| Attestation of Students | Attestation of PhD students is carried out by a permanent or ad hoc specialized academic board on the basis of public defense of scientific achievements in the form of a thesis. A thesis supervisor (or two supervisors) shall approve the thesis to be defended. A compulsory condition for defense is the successful completion of a student's individual curriculum. | Attestation of doctoral students is carried out by a permanent specialized academic board in the corresponding specialty of the students' university. If there is no specialized academic board in the corresponding specialty at the students' university, a permanent specialized academic board in the corresponding specialty of another higher education institution (research institute) may attest and award the doctoral degree at the request of the university, which trained the doctoral student, or at the request of a doctoral student. |

INSTITUTION

1. University: Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics (hereafter **KhNUE**)
2. Programme's title: PhD Programme
3. Training/speciality: Economics
4. Site(s) where the programme is taught (Town and campus): Nauky Ave, 9A, Kharkiv, Kharkivs'ka oblast, Ukraine, 61000
5. Programme director: Galina NAZAROVA, Head of PhD programme Economics,

METHODS AND RESULTS OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION(S)

6. Methodology and agency: Accreditation Organization of Ukraine (MESU)
7. Results: Programme validated for four years for cohorts commencing 2016

STUDENT POPULATION: EVOLUTION AND TYPOLOGY OVER THE LAST 4 YEARS

Statistics of doctoral students training in KhNUE for the period 2012-2018⁹

| | 2012 | 2013 | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 | 2018 |
|--|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|
| Number of students enrolled in graduate school | 39 | 42 | 33 | 26 | 30 | 24 | 16 |
| % Women | 66,7 | 69 | 75,8 | 57,7 | 68 | 58,3 | 68,7 |
| % Men | 16,3 | 12,2 | 31,8 | 22,2 | 33,3 | 27,6 | 45 |
| State funding | 38 | 42 | 30 | 25 | 25 | 20 | 15 |

Dynamics of success of graduates for the period of 2012-2018¹⁰

| | 2012 | 2013 | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 | 2018 |
|--|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|
| Number of enrolled doctoral students | | | | | | | |
| Right after graduating from the master's degree (6 or 8 months), never working | 0 | 0 | 1 | 2 | 4 | 3 | 2 |
| After work at the university | 6 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 3 | 6 | 5 |
| After work outside the university | 20 | 17 | 18 | 18 | 18 | 10 | 7 |

⁹ Self-evaluation report (SER hereinafter), p. 48.

¹⁰ SER, p. 55.

Distribution of degrees of Doctor of Philosophy and Doctor of Science in Economic Sciences in KhNUE for the period of 2014-2018¹¹

| | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 | 2018 |
|---|------|------|------|------|------|
| Total number of degrees Candidate of Science (PhD) awarded in Economics Sciences (MALE) | 5 | 6 | 8 | 3 | 2 |
| Total number of degrees Candidate of Science (PhD) awarded in Economics Sciences (FEMALE) | 21 | 15 | 20 | 14 | 15 |
| Total number of degrees Doctor of Science (PhD) awarded in Economics Sciences (MALE) | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| Total number of degrees Doctor of Science (PhD) awarded in Economics Sciences (FEMALE) | 1 | 2 | 4 | 0 | 0 |

II. EVALUATION PROCEDURE

HISTORY OF THE REQUEST FOR EVALUATION AND ACCREDITATION

Two Ukrainian universities — KhNUE and Kyiv National University of Trade and Economics (KNUTE) — are partners in a European programme with Erasmus+ funding, launched in 2016 and led by the French University in Armenia. The Erasmus+ programme is called "Promoting internationalization of research through establishment and operationalization of Cycle 3 Quality Assurance System in line with the European Integration Agenda" (C3QA). This programme aims to improve the PhD level programmes of four countries: Armenia, Kazakhstan, Mongolia and Ukraine. In addition to universities, evaluation agencies and ministries of these four countries, the European project also involves France (Lyon III University, the University of Clermont-Auvergne and Hcéres), Spain (Alcala University) and Poland.

The final phase of this project is to conduct pilot evaluations and it is in this context that KhNUE and also KNUTE were evaluated by a panel of experts selected among the partners of the European project, to which was added a high-level expert in the scientific discipline (economics), Professor Gilles Jacoud from the University of Saint-Étienne, who also has experience in evaluation and accreditation procedures.

After the evaluation, the two universities — KhNUE and KNUTE — also wished to apply for accreditation of their PhD programme in economics by Hcéres.

COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE

- Mr. Gilles Jacoud, Dr., Full Professor of Economics, University of Saint-Étienne, (Subject-specific Expert), France, chair of the committee;
- Mr. Mkrtich Ayvazyan, Dr., Vice-Rector for Education and Research at Yerevan State Academy of Fine Arts (SAFAA) (General Academic Expert), Armenia;
- Ms. Tsogtsuren Bayasgalan, Doctor in public administration, Mongolian National Council for Education Accreditation (MNCEA) (Representative from QA agency), Mongolia;
- Mr. Sergei Glazunov, CEO of Smart Energy LLC oil & gas business division, (professional, representative of the socio-economic sector), Ukraine;
- Ms. Darina Momot, PhD Student in Financial and economic security of investment strategies on art market (O. Bekefov National University of Urban Economy in Kharkiv), Ukraine;

¹¹ SER, p. 44.

- Mr. François Pernot (Hcéres), Dr., Full Professor in History, Paris-Seine University and Director of the Europe and International Department of the High Council for Evaluation of Research and Higher Education (Hcéres), (General Academic Expert who accompanied also the committee as science advisor at the Hcéres), France

ON SITE VISIT DESCRIPTION

The committee, together with the Hcéres representative, visited KhNUE from April 15 to 16, 2019.

The first three interview sessions were plenary sessions attended by all committee members; for subsequent sessions, the group of six experts was divided into two groups of three persons conducting parallel sessions, the distribution of experts having been previously organized according to the themes to be addressed.

| Time | Interviewed | Name and Position |
|--------------------------|---|---|
| MONDAY 15th APRIL | | |
| 8h00 – 8h30 | Briefing (committee only) | |
| 8h30 - 9h30 | Rector of KhNUE (presentation of the institution, and doctoral issues) | Volodymyr Ponomarenko – Rector of KhNUE, Volodymyr Yermachenko – Vice-rector on Scientific and Pedagogical Work; |
| 9h30 - 10h30 | Responsible for the programme (presentation of the doctoral programme) | Galyna Nazarova – Director of the Cycle 3 programme "Economics", Head of Department of Economics and Social Sciences |
| 10h30 - 11h30 | Responsible from postgraduate and doctoral department | Svitlana Nazarova – Head of Department of Postgraduate and Doctoral Education |
| | Responsible from research department | Iryna Lytovchenko - Head of the Research department |
| 11h30 - 12 h 30 | Panel of supervisors | Galyna Nazarova – Head of the Cycle 3 programme "Economics", Head of Department of Economics and Social Sciences; Lyudmyla Malyarets – Head of Higher Mathematics, Economic and Mathematical Methods Department; Olena Rayevnyeva – Head of Department of Economic Theory, Statistics and Forecasting; Oleksii Naidenko – Associate Professor of Department of Customs Affairs and Taxation |
| | Panel of research partners | Mykola Kyzym – Doctor of Science, Corresponding Member of National Academy of Science of Ukraine, Director of Research Centre of Industrial Problems of Development of National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine; Volikov Vladymyr - Associate Professor, Scientific Secretary of North - Eastern Scientific Center of Development of National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine and Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine |
| 12h30-14h00 | Lunch and discussion | |
| 14h - 15h | Panel of public/private organizations involved in the programme | Oleksii Cherkasskyi - First Deputy General Director of JSC "Turboatom" |
| | Representatives of QA and innovative development | Hanna Polyakova - Head of QA and Innovative Development Department, Hanna Bilokonenko - specialist of QA and Innovative Development Department |
| 15h - 16h | Representatives from Department of Career Development | Natalia Chebotaryova – Head of Department of Student Employment and Interaction with Business Structures; Irina Chepel – Head of Student Internship Department |

| | | |
|---------------------------|---|--|
| | Representatives from scientific schools | <p>Yurii Ivanov – Deputy Director for Scientific Work of Research Centre of Industrial Problems of Development of National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine, DSc, Professor;</p> <p>Olena Iastremska – Head of Department of Management, Logistics and Economics, DSc, Professor;</p> <p>Tamara Klebanova – Professor of Department of Economic Cybernetics, DSc, Professor;</p> <p>Oleksandr Pushkar – Head of Computer Systems and Technologies Department, DSc, Professor</p> |
| 16h - 16h30 | Break and discussion | |
| 16h30-17h30 | Representatives from partners institutions | <p>Onegina Victoria - Professor, Doctor of Science (Economic), Head of the Department of Economics and Marketing of Kharkiv Petro Vasylenko National Technical University of Agriculture;</p> <p>Yatsun Leonid - professor, assistant professor, Head of the department of foreign economic activity and tourism management of Kharkiv State University of Food Technology and Trade;</p> <p>Doronin Andriy - Professor, Doctor of Science (Economic), Head of the Department of Economics and Marketing of the National Aerospace University named after M. Y. Zhukovsky "Kharkiv Aviation Institute";</p> <p>Doroshenko Hanna - Professor, Doctor of Science (Economic), Head of the Department of Economics and management of V. N. Karazin Kharkiv National University</p> |
| | Representative from specialized scientific councils | <p>Oleksandr Pushkar – Deputy Head of Specialized Academic Council "Economics and Management";</p> <p>Olena Iastremska – Head of Specialized Academic Council "Social Economy and Policy", Member of Specialized Academic Council "Economics and Management";</p> <p>Olesya Lebid – Academic Secretary of Specialized Academic Council "Economics and Management";</p> <p>Iryna Chmutova – Member of Specialized Academic Council "Social Economy and Policy";</p> <p>Maryna Martynenko – Member of Specialized Academic Council "Social Economy and Policy";</p> <p>Andriy Pylypenko – Member of Specialized Academic Council "Social Economy and Policy"</p> |
| 17h30-18h30 | Meeting session of the committee only | |
| 18h30-19h00 | Visit of the campus | |
| TUESDAY 16th APRIL | | |
| 8h - 9h | Representatives of academic council | <p>Vasyl Otenko – Vice rector on Scientific and Pedagogical Work, Member of Academic Board;</p> <p>Oksana Pysarchuk – Academic Secretary, Secretary of Academic Board;</p> <p>Tetyana Lepeyko – Member of Academic Board;</p> <p>Maksym Serpukhov – Member of Academic Board;</p> <p>Tatyana Shtal – Member of Academic Board;</p> |
| | Representatives from Dpt of International Relations | <p>Iuliia Dobroskok – Head of Department of International Relations;</p> <p>Sergii Vasylyk – Specialist of Department of International Relations;</p> <p>Nadya Sergienko – Specialist of Department of International Relations;</p> <p>Ermolenko Aleksey - Deputy Dean of the Faculty of Training Foreign Citizens</p> |

| | | |
|-------------|--|--|
| 9h - 10h | Panel of PhD Students | Alina Demianenko, Tetiana Pliekhanova, Liudmyla Sabadash, Tarik Touzani |
| | Integrity and antiplagiarism Responsibles | Mykola Afanasiev – Vice rector on Scientific and Pedagogical Work; Oleksandr Pushkar – Head of Department of Computer Systems and Technologies; Olesya Lebid – Academic Secretary of Specialized Academic Council "Economics and Management"; Kolodiziev Oleh - Doctor of Science, Banking Department Head |
| 10h - 11h | Panel of PhD graduates | Alexey Dorovskoy – deputy general director of state enterprise “Plant named after V.O. Malyshev”, and Associate Professor of Department of Economics and Social Sciences at KhNUE; Kseniya Kotlyarevskaya – Compliance & Payroll Team Lead at SuninBev (Ukraine), ABinBev (international company); Vyacheslav Khvostenko – PhD, Director of LLC "AKILOG"; Andriy Kolos – PhD, Director of Department of Economics and International Relations at Kharkiv Regional State Administration; Olexander Popov – Associate Professor of Marketing department at National Aerospace University "KhAI" named by D. Zhukovsky |
| | Panel of teaching team | Lidiya Guryanova – Head of Department of Economic Cybernetics; Volodymyr Lypov – Professor of Department of International Economics and Foreign Economic Activities; Lyudmyla Malyarets – Head of Higher Mathematics, Economic and Mathematical Methods Department; Olena Rayevnyeva – Head of Department of Economic Theory, Statistics and Forecasting; Volodymir Ushkalov – Associate Professor of Department of Enterprise Economics and Management |
| 11h - 12h | Meeting session of the committee only | |
| 12h - 12h30 | WRAP-UP SESSION | |

On the last day of the on-site visit, the whole committee discussed with the Programme Director of the PhD program in Economics for clarifying the points that came to its attention during the two days of interviews and campus visits.

The committee acknowledges the efficient organization of the visit by KhNUE.

III. PRESENTATION OF THE PROGRAMME

1 – PRESENTATION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMME

KhNUE provides a full range of undergraduate and postgraduate educational programmes implementing multistage training, retraining and upgrading of qualification in many specialties in economics and business, management, public administration, informatics and cybernetics, computer sciences, publishing business and printing industry and tourism. It “provides a full range of educational services, carrying out multistage training, retraining and raising the level of experts’ skills in 15 specialties, such as Economics and Entrepreneurship, Management and Administration, Informatics and Computer Engineering, Publishing and Printing Business, Service and State Administration. The university has about 6,000 students (including 800 foreign students), 650 faculty members and offers training primarily structured around the new teaching architecture of higher education. There are 7 faculties, 35 departments, a Correspondence and Distance Learning Centre, Centre of

Post-Graduate education, specialized academic councils on defense of PhD theses and educational and scientific-research laboratories.

The University established a flexible system of quality management of the training of specialists, based on continuous monitoring of graduates' achievements. 9 MSc Double Diploma Programmes are established in KhNUE. Double Diploma Master Programme with University Lumière Lyon-2 (France) is implemented since 2005, has more than 220 graduates. KhNUE is an active member of IT-Ukraine association. Some pioneering on-going cooperation programmes include Microsoft IT-Academy operates since 2009, IBM Academic Centre 'Smarter Commerce' since 2012. Regional Inter-University Start-up Centre 'First Capital' was created in 2013 as a network for creativity, entrepreneur skills and student's innovative ideas development. In 2018 FABLAB was opened. The aims are developing an environment that stimulates engineering creativity, entrepreneurial activities and fosters youth employability via university-business-industry networking on 'FABLAB' platforms. An annual competition 'Kuznets start-up challenge' is held in KhNUE.

KhNUE boasts with 7 research schools:

- enterprise strategic management systems elaboration;
- problems of socio-economic development of regions;
- economic problems of fixed assets renewal and the innovative development of enterprises;
- development of analysis systems and early prevention of destabilizing of economic systems performance;
- scientific foundations of business entities taxation;
- organization of production and entrepreneurial activity;
- models and IT in management of development.

Currently the KhNUE research schools (200 researchers and 33 students) are engaged in 5 projects funded by the State (total amount 1 722 550 UAH).

To expand the international dialog in the fields of research the annual international scientific conference 'Economic development and heritage of Simon Kuznets' was conducted from 2017. 4 Scientific journals are supported research activities of KhNUE professors and young scientists."¹²

"KhNUE provides training of postgraduate students according to 'Guidance for Training Postgraduate and Postdoctoral Students at Higher Educational Establishments (Scientific Institutions)' adopted by the order of CMU of 23 March 2016 N°261.

The doctoral studies are conducted in accordance with the Legislation of Ukraine, Salzburg Principles, EU Principles for Innovative Doctoral Training. The doctoral educational programmes are developed in accordance with the Bologna principles, ECTS, the National Qualifications Framework and the European Qualifications Framework."¹³

In Ukraine, "the Doctor of Philosophy degree is an educational degree and, at the same time, the first academic degree obtained at the third level of higher education on the basis of a master's degree. The degree of Doctor of Philosophy is awarded by a special academic board as a result of the successful completion of the relevant educational and academic program by a higher education candidate and the public defense of the thesis work (doctoral dissertation) in the special academic council.

The KhNUE Cycle 3 programmes graduates' degree corresponds to third (Educational and Scientific) cycle of QF for EHEA; 8th qualification level of the EQF for LLL; 8th qualification level of the National Qualifications Frameworks of Ukraine. The definition of the KhNUE Cycle 3 programs learning outcomes is in line with the National Qualification Framework and is based on the ability to create new knowledge through research, development of research skills as well as professional skills required for career development, attitudes to the development and dissemination of scientific knowledge, social awareness of the relationship between knowledge development and its impact on the society."¹⁴

"KhNUE delivers post-graduate education in 11 PhD programmes:

011 Science Education.

¹² SER, p. 4.

¹³ *Ibid.*, p. 6.

¹⁴ *Ibid.*

051 Economics.
 056 International Economic Relations.
 071 Accounting and taxation.
 072 Finance, banking and insurance.
 073 Management;
 074 Public Management and Administration;
 075 Marketing.
 076 Business, trade and exchange activities.
 122 Computer Science and Information Technology.
 242 Tourism.

PhD programmes involve an educational component of 8 courses (+1 course for the foreign students) (40 ECTS credits), among them 4 courses (+1 course for the foreign students) are targeted towards the development of transferable competences. PhD cycle curriculum also includes 2 electives (10 ECTS credits). In addition to learning how to do researches at an international level, students should acquire a broad theoretical and methodological insight into the discipline of economics.

Promoting strong internationalization approach, KhNUE currently participates in 6 ERASMUS+ and 1 Horizon2020 projects.

Among them ERASMUS+ DocHub project aimed to create 5 regional DocHubs as national centers of excellence in PhD training, to institute Quality Assurance systems, to organize infrastructure and systems for training in advanced academic writing, to design and pilot transferable skills according to EC 'Principles for Innovative Doctoral Training' quality standards."¹⁵

2 – PRESENTATION OF PROGRAMME'S SELF-EVALUATION APPROACH

The PhD programme of the KhNUE has submitted a clearly organized self-evaluation report which follows the four-part structure of the Hcéres PhD evaluation framework:

Area 1 – The positioning of the doctorate;

Area 2 – Organization and management of the doctorate;

Area 3 – Supervision and training for doctoral students;

Area 4 – Integration of doctors into the job market.

Each of these four items has been concisely described on 25 pages backed by extensive appendices, providing additional information on individual points, often in form of tables. The self-evaluation report is accompanied by a SWOT analysis.

IV. EVALUATION REPORT

AREA 1 – THE POSITIONING OF THE DOCTORATE

Area 1-1: The doctorate's distinct features and objectives are clearly defined

The KhNUE Economics PhD programme aims at educating the next generation of leaders in Economics research and services in Ukraine.

The objectives of the KhNUE Economics PhD programme, as well as the other PhD programmes of KhNUE, are generally defined as improving “the quality of training of specialists to the level that will provide them with an opportunity to take a decent place in society and work successfully in a specialty for the development of a society based on a global knowledge economy”.¹⁶

¹⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 4-5.

¹⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 6.

The peculiar features and objectives of the Economics doctoral programme correspond to the KhNUE Strategic Development Plan for 2013-2020¹⁷ and the Main Provisions of the KhNUE 2020 Conceptual Development Framework,¹⁸ as well as to the university's research directions in the field of Economics¹⁹ and scientific schools operating at the university.²⁰

The aim of the programme is to give PhD students a deeper understanding of modern Economics and in-depth knowledge of the mechanisms of economics and business. Several stakeholders of the doctorate are interested in knowledge of these mechanisms, such as research centers, local and national authorities, business representatives, other Ukrainian or foreign Higher Education Institutions (HEI). The acquisition of this knowledge is achieved "through training in research methodology, tools and techniques of analysis, and opportunities to apply this in extended research".²¹

During its interviews, the committee of experts noted that all the interviewees expressed a desire to further develop research within the framework of the PhD in Economics and that the university's officials are counting on access to Scopus and WOS to boost this research. One weakness of the PhD programme is the lack of access to digital data and therefore the lack of opportunities to check information online.

Nevertheless, the objectives of the KhNUE Economics PhD programme are clearly defined in the self-evaluation report and are consistent with the information provided in interviews of university members during the visit.

Area 1-2: The positioning of the doctorate is consistent with its environment

The KhNUE Economics PhD programme is well integrated into the general KhNUE scientific and intellectual quality strategy, and totally integrated in the regional, national and even international socio-economic market, but the international aspect is to be developed.

The KhNUE Economics PhD programme is well integrated into the current general strategies of KhNUE, which are directed towards fostering scientific quality.

Doctorate activities are under the responsibility of two units at KhNUE: the Postgraduate and Doctoral Department and the Research Department. The former is responsible for management processes. The latter is responsible for the scientific part of research, such as "topics of research, their compliance with priority areas of development on regional and national levels, information on scientific events, such as conferences, seminars, round tables, etc."²²

The doctorate works with this Research Department and is also in connection with different scientific schools inside KhNUE and several institutions outside KhNUE. One is the Research Center for Industrial Development Problems of the Ukraine National Academy of Sciences, a State organization whose main objective is to conduct fundamental and applied research in various sub-disciplines of Economics. Another is the Institute for Economics and Forecasting of the Ukraine National Academy of Sciences, whose aim is to ensure the elaboration of strategic forecasts and socio-economic development programmes for Ukraine. There is also the National University of Kyiv-Mohyla Academy, an autonomous university, bilingual in Ukrainian and English, which takes part in numerous international university collaborations. Its cooperation with KhNUE is within the framework of the ERASMUS+ DocHub project to participate in the "Modeling of the Financial Market" optional course.

The self-evaluation report indicates²³ that in 2018, KhNUE researchers worked on two fundamental research projects with State funding for a total amount UAH 674,340²⁴ and on two applied research projects with State funding for a total amount UAH 748,210.²⁵ However, it does not specify to what extent PhD students were involved in this work. It also indicates that in the same year, young university scientists worked on a project with

¹⁷ <https://www.hneu.edu.ua/wp-content/uploads/2018/11/Strategic-Plan-HNEU-2013-2020-years-1.pdf>.

¹⁸ <https://www.hneu.edu.ua/en/wp-content/uploads/sites/3/2019/01/internationalization-strategy.pdf>.

¹⁹ <https://www.hneu.edu.ua/en/scientific-research-in-the-field-of-economics>.

²⁰ <https://www.hneu.edu.ua/en/scientific-schools-2>.

²¹ SER, p. 6.

²² *Ibid.*, p. 7.

²³ *Ibid.*, p. 8.

²⁴ €22,660.

²⁵ €25,150.

State funding for an amount UAH 300,000,²⁶ without specifying whether these young scientists were PhD students or to what extent PhD students were part of them.

PhD students nevertheless participate in various ways in the research work of KhNUE. From 2015 to 2019, 117 of them participated in research funded on the State budget of Ukraine and by contracts with companies.

Many events, such as workshops with invited guests, company visits, conferences or seminars with guests enable interactions with economic entities. For instance, 27 events of this kind were organized in 2018 with the participation of some main Ukrainian or foreign companies. There were also 7 operations allowing PhD students to explore career opportunities in a large company.

The PhD programme also has strong relationships with other universities, but in fact does not compete with them.

At international level, KhNUE asserts that "partnership with foreign higher educational, scientific and cultural institutions through deepening integration into the European and world educational space is one of the priority tasks"²⁷. The university has 37 agreements with HEIs from more than 30 countries around the world but the possibility for PhD students to actually benefit from these agreements is far from being certain.

In the self-evaluation report, as in all interviews, the expert committee noted that the internationalization of the PhD programme in Economics is one of KhNUE's priorities and that many activities have already been carried out. However, although the internationalization process is already well under way, KhNUE is only at the beginning of this process and must increase its efforts in this direction.

University officials are well aware of the need to internationalize training. One solution could also be to design PhD training as a continuation of the bachelor's and master's degrees and to rely on doctoral schools at partner universities (such as Lyon 2) to develop thesis co-directorships.

AREA 2 – ORGANIZATION AND MANAGEMENT OF THE DOCTORATE

Area 2-1: Effective organization and management is in place for the doctorate

Administrative support and scientific organization of the Economics PhD programme are good and satisfy all standards applied at European universities.

The organization of the doctorate is based on a set of links between different university entities.²⁸ The implementation of quality control and improvement processes involves teaching, scientific and administrative levels. An essential part of the organization is under the responsibility of the Postgraduate and Doctoral Department. A doctorate charter details the operating rules implemented by this department.²⁹

The content of the PhD educational programme and its possible developments are examined by working groups of academics, employers and PhD students. Its proposals need to be approved by the KhNUE Academic Council. The programme is reviewed annually to keep pace with changes in the environment.

PhD students benefit from various resources made available to them, among them laboratories, libraries or database access. They also benefit from an education programme that increasingly uses new technologies. Online courses are developed and many publications in Economics can be found online.

PhD applicants and students as well as stakeholders can easily access information on the organization and management of the doctorate on the KhNUE official website.³⁰ They can find there the regulatory framework for doctoral training, the admission rules, details on the study process or information on the training and scientific events.

PhD students have the opportunity to comment on the quality of the information they receive and of the educational programme. In order to improve the quality of the educational and scientific programmes, they

²⁶ €10,000.

²⁷ SER, p. 8.

²⁸ Annex 3 of the SER.

²⁹ Annex 4 of the SER.

³⁰ Section Science, subsection Postgraduate and doctoral studies.

are regularly asked to answer an anonymous questionnaire on their level of satisfaction or dissatisfaction.³¹ A first section contains questions on different criteria, a second one open questions. The survey is valuable to modify and improve the programme. A survey is also planned for employers on their expectations in terms of PhD student skills.

A system of strategic planning, monitoring and self-evaluation at all levels of KhNUE enables appropriate quality assurance of educational activity. The committee can infer that quality control is efficiently conducted at an excellent level.

To summarize, the academic and administrative organization of the KhNUE PhD Economics programme is very well established and executed to European and international standards.

Area 2-2: There is an explicit policy for recruiting and funding doctoral students, which is adapted to the PhD programme

The KhNUE Economics PhD programme recruitment procedure is well organized as far as it is regulated by the Ukrainian law.

The rules for the recruitment of PhD students in Economics are determined according to clearly established procedures in KhNUE in accordance with the conditions of admission established for higher educational establishments in Ukraine.

PhD students are enrolled after entrance exams consisting in an examination in a foreign language (unless they already have a level certified by an international test) and an exam on their specialty. Student results at entrance exams have an impact on their ability to obtain public funding. In fact, almost all PhD students in Economics are recruited on the basis of State funding and only a few of them finance themselves.³²

Upon arrival, PhD students sign a contract with the university that defines their mutual commitment. In the event of non-compliance with the contract on grounds of the student's behavior, he/she may be excluded. If he/she was studying on a State-funded basis, the PhD student may be required to reimburse the amounts already paid.

A PhD student is recruited for four years and the defense of the thesis usually takes place after these four years. From the first weeks of recruitment, the discussion and approval of the thesis subject are carried out. After that, an individual work plan is filled out. Each student then follows a clearly-established training plan.³³

Access to the PhD in Economics is well explained and the content of studies during the following four years is also well explained, but more and more students choose to leave after the master's degree to work rather than return for a doctorate. There is currently a decrease in the number of PhD students. This corresponds to the demographic curve of Ukraine, but it also corresponds to a decrease in postgraduate funding in Ukraine, and therefore to a decrease in the number of university positions.

KhNUE officials noted the difficulty of attracting good students and supervisors, particularly from abroad, the need to increase student and supervisor mobility and the problem of lack of money. Mobility is indeed very difficult for PhD students because they have to stay more than half a year abroad and many of these students have a family to support.

That is why the university officials have decided to develop Erasmus+ projects. The difficulty in Ukraine in finding good supervisors is related to the fact that salaries outside the university are higher than salaries inside the university, which discourages many researchers. One solution would be to recruit more professors coming from the professional sector to work part-time at the university.

AREA 3 – SUPERVISION AND TRAINING FOR DOCTORAL STUDENTS

³¹ Annex 14 of the SER.

³² Statistics of doctoral students training in KhNUE of the period 2012-2018, annex 7e of the SER.

³³ Annex 12 of the SER.

Area 3-1: The doctorate applies a strict doctoral student supervision and follow-up policy

Strict and precise rules are set out for supervision of the PhD programme in Economics. A supervisor's professional competence requires higher professional education.

Strict requirements for scientific supervisors of PhD programmes of KhNUE are certified by the Ministry for Higher Education. A research supervisor must meet the following requirements: a PhD degree in the relevant or related specialty and academic rank, rich scientific experience, scientific publications in Scopus or Web of Science scientometric databases, presence of a published monograph, textbook or educational manual, which is recommended by the MESU or academic council of the institution (during the last 5 years) by specialty or related specialty.

The average number of postgraduate students supervised by a university scientific supervisor is two. A scientific supervisor, as a rule, may carry out simultaneous scientific supervision (counselling) of no more than five applicants of scientific degrees. Postgraduate students are informed about the procedure for changing a scientific supervisor, if there is difference in views.

The organization and management mechanism of the PhD programme in Economics comprises a lot of levels.

The PhD Programme Working Group (2-3 leading specialists in their segment) develops a curriculum for a year, which must be checked for compliance with the standards of the MESU and approved by the Methodical Department. According to the curriculum, postgraduate students create an individual study plan, which must be approved and then checked twice a year (at the end of each semester) in the following sequence: by the scientific supervisor, by the Council of the Scientific School, by the Council of the Academic Department, by the Academic Council. The supervisor gets 50 hours per year for working with a postgraduate student and submits a report at the end of each semester to the Educational Department and the Department of Postgraduate and Doctoral Education. The Research Department is responsible for postgraduate students' participation in the scientific work of KhNUE. This means that postgraduate students are involved on a mandatory basis in working on projects commissioned by the State or private clients (if the research topic coincides with the order). The Careers Development Department is engaged in establishing communication between the students and business (holds round tables, meetings, job fairs twice a year).

The Department of Information and Statistics in the educational process (only six persons for monitoring the whole KhNUE) tracks student satisfaction by anonymous online surveys on the students' personal pages. The multilevel electronic assessment system accumulates feedback to track the trends and level of satisfaction per discipline at any point in time. In addition, the Department of Information and Statistics in educational process cooperates with the Student Youth Organization for additional surveys.

The University has created a database of the theses that have been defended by university applicants since 2000 (access available on the official website). It was established for postgraduate students who have just entered the programme and are choosing their thesis research topic and for those whose thesis research needs to be clarified. The above-mentioned database of theses and research papers also indexes and monitors the titles of the thesis, the abstracts of which are presented on the official website of the Vernadsky National Library of Ukraine.

Since 2016, in accordance with the requirements of the MESU, the University has published electronic versions of the thesis, the abstract, the official opponents' remarks submitted for defense on its site. Three months after the approval of the decision of the Specialized Academic Council by the Ministry of Education and Science, the materials may be removed from the site at the applicant's request.

The research papers are tested for matches with materials from the Internet, but such a check cannot guarantee a complete absence of plagiarism because many materials in the network do not contain full texts. Moreover, the proceedings are published in the book of proceedings beforehand, which increases the level of transparency and integrity among postgraduate students. In order to prevent plagiarism, an agreement has been signed between KhNUE and Lcc Plagiat giving them the right to use the anti-plagiarism system through the user interface.³⁴

There is a Code of Professional Ethics and Organizational Culture for academic workers and students, which declares tolerance, courtesy and appreciation to be integral parts of KhNUE values.

³⁴ Available on the Internet at StrikePlagiarism.com.

The Department of International Relations provides full support at all stages in the integration of foreign students to study at KhNUE: from providing residence in the hostel to consulting and warnings regarding the visa regime and other documents.

The committee is thus able to notice that the doctoral student supervision is clear and strictly organized.

Area 3-2: The doctorate offers diverse teaching and organizes supplementary events

A wide introduction of individualization of graduate students' training is carried out at the university. A variety of events organized by KhNUE enables students to enrich their academic and professional development. The integration of PhD students in international dynamics is, however, extremely weak.

The educational component of the PhD programme in Economics provides a wide range of activities (lectures, seminars, etc.). PhD students have free access to Scopus and Web of Science scientometric databases. The reading halls at the University Library are equipped with personal computers that provide such access. PhD students also use the electronic repository of the University Library, which includes the scientific and methodological literature developed by the university's scholars

Some of the PhD students are associate members of the Council of Young Scientists of KhNUE, the main tasks of which include counselling and helping students, postgraduate students, young scientists in creating favorable conditions for professional scientific research activities; supporting initiatives aimed at making young scientists interested in staying on to work at KhNUE; preparing and conducting conferences of young scientists and other scientific events. The authority of this Council includes: holding annual conferences of young scientists and scholars, submitting issues of improvement and promotion of young scientists' scientific activities (including the activities of postgraduate students) to the Academic Council of the University, nominating the young scientist candidates to receive state funding for scientific development.

Methodological recommendations for laboratory and practical classes have been developed. Teaching is carried out in the form of lectures, laboratory and practical classes, and through individual tasks under a lecturer's supervision. The distribution of classroom academic hours between lectures and practical classes (laboratory classes, seminars) within each of the disciplines is different and is on average about 40%/60% respectively.

A system of independent student work with the use of computer technology and corresponding software on the university's website has been introduced at KhNUE. The system includes personal educational systems in each discipline.

Other events attended by PhD students include: attending research thesis defenses, taking part in thematic seminars, attending lectures on the topics of thesis researches conducted by leading foreign scientists at the university.

The information (topics, time and duration, entry requirements, etc.) for all these and other events that are useful for PhD students is reported to them and published on the official website of the University.³⁵

Nowadays, there are only two cooperation agreements for postgraduate students between KhNUE and foreign universities: University Lumière Lyon 2 in France and Sandal University in Norway. Only a small number of PhD students have the opportunity to attend an international conference or spend a semester in a foreign university. The reasons for this are low financial support and the low level of foreign language proficiency. To deal with this situation, the Department of International Relations is working on involving experts from abroad in the educational process and developing the DocHub programme to enhance foreign language academic skills. The Department is also planning an online training programme with foreign universities.

Other weak points include the insufficient number of practical business training courses, an underdeveloped academic mobility system, a non-competitive scholarship, lack of international grants, low interest of employers and low opportunities to find a job in a business sector.

The weaknesses in internationalization, whether it be the insufficient mobility of PhD students or their difficulty integrating international dynamics, is recognized by the different interviewees met during the visit. The

³⁵ Section "Postgraduate Education: Bulletin board".

committee therefore encourages all measures that could improve international openness, both in the educational component of the programme (such as the presence of more foreign academics in the teaching staff) and in the research component of the programme (such as preference for publications in international rather than local journals, or the participation of more foreign academics in the thesis defense process).

Area 3-3: The postgraduate education is based on explicit rules for thesis duration and defense

There are explicit multilevel rules for the thesis defense procedure and postgraduate education to be executed to a higher level.

Upon completion of postgraduate studies (three years for full-time study and three years for correspondence study), a postgraduate student has to defend their research thesis.

The defense of the postgraduate student's thesis is regulated by a resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine: execution of the organizational rules for the defense of the thesis (the composition of the examination commission, rules) controlled by the MESU by monitoring the activities of the councils.

A council consists of the head and members of the council - two reviewers and two opponents. The head of the council ensures compliance with the requirements of legislation during the council's work.

Curiously, this last part of Area 3 was not the subject of a specific section in the self-assessment report.

AREA 4 – INTEGRATION OF DOCTORS INTO THE JOB MARKET

Area 4-1: The doctorate includes mechanisms to promote the integration of doctors into the job market

Although a large majority of graduates are enrolled in the academic sector, their integration in the non-academic sector is promoted by the programme. In a context where it will be difficult for all graduates to find a job at the University or at other academic institutions, this concern is significant and the development of links with industry is encouraged by the committee.

The majority of KhNUE C3 graduates are employed upon programme completion in the academic sector, namely about 80% of doctors are retained by the University or find jobs at other HEIs, while 20% obtain positions at public or private non-academic institutions.³⁶ At the same time, the University recognizes that the today's worldwide statistics on PhD graduates are more evenly divided between academic and non-academic sectors and it is taking steps in this direction.³⁷

While using a multidisciplinary approach, the doctorate places additional emphasis on increasing the skills of its PhD students in foreign languages and IT literacy, considering the modern trends towards internationalization and global digitalization; as well as the communication skills of graduates. The doctorate is building relationships with international employers that are represented locally and regionally, as a supplier of a high-quality workforce. The programme currently partners with over 40 employers. Work is being done in terms of collaboration on grant-based research conducted by the University for the State and private sectors. State research funding (that currently dominates) is typically conducted on pre-approved topics; the doctorate faculty and students also submit research proposals to the private sector to apply for private funding.

Higher visibility and international recognition of the programme could be instrumental in boosting industrial demand for programme graduates, as well as research cooperation between the programme faculty and graduates and private sector representatives.

³⁶ Annex 8 of the SER.

³⁷ Information given during the visit.

Promotion of the graduates on the job market is handled by the University Careers Development Department. The department draws up its annual activity plan and executes it in coordination with the PhD programme administration. These activities include such events as careers fairs (twice a year), round tables with business representatives, company site visits, company presentations, etc. The programme may also find it useful to engage company representatives as guest speakers more actively in the educational process to develop and conduct seminars and give lectures to PhD students.

The programme works on involving doctorate students in internships in industry, although this process could benefit from becoming more structured and formalized, as well as being more proactive. The programme maintains the website that regularly publishes job vacancy information, which is also distributed to the programme participants via social media. It could also be beneficial for the programme and its faculty to build direct personal contacts with industry to improve the effectiveness of direct cooperation in research and placement of the graduates in industry.

Area 4-2: The doctorate has effective monitoring of the integration of doctors into the job market

The university collects information on its graduates and their employment, but information about graduates who have not been employed at KhNUE is scarce. A uniform system of collecting information from all graduates is not implemented. The doctorate has a database of its alumni and is engaged in regular communication with graduates. Based on the feedback the expert committee received during the interviews, the doctorate is planning to make such communication more comprehensive and systematic.

The organization of the PhD programme in Economics at KhNUE includes a monitoring system which is defined in the "Conception of Internal Quality Assurance of Cycle 3 Programmes in Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics"³⁸ and is described in the self-evaluation report. The defined monitoring system focuses on PhD students' activities and their implementation provided by the individual curriculum. The system monitors the level of performance of the defined work in each semester and thus ensures the proper implementation of educational process.

Information on the quality assurance of the PhD programme is gathered from PhD students and alumni (through questionnaires) and from some external stakeholders (through discussions during meetings). However, the framework of the questionnaires does not include all the stakeholders of the programme and does not cover all the aspects of graduate employment. According to the "Programme Description and Target Skills",³⁹ the main employment openings of the PhD programme in Economics are the following: post-doctoral positions at universities and research centers; senior positions at universities, as well as in State institutions and private businesses; and self-employment. Thus, the university should make additional efforts to assess the opinions and needs of key stakeholders in the above-mentioned domains. At the same time, the main "consumers" of graduates of the PhD academic programme in Economics are universities. 80% of graduates work in the university system, mainly at KhNUE. In 2016, 65% of graduates started their working life at KhNUE (73% in 2017).

Monitoring of the integration of doctors into the job market is largely administered by the University Careers Development Department.

The doctorate also receives regular feedback from employers on the quality of the programme, as well as on what could be improved; equally, the programme receives feedback from its faculty and PhD students on any additional information demands from prospective employers. This is managed via regular round tables with the employers, as well as through selective employer surveys and networking events.

During the interviews, the expert group noticed that the students, alumni, employers and representatives from the partner organizations with whom they collaborate for internships were satisfied with the quality of the KhNUE PhD programme in Economics.

Area 4-3: The data collected is analyzed, communicated and used

Few employment data are collected, analyzed and disseminated among PhD students and graduates.

³⁸ Annex 13 of the SER.

³⁹ Annex 13 of the SER.

The information on the data collected, its analysis, dissemination and use in the relevant section of the KhNUE self-evaluation report is scarce.

To improve the quality of courses, the results of the questionnaires carried out within the PhD students are provided to the lecturers responsible for the course. The results are also available for the students.

During course review, the faculty members of the PhD academic programme in Economics do not collect and take into consideration the needs of external stakeholders, particularly the specific needs of their potential employers.⁴⁰

The collaboration culture between the university and labor market is in its beginnings, which is quite common in the post-soviet countries and also depends on the economic situation.

V. CONCLUSION

PAST ACHIEVEMENTS

KhNUE is a historic university, on the strength of more than a century of existence, and its specialization in Economics is highlighted today by the inclusion of Simon Kuznets' name in its official name. It offers a PhD programme in Economics that combines a curriculum designed to enhance knowledge in economics with research training that prepares the writing of a thesis and, after that, entry into a professional career at university or in the private sector. This programme follows the Ukrainian regulations on doctoral studies but also strives to follow European guidelines. In recent years, this programme has enabled dozens of students, mostly female, to obtain their doctorates each year. The number of PhD students and graduates, however, is declining.

TODAY'S CHALLENGES

KhNUE faces challenges in both parts of the curriculum: the educational part and the research part. The university is fully aware of this and has completed its self-evaluation report by presenting a SWOT analysis dealing successively with "Training" and "Research".

As regards training, a major challenge is to be able to offer PhD students a high-quality programme training them on the various aspects of economic science as it exists today. As regards research, it is necessary to enable them to conduct research at the international level.

Meeting these two challenges is essential in a situation where many holders of a master's degree are not interested in pursuing doctoral studies and, when they want to prepare a PhD, may be tempted to do so outside KhNUE.

FUTURE OUTLOOK

KhNUE has conducted a self-evaluation of its PhD programme in Economics and requested an external evaluation by a committee of international experts. This reflects a desire to analyze the current situation and a willingness to develop international openness.

This international opening calls for the internationalization of the training and research staff. The participation of foreign teachers in the courses of the training programme and of foreign researchers in the various stages of thesis writing should be encouraged. The establishment of international partnerships, double supervision (foreign and Ukrainian) of theses, the sending of students abroad during part of their studies, publications in non-Ukrainian journals in international rankings are possibilities to be explored.

⁴⁰ Information given during the visit.

STRENGTHS:

- KhNUE's specialization in Economics makes it a well-suited university for this Phd programme.
- The subjects taught in the training programme are an effective complement to the knowledge of PhD students in Economics.
- PhD students in Economics follow a clearly established teaching and research programme.
- KhNUE can rely on teachers and researchers able to supervise PhD students in Economics.
- KhNUE provides PhD students in Economics with a good environment for their studies with a diverse range of resources.
- KhNUE has so far ensured good integration of its graduates in the academic world.
- KhNUE has opportunities to develop links with professional circles.
- KhNUE shows a real desire to improve the quality of the PhD programme in Economics.
- KhNUE demonstrates its ability to conduct a genuine self-evaluation.

WEAKNESSES:

- The current PhD programme in Economics is not attractive enough for master's graduates and does not enable enrolment to be stabilized or increased.
- The integration of the PhD programme in Economics into the international environment, although underway, is still insufficient.
- The geographic mobility of students outside Ukraine is very low.
- The current political situation of Ukraine does not facilitate recruitment of good foreign candidates.
- There are excessive regulatory constraints on the university in preparing the thesis, including the language in which it is to be written.
- The opportunities for partnerships with the professional community are underutilized.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

- The research carried out by PhD students in Economics must be at an international level (choice of thesis topics that are not limited to local issues, permanent exchanges with foreign researchers, publications in international journals with a good ranking, rather than local or national journals, participation of foreign academics in the defense of the thesis).
- A stay of several months abroad should be generalized for all PhD students in Economics, which could be facilitated by the establishment of agreements with partner universities.
- The educational staff should be complemented by foreign academics to broaden approaches to the latest developments in economic science.
- In a context where it will be more difficult for graduates to find a job at a university, links with professional circles should be strengthened.
- The internal quality assurance policy must remain a concern of KhNUE.

VI. COMMENTS OF THE INSTITUTION

The evaluation reports of Hcéres
are available online : www.hceres.com

Evaluation of clusters of higher education and research institutions
Evaluation of higher education and research institutions
Evaluation of research
Evaluation of doctoral schools
Evaluation of programmes
International evaluation and accreditation



2 rue Albert Einstein
75013 Paris, France
T. 33 (0)1 55 55 60 10

hceres.com

[@Hceres_](https://twitter.com/Hceres_)

[Hcéres](https://www.youtube.com/Hceres)