

KYIV NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF TRADE AND ECONOMICS



Co-funded by the
Erasmus+ Programme
of the European Union

FACT FINDING REPORT



*Done in Kyiv (Ukraine)
April 2017*

Content

| | |
|--|----|
| Chapter 1: Overall landscape – National Higher Education, research and QA context | 4 |
| 1.1 Brief presentation of the HE and research system | 4 |
| 1.2 Overview of the national legal framework and regulations governing quality assurance (QA) of Cycle 3 | 5 |
| 1.3 Strategies and incentives for Cycle 3 at national level | 6 |
| 1.4 Impact of European Principles, Standards and Guidelines at national level | 6 |
| 1.5 Financial conditions | 6 |
| Chapter 2 – Cycle 3: state of the art | 7 |
| 2.1. Main characteristics of Cycle 3 programs | 7 |
| 2.1.1. <i>Are there Cycle 3 Programs in your university country? If yes, is it a professional doctorate or a PhD program? Please also provide some historical background</i> | 7 |
| 2.1.2. <i>Nature of the doctoral programs</i> | 7 |
| 2.1.3. <i>Characteristics of the Cycle 3 study:</i> | 7 |
| 2.1.4. <i>Statistics related to Cycle 3</i> | 11 |
| 2.1.5. <i>Positioning of Cycle 3</i> | 12 |
| 2.1.6. <i>Follow-up of PhD Students and graduates</i> | 12 |
| 2.2. IQA and EQA mechanisms of Cycle 3 | 14 |
| 2.2.1. <i>Internal QA</i> | 14 |
| 2.2.2. <i>External QA</i> | 16 |
| Chapter 3 – Main challenges of Cycle 3 Programs and its QA | 16 |
| 3.1 At national /policy level | 16 |
| 3.2 For institutions | 17 |
| 3.3 For PhD Students | 17 |
| 3.4 For the socio-economic world | 18 |
| Chapter 4 – Good practice examples | 20 |

Introduction

Kyiv National University of Trade and Economics (hereinafter KNUTE) is one of the most prestigious educational institutions of Ukraine, certified by the highest IV level of accreditation. Its history dates back from 1946. By the Decree of the President of Ukraine the University was given a national status in 2000. In 2006 KNUTE joined the Magna Charta of Universities.

Cycle 3 programs in KNUTE has been opened since 1966 and trains over 200 postgraduate students per year. There are 15 Cycle 3 programs in KNUTE now. They are: Philosophy; Economics; Political Science; Psychology; International Economic Relations; Accounting and Taxation; Finance, Banking and Insurance; Management; Public Management and Administration; Marketing, Entrepreneurship, Trade and Exchange Activity; Law; International Law; Food Technologies; Computer Science and Information Technologies.

This report is created to present the current state of doctorate studies in KNUTE. Among the methods used for the research are:

- content analysis of external and internal regulations of PhD studies;
- comparative analysis of Ukrainian and foreign practices of postgraduate studies, as well as KNUTE's one;
- statistical analysis of Cycle 3 programs' student body;
- interview with KNUTE officials, students, businesspersons, etc.

Among the data used are: the laws of Ukraine and other official documents at the national level, the internal Cycle 3 regulations, statistical data of State Statistical Service of Ukraine on doctorate studies, the internal KNUTE statistics of student body changes, the results of the interviews of 100 PhD students of KNUTE, as well as 62 partners of KNUTE, who answered the questions, recommended by the Haut Conseil de l'évaluation de la recherche et de l'enseignement supérieur (HCERES).

Executive summary

There are five educational levels in Ukraine: incipient level (short cycle) of higher education (hereinafter HE) (equal to 5 level of European Qualifications Framework (hereinafter EQF)); the first (bachelor) level of HE (equal to 6 EQF level); the second (master) level of HE (equal to 7 EQF level); the third (educational and scientific (PhD)) level of HE (equal to 8 EQF level); and the highest one – scientific level.

The educational programs of 1, 2 and 3 Cycle is developed by higher education institutions (hereinafter HEIs) according to the standards of higher education. The latter must be developed by the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine (hereinafter – MESU) and authorized by the National Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (hereinafter NAQAHE), which is under establishing now. Starting with the 2016 the Cycle 3 programs consist of two components: educational and scientific ones. To get the PhD Degree a student has to get 60 ECTS credits of academic load and to defend the thesis. The defence must be public. Before 2016, Cycle 3 was only a scientific program. There was not educational component of the program. The graduates got the degree of Candidate of Science after the public defence of the thesis.

KNUTE PhD programs are developed in connection with the rich European background. They consider European Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in HE, Bologna Principles, some requirements of Salzburg Principles.

KNUTE has developed clear regulations that determine admission procedure, student progression procedure, the procedures of control and quality assurance of doctoral studies, etc. They are completely on a par of Ukrainian Law "On Higher Education". They are in exact accordance with requirements of MESU (which acts for NAQAHE before its establishment) in sphere of Cycle 3 quality assessment (hereinafter QA). It let provide the high level of Doctorate efficiency (the rate of graduates who defends a thesis successfully and timely) in KNUTE. It measures as 60 % of graduates at the average, being more than twice higher than the same national indicator.

60 % of KNUTE Cycle 3 programs alumnus stay to work in KNUTE. Others get a job in the business sector. The alumnus often come back to KNUTE to deliver lectures, seminars, master-classes for students, to conduct mutual projects, etc. It lets connect a science with a business. Notwithstanding the efforts the problem of them disconnect is urgent now. It was pointed by more than 70 % of surveyed businesspersons, as well as the students. To cope with it KNUTE provides the order to ground and to

discuss publically the relevance of the topic of PhD research before its approval by the University Academic Council. Also, there is a requirement to implement the results of PhD research into the activity of business or state bodies, which asks for strong cooperation with business entities.

The doctorate studies take the prominent role in the scope of strategic objectives of KNUTE's development, being an instrument of providing the better qualitative composition of the staff. It is pointed in the draft of the KNUTE strategy for 2017 – 2030.

Chapter 1: Overall landscape – National Higher Education, research and QA context

1.1 Brief presentation of the HE and research system

1.1.1. *Country size, number of HE students, number of HEIs, type of HEIs (public/private, general or very specific), missions of the HEIs*

Ukraine is a big country in the centre of the Europe. The population of Ukraine is 42.5 mln people. There are 657 HEIs in Ukraine in the 2017. 370 HEIs provide only the 1 Cycle programs, 287 HEIs provide the 1 and the 2 Cycle programs¹, 231 HEIs provide the 1, 2 and 3 Cycle programs. Besides this, there are Cycle 3 programs in the 250 research institutions.² 51.5 % of HEIs are state-owned. 28.2 % of them are municipal-owned. Only 20.3 % of HEIs are private³. Total number of the 1 and the 2 Cycle students is 1605,3 K. The total number of Cycle 3 students is about 26 K.⁴

According to the Ukrainian Law “On Higher Education” there are five educational levels in Ukraine:

- incipient level (short cycle) of HE;
- the first (bachelor) level of HE;
- the second (master) level of HE;
- the third (educational and scientific (PhD)) level of HE; and
- the highest one – scientific level.

The incipient level (short cycle) of higher education (equal to the 5 level of National Qualifications Framework of Ukraine (hereinafter NQF) and the 5 EQF level) provides general and professional studies, special knowledge and skills and some experience of their practical use to be able to perform typical tasks of bottom level of professional activity. The awarded degree here is an Associate Bachelor.

The first (bachelor) level of HE (equal to the 6 NQF level and the 6 EQF level) provides theoretical knowledge and practical skills for successful performance of professional duties under the chosen specialty. The awarded degree here is a Bachelor.

The second (master) level of HE (equal to the 7 NQF level and the 7 EQF level) provides deep theoretical and / or practical knowledge and skills under the chosen specialty, as well as general methodology of scientific and professional activity, other competences for effective performance of innovative professional tasks. The awarded degree here is a Master.

The third (educational and scientific (PhD)) level of HE (equal to the 8 NQF level and the 8 EQF level) provides theoretical knowledge, skills and other competences to produce new ideas, to solve complex problems in the professional, research and innovative activities and to conduct own scientific research, which results are scientifically new and useful. The awarded degree here is a PhD.

The scientific level is equal to the 9 NQF level and has no analogue in the EQF. It provides the competences of development and implementation of research methodology to create new core knowledge and / or advanced technologies, to solve significant nationwide or even global scientific or applied problems. The awarded degree here is a Doctor of Science.

The attestation of associate bachelors, bachelors and masters is made by the examination board, which consist of professors of the native HEI, as well as businesspersons – potential employers. The academic degree is awarded by the University following on from the decision of examination board.

¹HEIs // Official web-site of the State Statistic Service of Ukraine. Available in Ukrainian at: http://ukrstat.org/uk/operativ/operativ2005/osv_rik/osv_u/vuz_u.html

² Doctorate studies // Official web-site of the State Statistic Service of Ukraine. Available in Ukrainian at: http://ukrstat.org/uk/druk/publicat/kat_u/publosvita_u.htm

³Main indicators of HEIs' activities // Official web-site of the State Statistic Service of Ukraine. Available in Ukrainian at: http://ukrstat.org/uk/druk/publicat/kat_u/publosvita_u.htm

⁴HEIs // Official web-site of the State Statistic Service of Ukraine. Available in Ukrainian at: http://ukrstat.org/uk/operativ/operativ2005/osv_rik/osv_u/vuz_u.html

The attestation of PhD candidates is made by a regular or non-regular academic council of the HEI, which is authorized by the NAQAHE, with reference to the results of public defence of thesis. The PhD candidate can choose the academic council by himself.

The attestation of candidates of Doctor of Science is made by the only regular academic council of the HEI authorized by the NAQAHE with reference to the results of public defence of thesis or monograph, or a scope of publications in the journals that are recommended by the MESU.

All Cycle programs are developed by the HEIs according to the standards of HE which must be developed by MESU and authorized by NAQAHE⁵. But this stage is in progression now.

1.1.2. National statistics on research and role of the HEIs within the research system, research priorities.

978 research institutions conducted researches in Ukraine in 2015 (the statistics of 2016 is inaccessible for the ordinary user yet). 44.3 % of them are state-owned research institution, 44.3 % - privately owned ones and 15.4 % are HEIs⁶. Researches breakdown by sectors is followed: natural science – 34.4 %, engineering – 48.8 %, arts – 1.6 %, social science – 4.3 %, interbranch researches – 10.97. Almost all the researches (95 %) in KNUTE are social, mostly economic ones, because of the University's specialization.

As for the funding, it is divided between the sources of funding in the next way. 38 % of researches are granted by the state, 18% – by the foreign donors, and 44 % – by private donors. The sectorial breakdown of funding are different. The private funding is dominant in engineering (58 %), while in other sectors there is a dominance of state funding. The biggest share of state funding is in arts (97 %) and social science (96 %)⁸. The breakdown of the researches by the source of funding in KNUTE reflects the above said. Only 1 % of the funding went from the private sector in 2016⁹.

The interaction between HEIs and research institutions is very general. There are only few cases of mutual researches.

1.1.3. Relationships between HE and Enterprises

The relationship between the HEIs and enterprises, state agencies are typically strong in Ukraine. KNUTE has 269 agreements on coordination with business and state bodies. The students' internship is a compulsory component of the curriculum of Cycle 1 and 2 programs. It takes 12 ECTS credits per program. As for the Cycle 3 programs' curriculum, it does not comprise the internship. However, as PhD candidates have to implement the results of their research into the activity of business or state bodies (compulsory requirement), there is also strong cooperation between them. The same compulsory requirement of implementation of results of the researches into the activity of business or state bodies is set by the relevant regulations on the procedure of reporting the results of scientific research. KNUTE complies it entirely. Besides this, there is a business incubator in KNUTE, where students can develop their start-ups, and the Centre of technology transfer that helps students and professors of KNUTE to commercialize result of the researches.

1.2 Overview of the national legal framework and regulations governing quality assurance (QA) of Cycle 3

The main quality criteria of Cycles 1, 2 and 3 programs and the procedures of their compliance are pointed in the:

- *Ukrainian Law "On Higher Education" #1556-VII of 07 July, 2014¹⁰;*
- *The Licence Provisions of Educational Activity Providing by Education Institutions #1187 of 30 December, 2015¹¹* that determines the minimum needs to start an educational program. It covers

⁵Ukrainian Law «On Higher Education». Available in Ukrainian at: <http://zakon2.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1556-18>

⁶Report on Scientific and Technological activity in Ukraine in 2015. Available in Ukrainian at: http://ukrstat.org/uk/druk/publicat/kat_u/publnauka_u.htm

⁷Scientific and innovative activity in Ukraine // Official web-site of the State Statistic Service of Ukraine. Available in Ukrainian at: http://ukrstat.org/uk/druk/publicat/kat_u/publnauka_u.htm

⁸Scientific and innovative activity in Ukraine // Official web-site of the State Statistic Service of Ukraine. Available in Ukrainian at: http://ukrstat.org/uk/druk/publicat/kat_u/publnauka_u.htm

⁹Report on the results of KNUTE scientific research in 2016.

¹⁰The licence provisions of educational activity providing by education institutions. Available in Ukrainian at: <http://zakon2.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1556-18>

¹¹Regulations on the procedure of studying of PhD candidates and candidates of Doctor of Science. Available in Ukrainian at: <http://zakon2.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1187-2015-%D0%BF/page>

the needs for staff, material, methodical and informational provisions of the educational program;

- *Regulations on the Procedure of Studying of PhD Candidates and Candidates of Doctor of Science #261 of 23 March, 2016*. The latter is focused on the Cycle 3 and the higher programs.

1.3 Strategies and incentives for Cycle 3 at national level

Since adopting the Ukrainian Law “On Higher Education” in the July of 2014, the reforms in HE sector start. They are under progress now. The first admission of PhD students under the new Cycle 3 programs has been done in 2016. These programs have the educational component now (from 30 to 60 ECTS credits)¹², while the previous ones had not it. They focused at the scientific research. New Cycle 3 programs lead to getting the PhD degree, while the previous ones led to getting the degree of Candidate of Science. The educational period under the new Cycle 3 programs is 4 years (consistent with Salzburg Principles), while the previous programs lasted 3 years long. The changes also take place in the procedures of licensing and accreditation of educational programs¹³.

All those involved in the Cycle 3 programs are interested in their successful functioning. These programs let the HEIs develop its stuff and provide the higher quality of education. The professors use them to develop the scientific schools. These programs can be also considered by the professors as the additional source of income, as the supervising of PhD thesis is a part of teaching load. PhD students consider the Cycle 3 programs as an instrument of their personal growth. The programs let them get enough knowledge and skills to build successful carrier in KNUTE or elsewhere.

Gender evaluation is a compulsory way of students’ body analysis. Its results must be included into the annual statements of a HEI. However, there is no regulation to favour some gender groups of PhD students to provide a gender balance. The knowledge is only one criterion of PhD students’ admission.

Companies’ opinion about their need for PhD graduates differ. The results of interviewing of 62 KNUTE Partners (business entities and state bodies) shows that 48.4 % of respondents are looking for PhD graduates. In addition, more than half of this group of respondents testify their satisfaction with PhD graduates qualification¹⁴.

There is fixed rule that consider the PhD degree as a value-added factor only in the public sector (+ 15 % over the position salary), while there is no any legal requirement to do that in the private sector. It depends on the decision of a company management.

1.4 Impact of European Principles, Standards and Guidelines at national level

ESG and Bologna Principles are taken as basis of the educational programs’ management in Ukraine. They are used for development of regulations of external and internal quality assessment. The Salzburg Principles is used in Ukraine just partially now. The educational period and Cycle 3 programs configuration changes are in the spirit of the Salzburg Principles. The procedure of grounding of the applicability of the line of research is the compulsory step of Cycle 3 programs’ implementation in KNUTE. All the bachelor and master programs in KNUTE are compulsorily confirmed by the businesspersons, while the Cycle 3 programs are not. There is a range of agreements between KNUTE on the one hand, and business and state bodies on the other hand that cover the matter of Cycle 3 programs development and the matter of studying those partners’ representatives at the PhD programs in KNUTE. The other Salzburg Principles’ implementation is in progress now. For example, KNUTE has some agreements with research institutions on the mutual Cycle 3 programs, but they are not widespread. KNUTE students use the mobility programs to internationalize the researches, but the share of PhD students, who use them, is rather low.

1.5 Financial conditions

The most PhD students (87 %) in KNUTE study at public expense. They also have public scholarship. The other 13 % of PhD students pay by themselves. For excellence in studying, scientific and public activity the PhD students may be granted by the academic scholarship of KNUTE and the

¹² Regulations on the Procedure of Studying of PhD Candidates and Candidates of Doctor of Science. Available in Ukrainian at: <http://zakon2.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1187-2015-%D0%BF/page>

¹³ Ukrainian Law «On Higher Education». Available in Ukrainian at: <http://zakon2.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1556-18>

¹⁴ The results of the interview is available at: https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1YRipblaj9mF-11MC2B8FcpYsy6G_70jXDS5-GMQK18/edit

academic scholarships of The President of Ukraine, Verkhovna Rada (Supreme Council) of Ukraine, Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine. As PhD researches are the parts of the wider scientific researches of the University with the extra financing, they also can be benefited from this.

As it was pointed above the PhD programs can be also considered by professors as the additional source of income, because the supervising of the PhD thesis is a part of teaching load.

Chapter 2 – Cycle 3: state of the art

2.1. Main characteristics of Cycle 3 programs

2.1.1. *Are there Cycle 3 Programs in your university country? If yes, is it a professional doctorate or a PhD program? Please also provide some historical background*

Cycle 3 Programs in KNUTE has been opened since 1966 and trains over 200 postgraduate students per year: candidates of science (equal to PhD). Training of candidates for PhD degree has been started in 2016 to response the changes in the Ukrainian Law “On Higher Education”. The KNUTE Regulations on the Procedure for Studying Candidates for a Degree of Doctor of Philosophy and Doctor of Science #1324 of 12.05.2016¹⁵ has been adopted that year. There are 15 Cycle 3 programs in KNUTE now. There is no professional doctorate in Ukraine.

2.1.2. *Nature of the doctoral programs.*

There are two components of every Cycle 3 program: educational and research ones. The *educational component* involves gaining theoretical knowledge, skills and other competencies sufficient to produce new ideas, to solve complex problems in professional, researching and innovation activity as well as to master the methodology of scientific and teaching activities.

Some educational elements of doctoral programs are broadly defined by the Law “On Higher Education” and the national regulations (e.g. the higher education standards, the guidelines on PhD studies, regulation on academic mobility, etc.). For example, the curriculum for PhD studies must include an educational component lasting from 30 to 60 ECTS credits. KNUTE are autonomous in the creation and content of their respective educational curricula. However, there are some general rules regarding the curricula prescribed by MESU. KNUTE indicates the lists of obligatory courses, which ensures development of the compulsory (transferable and specific/subject) competencies / learning outcomes, and optional courses (at least 25% of the total amount of ECTS credits) in every curriculum.

The *research component* involves prosecution of own research led by one or two supervisors and presentation of the results in a thesis. Doctoral thesis is an independent detailed study that offers a solution to current scientific challenges in a particular area of knowledge or on the verge of some branches, the results of which are original contribution to the body of science and they are published in the relevant publications.

2.1.3. *Characteristics of the Cycle 3 study:*

a) *Describe the way Cycle 3 study is organized.* Cycle 3 programs are well organized at KNUTE and last four years. To enrol in a doctoral programme, the student must have completed a Master course. The general admission requirements are: an exam in line with program subject area and foreign language proficiency at B2 (Common European Framework of Reference for Languages: Learning, Teaching, and Assessment). Candidates are also assessed on the basis of their average grades from the previous levels of studies, their professional skills and previous accomplishments.

PhD programs involve an educational component (up to 60 ECTS), extensive scientific research activities and publication of papers in the scientific journals. A PhD thesis is the final part of a doctoral program. The preparation, procedure and conditions for the defence of the PhD thesis are defined by the general act of KNUTE in line with the regulations of MESU. KNUTE has the obligation to make the thesis and the abstract (synopsis) available to the public on its web site (<https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/blog/read/?pid=6802&uk>), alongside a printed version of the thesis, which needs to be available in the KNUTE’s library, at least 10 days prior to the defence of the thesis. Each HEI is obliged to establish a digital repository containing electronic versions of all defended thesis, abstracts (Ukrainian – Autoreferat, short description of Thesis’ content), along with the Thesis Expertise Reports submitted by the relevant expert commissions and reviewers, the data about the respective mentors/supervisors, reviewers and commission members. All of the foregoing documentation must be available to the public. A copy of each thesis has to be sent to the Central Repository of MESU.

¹⁵ KNUTE Regulations on the Procedure for Studying Candidates for a Degree of Doctor of Philosophy and Doctor of Science #1324 of 12.05.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://knteu.kiev.ua/file/MTc=/d90a6c58922d38c20a080ad6d6b10325.pdf>

b) *How many universities are granting cycles 3? Which ones?* According to the latest data of Statistical Review there are 231 HEIs in Ukraine that provides Cycle 3 programs. KNUTE is one of them. Also Cycle 3 programs are done by 250 research institutions.

c) *Which fields attract students?* Being specialized in economic studies KNUTE focuses the PhD studies in this field. The KNUTE admission list to the training on Cycle 3 programs in 2016 shows that the most popular specialties are: 051 Economics – 24% of PhD students, Finance, banking and insurance – 11%, Accounting and taxation – 7%, Entrepreneurship, trade and exchange activities – 7%.

d) *What are the main reasons to have more students in those fields? Is there an unbalanced situation among the different fields?* KNUTE has a strong team of highly qualified teachers and researchers in the above mention fields, who can help PhD students to conduct research successfully. The share of teachers with scientific degrees of doctor and candidate of sciences (equal PhD), including honored workers of science and technology, honorary figures of higher education, academics and corresponding members of National and branch Academies of Sciences, in the total number of academic staff is more than 80%. Almost all of them are specialized in Economics, being in line with KNUTE specialization. That's why the percentage of PhD students in the above mention fields significantly prevails it in the fields of Politology, Philosophy and Psychology.

e) *Must thesis supervisors/directors have a particular status/degree? Is there a minimum number of theses each of them can supervise?* Each student of Cycle 3 programs is assigned by a supervisor along with its admission to KNUTE with the relevant order of the rector. Usually, a supervisor has a degree of Doctor of Science (9 level of NQF). As an exception, the candidate of science (PhD) can also be a supervisor by the decision of KNUTE Academic Council.

Supervisor, who is a Doctor of science (9 level of NQF), can perform simultaneous scientific management, not more than 5 degree applicants, including those who acquires academic degree of Doctor of Science (9 level of NQF). Doctor of Philosophy, who received permission from Academic Council of KNUTE, may supervise theses usually no more than 3 candidates of PhD degree.

f) *Is there a minimum number of publications or other research indicators to get competences for supervising thesis?* There are no specific requirements to be met to get the opportunity to supervise the PhD students, but it is preferable to be a Doctor of Science (9 level of NQF) to do that.

In order to receive the academic degree of Doctor of Science (9 level of NQF) is necessary to have:

- defended doctorate thesis (another than PhD one). The thesis, which contains scientific and practice results, need to be accompanied documents of confirming the practice of using research results – implementation in production, production test, obtaining new quantitative and qualitative indicators, significant advantages offered by technology, product samples, materials, etc. The thesis must also contain theoretical scientific results and recommendations of their use. The thesis should have basic text volume about 300 pages, which meets the requirements established by MESU;

- published monograph. The monograph is need to be printed without co-authors and contains summary results of author's research, published earlier in scientific professional editions of Ukraine or other countries;

- at least 15 publications. Among them: at least 5 publications in foreign journals or Ukrainian journals included into the international scientometric databases, like Scopus or Web of Science; no more than 5 publications in electronic scientific professional publications; scientific articles in national and international peer-reviewed professional journals, which is recommended by MESU.

Since Cycle 3 programs for PhD degree at KNUTE have been operating just only a year there is no practice when PhD is a supervisor. Anyway, to get the permission for supervising the applicants of Cycle 3 programs Doctor of Philosophy has to meet the following criteria:

- at least 10 articles in national and / or foreign (international) peer-reviewed professional journals, published after defending the PhD thesis;
- at least 3 articles in periodicals included into scientometric databases Scopus or Web of Science;
- experience of guiding a scientific research or participation in its implementation.

In the case of meeting these requirements the Academic Council of KNUTE can authorizes a Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) to supervise PhD students for a period of 5 years.

g) *Is PhD international mention included as an option for PhD Candidates? In affirmative case, what are the requirements?* There was not such a practice at KNUTE yet. But in the case, the requirements are the same as for Ukrainian PhD supervisor.

h) *How do thesis defences take place? Has each university set regulations for that? If so, what are they?* Thesis must be publically defended at the session of Specialized Academic Council (hereinafter SAC) that

is accredited by NAQAHE (by MESU up to the moment of NAQAHE establishment). There are 6 SACs in the KNUTE.

Thesis defences in a SAC involve the following steps: 1) submission of documents to the SAC; 2) previous examination of the documents, provided; 3) 1st Council meeting. Accepting documents by the SAC; 4) examination of the thesis by experts; 5) 2nd Council meeting. Recommendation the thesis for defence; 6) submission of the advertisement about the thesis' defence; 7) issue of the abstract of the thesis; 8) mailing the abstract to professionals and the libraries; 9) allocation of the thesis and the abstract at the KNUTE web-site; 10) collection of the responses to the abstract and the thesis; 11) 3d Council meeting. Thesis defence.

Mechanisms of academic management of Cycle 3 programs at KNUTE are determined by:

- Regulations on the Procedure for Studding Candidates for a Degree of Doctor of Philosophy and Doctor of Science (12.05.2016 #1324)¹⁶;
- Regulations on the Organization of the Educational Process of PhD Students at KNUTE (12.05.2016 №1323)¹⁷;
- Regulations on the Certification of Postgraduate and Doctoral Students at KNUTE (07.09.2016 #2526)¹⁸;
- Regulations on the Assessment of Learning Outcomes of Students and Postgraduate Students (05.09.2016 №2439)¹⁹;
- Regulations on Individual Work of Students and Postgraduate Students of KNUTE (04.10.2016 #2962)²⁰;
- Regulations on Distant Learning at KNUTE (30.05.2013)²¹;
- Regulations on the Procedure for Realizing the Right to Academic Mobility at KNUTE (01.12.2015 #3141)²².

i) Are there specific criteria to defend a thesis and are they passed on to PhD students and thesis supervisor? Specific criteria to defend a thesis in KNUTE relates to the process of preliminary thesis' review (Regulations on the Certification of Postgraduate and Doctoral Students at KNUTE²³). The purpose of preliminary thesis' review is to make expert analyses of the thesis' readiness for the defence in a SAC. Preliminary review includes thesis discussion on the interdepartmental and departmental seminars.

PhD students (no later than 6 months before the expiry of postgraduate studying) have to submit fully completed and duly executed thesis for discussion at the department, where it was done. The next step is a submission of a thesis for discussion at the interdepartmental seminar. The decision of the interdepartmental board, which is set up for every PhD student on an individual basis, about the readiness of the thesis for defence is one of the documents must be submitted to the SAC. Student, supervisor, and Head of the relevant Department should ensure the passing of these steps up to the end of the studding period.

Head of Department assigns at least 3 reviewers – Candidates of Science (PhD) and doctors of Science (9 NQF level), and determines the date of the departmental seminar. Thesis review is provided no later than 30 days prior to the meeting. PhD student makes a report about main results of the research, focusing on its relevance, methods of research, the differences from prior researches (Ukrainian and worldwide), scientific novelty, practical value, the reliability of the data and the level of testing. If all the reviewers confirm the completeness of the research the thesis refers to the interdepartmental seminar.

Regarding the decision of the departmental seminar the rector set up the interdepartmental board and set a date of interdepartmental seminar. The members of interdepartmental board are highly

¹⁶KNUTE Regulations on the Procedure for Studding Candidates for a Degree of Doctor of Philosophy and Doctor of Science #1324 of 12.05.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://knteu.kiev.ua/file/MTc=/d90a6c58922d38c20a080ad6d6b10325.pdf>

¹⁷Regulations on the Organization of the Educational Process of PhD Students at KNUTE #1323 of 12.05.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/file/Mg==/ac56d423c4cd43f20f16a644e1b4c4ec.pdf>

¹⁸Regulations on the Certification of Postgraduate and Doctoral Students at KNUTE #2526 of 07.09.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/file/NzM10Q==/96add50ab525837bdae8b0302ec96ff5.pdf>

¹⁹KNUTE Regulations on the Assessment of Learning Outcomes of Students and Postgraduate Students #2439 of 05.09.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://knteu.kiev.ua/file/NzU4MQ==/2e9c68cbe2d8f9a56ecdc32a73eefd29.pdf>

²⁰Regulations on Individual Work of Students and Postgraduate Students of KNUTE #2962 of 04.10.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/file/MTc=/031cf20c4bc86b02a8ec3ad3659e5345.pdf>

²¹Regulations on Distant Learning at KNUTE of 30.05.2013. Available in Ukrainian at: http://dist.knteu.kiev.ua/files/pl_dist_30_05_2013.pdf

²²Regulations on the Procedure for Realizing the Right to Academic Mobility at KNUTE #3141 of 01.12.2015 <https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/file/MTc=/e24af5ebf7aeb2799f6c45b1f20a12f3.pdf>

²³Regulations on the Certification of Postgraduate and Doctoral Students at KNUTE #2526 of 07.09.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/file/NzM10Q==/96add50ab525837bdae8b0302ec96ff5.pdf>

qualified experts - professors, doctors from departments of the relevant scientific profile. In the case of reviewing the thesis in Economic Science there is a mandatory requirement to include the professor from the Department of Economics and Competition Policy into the composition of interdepartmental board. The thesis must be submitted to the members of interdepartmental board in 30 days before the date of the interdepartmental seminar.

The aim of the interdepartmental seminar is to come up with a considered opinion on the relevance, scientific novelty and practical value of the thesis compared with the existing achievements of national and world science. The list of participants at interdepartmental seminar includes members of departments, PhD students, heads of scientific research, member of the SAC. If it is necessary to involve other professionals, they must be invited.

The scenario of an interdepartmental seminar is similar to the scenario of thesis' defence at SAC. The main results of the thesis must be presented using visual material. Discussion of specific provisions and features of the thesis is made in the form of questions and answers. Reviewers must reveal positive and negative aspects of work and make a clear conclusion about its compliance with the requirements imposed by the Regulation on the Awarding of Academic Degrees²⁴. PhD candidate must provide thorough answers to reasoned criticism. The Chairman of the interdepartmental board shall ensure a thorough discussion of the thesis. The discussion / debate is open to all the participants.

There are two options of the decision made by the interdepartmental board with regard to the results of the seminar: to recommend the submission of the thesis to a SAC; to recommend the rework of the thesis. In the latter case the break must be announced for a fixed term. At the end of this term the thesis must be discussed again.

This procedure works in KNUTE for years. It is passed by all the PhD students, who defends thesis in KNUTE (more than 60% of Cycle 3 programs graduates).

j. What is the legal composition of a jury? How many people? Is the thesis director/supervisor member of the jury? Is the defence private? Public? For the defence is there a specific ceremonial presentation (gowns, proclamations, etc.)? Jury consists of 15-25 people. Among the members of the jury are, at least, 5 specialists in each specialty of the SAC profile; among the latter are at least 4 Doctors of Science (9 NQF level), who actively carry out scientific work and have publications in the relevant field of science, while others are professionals with scientific articles, monographs in this specialty which are published in the last five years. Supervisor may be a member of the jury.

Defence is a public event, which takes place in the accordance with the procedure prescribed by Regulations on SAC.²⁵ Meeting of a SAC for thesis defence is conducted in the state language by the following ceremonial presentation: 1) members of a SAC must be acquainted with the draft opinion about the thesis prepared by SAC before the opening session; 2) a chairman according to the members presence from the registration card informs the SAC about legitimacy of meeting and quorum for opening the session; 3) a chairman informs the agreed language of thesis defence; 4) a chairman announces the agenda, thesis title, details about official reviewers; 5) a secretary of the SAC reports about submitted documents and their compliance with the requirements established by law; 6) PhD candidate presents the main provisions of the thesis and answer the questions submitted orally or in writing; 7) the scientific supervisor make a speech; 8) a secretary of the SAC announces the conclusion of an organization where the thesis was developed, and the abstract reviews; 9) the PhD candidate meets the comments contained in the reviews; 10) the official reviewers make speeches; 11) the PhD candidate answers to reviewers' comments; 12) after each answer a secretary of the SAC asks the reviewers about the compliance of the comment of the PhD candidate to the criticism, which is announced in the review; 13) public discussion of the thesis; 14) final word of the PhD candidate; 15) election of Counting Commission to conduct a secret ballot; 16) secret ballot of Council members on awarding scientific degrees to the applicant; 17) announcement of the ballot; 18) approval of minutes of the Counting Commission by a simple majority votes of SAC members, which are present at the meeting; 19) discussing the draft and adoption of Council conclusions.

k. Are there procedures to validate a "PhD at work"? And a PhD on "validation on skills"? One of the procedures to validate a "PhD at work" and "validation on skills" is an implementation of the research results. Implementation can be confirmed by a number of certificates:

- Certificate on the implementation of the research results in the activity of business and / or state bodies;

²⁴Regulation on the Awarding of Academic Degrees #567 of 24.07.2013. Available in Ukrainian at: <http://zakon2.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/567-2013-%D0%BF>

²⁵ Regulations on Specialized Academic Council # 1059 of 14.09.2011 Available in Ukrainian at: <http://zakon3.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/z1170-11>

- Certificate on the use of the research results within the wider scientific research of the HEI's department, registered in the State Institution "Ukrainian Institute of Scientific, Technical and Economic Information" (UkrISTEI) (<http://www.uintei.kiev.ua/main.php>);

- Certificate on the implementation of the results of the thesis in the educational process.

l. Are there definitions of specific skills for a doctorate? There is nothing special, but the PhD student must be able to conduct research and to present its results.

2.1.4. Statistics related to Cycle 3

| Indicator | 2012 | 2013 | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 |
|---|---------|------|------|------|------|
| Nb of students starting a doctorate | 57 | 58 | 62 | 66 | 50 |
| % of students coming directly after a Master of the same University | 70% | 66% | 74% | 68% | 57% |
| % of Male starting doctorate | No data | | 41% | 39% | 31% |
| % of Female starting doctorate | | | 59% | 61% | 69% |
| Nb of graduates | 31 | 35 | 38 | 38 | 42 |
| % of Male graduates | 19% | 14% | 34% | 26% | 24% |
| % of Female graduates | 81% | 86% | 66% | 74% | 76% |
| Nb of thesis in co-direction or bi-national direction* | - | - | - | - | - |
| Nb of students having fundings | | | | | |
| - state funding | 55 | 56 | 57 | 52 | 45 |
| - by entities or personally | 2 | 2 | 5 | 14 | 5 |
| Nb of students becoming teacher at the end of Cycle 3 | 11 | 14 | 21 | 17 | 18 |
| Nb of students becoming professors at the end of Cycle 3 | ** | | | | |

* There have not been the cases of co-direction of thesis in KNUTE yet.

**No one graduates can become the professor just after Cycle 3 graduation. According to Ukrainian laws and regulations a graduate can become a teacher (not professor). He has to work for five years, to publish an article in one of the journals, which are included in the scientometric databases SCOPUS or Web of Science, to pass an exam in foreign language proficiency at B2 (Common European Framework of Reference for Languages: Learning, Teaching, and Assessment), to complete an internship abroad and to meet some other requirements to get the title of associate professor (docent). Then he has to provide one more doctoral research, to write one more thesis and to defend it to get the academic degree of Doctor of Science (9 NQF level, known as "full doctor" (get through the habilitation procedure)). The habilitation and the title of associate professor (docent) are the mandatory requirements of the getting the professor title. Besides this the candidate also has to work 5 other years (total 10 years teaching experience), to publish 2 others articles in the journals, which are included in the scientometric databases SCOPUS or Web of Science, to pass an exam in foreign language proficiency at B2 (Common European Framework of Reference for Languages: Learning, Teaching, and Assessment) once more (as the result of the exam is valid only two years), to complete another internship abroad to get the professor title. So, the complexity and the extended period of the procedure of getting title of professor doesn't let us speak about it as the result of Cycle 3 program, notwithstanding the fact that this program graduation is one of the mandatory requirements to get the title.

| # | Indicator | 2012 | 2013 | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 |
|---|--|------|------|------|------|------|
| 1 | Repartition of graduated per field of study | 31 | 35 | 35 | 38 | 43 |
| | Engineering | 7 | 10 | 11 | 10 | 6 |
| | Economics | 21 | 22 | 23 | 20 | 33 |
| | Philosophy | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | - |
| | Law | 1 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 1 |
| | Psychology | - | - | - | 3 | 1 |
| | Economic security | - | - | - | - | - |
| | Policy | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| | Governance | - | - | - | - | - |
| 2 | Average duration of thesis, repartition per field of study for the last five years | | | | | |
| | 05 Engineering | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 |
| | 08 Economics | 4 | 3.5 | 3.5 | 3 | 3 |
| | 09 Philosophy | 4.5 | 4.5 | 4 | 4.5 | 5 |
| | 12 Law | 3 | 3 | 3.5 | 3.5 | 3 |

| | | | | | | |
|---|---|------------------------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| | 19 Psychology | 3.5 | 3 | 4 | 3.5 | 4 |
| | 21 Economic security | - | - | - | - | - |
| | 23 Policy | 4 | 3.5 | 3.5 | 3.5 | 3 |
| | 25 Governance | - | - | - | - | - |
| 3 | Dropout rates for the last five years and provide also information about the reasons and the fields of study* | 3.7% | 4.6% | 5% | 10% | 14.5% |
| 4 | Repartition of co-direction and of bi-national direction thesis by field of study | The lack of such practice in KNUTE | | | | |
| # | Indicator | 2012 | 2013 | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 |
| 5 | How many PhD are going back to university after a period of professional activities? | 57 | 56 | 57 | 52 | 51 |
| 6 | How long after their master? Why? | No data | | | | |
| 7 | How many PhD graduates are recruited as the academic staff at the end of their PhD? | +/- 60% (no exactly information) | | | | |

* The high rates of dropouts in 2015 was caused by the changes in the Ukrainian legislation on retirement. The old professors, who were the supervisors of many PhD students, retired in a big way that influenced on their mentees. The 2016 year was marked by the merge between KNUTE and Ukrainian State University of Finance and International Trade. It also caused the staff changes that reflects in the increases of dropouts.

2.1.5. Positioning of Cycle 3

a) Do doctoral students belong to a research laboratory while writing their thesis? What are the relations of PhD students with the research laboratory? Doctoral students of KNUTE mainly use the University's laboratories, while writing their thesis. However, in some cases they cooperate with other laboratories. In such cases they do that within the contracts between KNUTE and such laboratories or according their personal contracts with such laboratories.

b) Are PhD research subjects chosen in partnership with research units and in line with the scientific local, regional and national environment? The PhD candidates must justify the relevance and problemacy of their research through critical analysis and comparison with known solutions of the scientific problem. That's why PhD research subjects are chosen according to the research interests of the department, in partnership with different research units. The cooperation with ministries and other state authorities (e.g. the National bank of Ukraine, the Ministry of Economic Development and Trade of Ukraine, the Ministry of Finance of Ukraine, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Ukraine, the State Fiscal Service of Ukraine, the State Treasury Service of Ukraine, Antimonopoly Committee of Ukraine, the State Finance Inspection of Ukraine, the Pension Fund of Ukraine), organizations and enterprises also reflects at the topic of the PhD research.

c) What is the ratio of PhD workers in the private sector? KNUTE has not exactly information about this ratio. However, knowing that about 60% of PhDs remain to work in the field of education (primarily in KNUTE), we can count that about 40 % of KNUTE's Cycle 3 programs graduates goes into the private sector.

d) Is there any that favours the employment of PhD workers? Everything depends on the sphere of employment. KNUTE's Cycle 3 programs graduates practically do not have problems with finding a job the sphere of education, while in spheres of state administration, trade, production, etc., everything depends on the personal practical abilities.

e) Are there any contribution from the private sector the PHD curriculum? or to its financing? of regulation? Sometimes, studying at Cycle 3 programs is occurring by the expense of private sector or individuals (under contract). But there is any contribution from the private sector to a PhD curriculum. The only thesis reflects the urgency, which was involved.

2.1.6. Follow-up of PhD Students and graduates

a) Besides the direction provided by each research supervisor, does the university follow up PhD students? Yes, Postgraduate and Doctoral Studies Department provides this coordination. Students make their scientific research according to the individual plan, which determines the content, deadlines and scope of scientific papers and the schedule of thesis's development. Violation of the individual plan terms without the convincing reason, may be the ground for making a decisions by the Academic Council about the exclusion of the student.

b) Are there trainings provided to PhD? Are they compulsory to validate a doctorate? Do they give credits? Cycle 3 programs include educational component that:

- obtaining a deep knowledge of specialty (group of specialties), on which a PhD student doing research, including mastering basic concepts, understanding of theoretical and practical problems, genesis and the current state of scientific knowledge in the field of research, mastering the terminology (12 ECTS credits);
- mastery of general scientific (philosophical) competences aimed at forming a system of scientific philosophy, ethics and general cultural horizons (4-6 ECTS credits);
- the acquisition of versatile skills of researchers, including oral and written presentation of the results of its own research in Ukrainian language, the use of modern information technology in research activities, organizing and conducting training sessions, management of research projects and / or drafting proposals for research funding, registration of intellectual property rights (6 ECTS credits);
- gaining knowledge to present and discuss the results of their scientific work in a foreign language (English or another according to the specific specialty) orally and in writing, and for full understanding of foreign scientific texts of the relevant specialty (6-8 ECTS credits).

Some of these trainings are compulsory, some are elective (at least 25% ECTS credits of the full-time Cycle 3 programs). The students of Cycle 3 programs have the right to choose subjects offered by other levels of HE and linked to the subject of their research.

c) *Is there a document, a "thesis charter" specifying the mutual commitments between PhD students and thesis supervisors?* There is a Contract, which is concluded between KNUTE and the post-graduate student. The contract identifies rights and duties of the graduate student, but there aren't rights and duties of the supervisor. The latter are determined by the KNUTE Regulations on the Procedure for Studying Candidates for a Degree of Doctor of Philosophy and Doctor of Science²⁶.

d) *Are there rules of conduct for doctorate within universities? Are they written? How are they applied? Has the university set up methods against plagiarism? Which tools (software against plagiarism) are used?*

PhD students shall enjoy the rights and responsibilities of HE applicants determined by the Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education"²⁷, as well as those pointed in Regulations on the Organization of the Educational Process of PhD Students at KNUTE²⁸.

According to the code of ethics scholar KNUTE has a system of measures for compliance with scientific ethics, to prevent copyright infringement, unauthorized text loans (academic plagiarism) in the scientific literature. There is a practice of using the software "antiplagiat".

e) *In connection with local officials, are proceedings adapted to PhD profiles set up in order to follow up the progress of their research project (results obtained, publications/productions, integration opportunities, etc.)?* According to the subject of the thesis for PhD degree it is required:

- at least 5 publications in scientific (including electronic) professional journals of Ukraine and other countries, including:
- at least 1 article in the foreign scientific periodicals or the Ukrainian journals included into the international scientometric databases;
- one of the articles may be published in electronic scientific professional journal.

Also PhD students have to test the results of the research through the reporting of them at the conferences. Quantity is unlimited.

f) *Are plans set up by the institution to prevent and reduce situations that may lead to dropouts, for example follow-up committees for thesis, defence in the course of a thesis, tutor or referent, mediator in case of conflict, etc.?*

Each department of KNUTE sets up the follow-up committees for each PhD student, that consist of 2 professors, who are the specialists in the field of his research. The follow-up committee establishes at the beginning of PhD student's training. It reviews the research materials twice per year, in addition to scientific supervisor.

If there is a conflict between PhD student and the supervisor, it can be mediate by the Head of the department (with regard to the opinion of the follow-up committee's members) and the Vice-Rector for Scientific Work of KNUTE.

g) *Does the institution provide its PhD students with theoretical and practical trainings in order to integrate into society at a level corresponding to his/her qualification, in the private or academic sector?*

²⁶KNUTE Regulations on the Procedure for Studying Candidates for a Degree of Doctor of Philosophy and Doctor of Science #1324 of 12.05.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://knteu.kiev.ua/file/MTc=/d90a6c58922d38c20a080ad6d6b10325.pdf>

²⁷ Ukrainian Law «On Higher Education». Available in Ukrainian at: <http://zakon2.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1556-18>

²⁸Regulations on the Organization of the Educational Process of PhD Students at KNUTE #1323 of 12.05.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/file/Mg==/ac56d423c4cd43f20f16a644e1b4c4ec.pdf>

The detailed information about theoretical trainings is presented in the section 2.1.6.b. As for the practical ones, now they are absent in Cycle 3 Programs' curricula, while just 1 year ago, it was obligatory for every PhD student to provide practical trainings in academic institutions. It was a part of the individual plan.

h) How many PhD receive a scholarship/financing to write their thesis? Where do scholarships/financing come from? Are there theses financed by private or public firms, or by State bodies, on subjects specified by the financing bodies? 87% of PhD students in KNUTE are studying at the expense of the state budget (for government contract) and are obtaining the academic scholarship once a month within proven university funding. Others pay by themselves. The value of an academic scholarship, the order of its appointment and payment are determined by the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine. For excellence in studying, significant scientific and public activity PhD students may be granted by personal academic scholarship of KNUTE and personalised academic scholarships of The President of Ukraine, Verkhovna Rada (Supreme Council) of Ukraine, Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, Kyiv City Head. In order to improve living standards and incentives for academic achievements as well as for participation in social, sports and scientific activities, the University has the right to provide financial assistance and encouragement of undergraduate and postgraduate students enrolled for the state order. The Scholarship Commission decides to provide material support and encouragement separately for each person and each payment. Appointment and payment of scholarships to postgraduate students who are foreign citizens and stateless persons shall be in accordance with international agreements of Ukraine and of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine.

i) What is the percentage of PhD finding a job immediately after their thesis? Six months after? A year after? Later? Are such jobs directly linked to their thesis subject or to the subject area of the doctorate? More than a half of the graduates of KNUTE Cycle 3 programs are directly employed by the KNUTE and other HEIs. As for the data on other graduates' employment, they are not collected by KNUTE. There is only piecemeal picture of their employment, created on the data from the Alumni Association and the personal contacts of graduates with KNUTE's personnel, first of all the thesis's supervisors and teachers of the relevant departments.

j) Are there Alumni associations? Are they highly active? There is an Alumni Association in the KNUTE, which is the active party to university life. The alumnuses participate in various activities and initiatives of KNUTE, finance some university's projects. However, KNUTE doesn't provide the regular monitoring of graduates. For those graduates, who continue their scientific career in KNUTE, the Scientific Community of Students, Postgraduate Students, Doctoral Students and Young Scientists is established. Community is a voluntary creative association that promotes science and the emergence of interest to scientific work among youth of the University. It operates independently as well as in collaboration with the University Administration, faculties and institutions, student government, labour union of the University, government agencies, public organizations of Ukraine and other countries, whose activities are not contrary to the principles of the Community. Membership in the Community is free for those who study and work at the University and is carried out on a voluntary basis.

k) Are there any consideration for the PhD title or defence if an international stay in a foreign research or HEI is done? Basically no.

l) Are there any grants for travel to improve the internationalization of PhDs? The PhD students of KNUTE are involved into the Erasmus+, Erasmus Mundus, Jean Monnet programs of academic mobility, as well as programs of academic mobility based on bilateral or multilateral agreements between KNUTE and other universities. However, it is not widespread.

m) What are the accepted languages to defence and/or write the PhD dissertation? In case of more than one, could you provide any figures concerning the number of PhD dissertation in foreign languages? The PhD thesis must be written in the official language (Ukrainian). At the request of the applicant the thesis may be translated into English or other language related to the subject of the study.²⁹ KNUTE has not such experiences yet.

2.2. IOA and EQA mechanisms of Cycle 3

2.2.1. Internal QA

²⁹ Ukrainian Law «On Higher Education». Available in Ukrainian at: <http://zakon2.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1556-18>

| ESG PART 1 | YES | NO | EXPLAIN |
|--|------------|-----------|--|
| Do HEI have a policy to guarantee internally quality of the Degrees delivered? | + | | Quality Management System in KNUTE |
| If yes, is it made public and part of its strategic management? | + | | Yes, it is. |
| If yes, do they have appropriate structure and processes? | + | | Yes, they are determined by the Quality Guidelines of KNUTE |
| Are the pedagogical methods and methods of delivery assessed? | + | | There is a teacher rating in KNUTE that considers the results of anonymous assessment by the students and the results of estimation of colleagues, which are generated through the public lectures. |
| ESG PART 1 | YES | NO | EXPLAIN |
| Does the university assess the supervision of the director of thesis | + | | Every half a year through the approval of the report on completion of individual plans of PhD studding |
| Does the PhD student assess the supervision of his/her director during his/her thesis? | | - | Normally, only in the problem cases, while within the current research we have interviewed 100 of PhD students on the matter. 98 % of them have said that they are satisfied by their supervisors. |
| Does the university assess the success rates at the doctorate? | + | | Per year |
| Are the criteria for the assessment made public? | + | | There is only one quantitate criterion – the percentage of the PhD students who defends thesis successfully and timely. It is public. |
| Is assessment carried out by an external examiner? | | - | Normally, not, but it can be in a case of external assessment. |
| Is there a procedure for students appeals? | + | | Provided by the Regulations on the Procedure for Studding Candidates for a Degree of Doctor of Philosophy and Doctor of Science ³⁰ |
| Are there regulations for student admission? | + | | Provided by the Regulations on the Procedure for Studding Candidates for a Degree of Doctor of Philosophy and Doctor of Science ³¹ |
| Are there regulations for student progression? | + | | Provided by the Regulations on the Organization of the Educational Process of PhD Students at KNUTE ³² |
| How is the competence of teachers assessed? | + | | There are 3 kinds of teachers' assessment procedures in KNUTE: 1) self-assessment with the criteria pointed in the Regulation on Rating Assessment, 2) assessment by students through the anonymous survey, 3) assessment by colleagues through the public lectures' visiting. |
| Are there fair and transparent procedures for the recruitment of staff? | + | | Provided by the Regulations on the Procedure of Competitive Selection of Teachers and Directors of Colleges and Training Schools of KNUTE ³³ |
| Do the HEI collect analyses and use relevant information for the management of Cycle 3? | + | | Required by the Quality Guidelines of KNUTE |
| Do the HEI publish clear, accurate and objective information on Cycle 3? | + | | https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/blog/read?n=Viddil%20aspiranturi%20i%20doktoranturi&uk |
| Are the Cycle 3 programs well monitored? | + | | Required by the Quality Guidelines of KNUTE |
| Are the Cycle 3 programs reviewed and modified? | + | | Per year |
| Can the PhD students make their own evaluation of skills acquired throughout their thesis? | | | Depends on the student |

³⁰KNUTE Regulations on the Procedure for Studding Candidates for a Degree of Doctor of Philosophy and Doctor of Science #1324 of 12.05.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://knteu.kiev.ua/file/MTc=/d90a6c58922d38c20a080ad6d6b10325.pdf>

³¹KNUTE Regulations on the Procedure for Studding Candidates for a Degree of Doctor of Philosophy and Doctor of Science #1324 of 12.05.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://knteu.kiev.ua/file/MTc=/d90a6c58922d38c20a080ad6d6b10325.pdf>

³²Regulations on the Organization of the Educational Process of PhD Students at KNUTE #1323 of 12.05.2016. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/file/Mg==/ac56d423c4cd43f20f16a644e1b4c4ec.pdf>

³³Regulations on the Procedure of Competitive Selection of Teachers and Directors of Colleges and Training Schools of KNUTE #931 of 24.04.2015. Available in Ukrainian at: <https://knteu.kiev.ua/file/MTc=/8fe5c602fde1a3ee85649952021233ac.pdf>

2.2.2. External QA

The national system of quality assurance in HE considered to be implemented by the means of licensing and accreditation procedures. According to the Law “On Higher Education”, the NAQAHE is the body responsible for quality assurance and improvement in HE by the means of accreditation. MESU is the licensing body. While the NAQAHE is under establishing now, accreditation is carried out by the Accreditation Commission of Ukraine (ACU), which is a network of the experts that operates under MESU.

The Law “On Higher Education” stipulates that all the HEIs must be licensed before offering an education program. It is also determined that MESU grants licenses on the basis of positive expert opinion of NAQAHE (is under establishing now). To be granted a licence, a HEI must meet the required standards set by the MESU which relate to infrastructure, resources, staff and programmes. The licencing process includes the following steps: 1) self-evaluation and application; 2) expertise; 3) decision to issue a license. Thus HEI must confirm its ability to introduce and implement educational and scientific programme for Cycle 3 (which actually is a subject of licensing). The term of license validation is determined by MESU for the particular university within 5 to 12 years and may be renewed on the basis of successful accreditation.

For PhD programs accreditation a HEI must meet the requirements of the HE standards. According to the Law “On Higher Education”, the HE standard is a set of requirements for the content and results of the educational activities of the HEIs and the research institutes at each higher education level within each program subject area. They must be developed according to the National Qualifications Framework. MESU develops the HE standards for each program subject area (detailed field) taking into consideration the proposals of sectorial public authorities, industry associations and employers' organizations. The standards must be authorised by NAQAHE. The HE standard defines the following requirements for the educational programs: 1) the amount of ECTS credits needed to obtain the corresponding degree of higher education; 2) a list of competencies for graduates; 3) learning outcomes; 4) the types of certification for the students; 5) the requirements for the internal quality assurance system; 6) the requirements for professional standards (if any).

The accreditation procedure is similar to the licensing one. It consists of the following steps: 1) self-evaluation and application; 2) expertise; 3) decision to issue a certificate. The term of the certificate validation is 5 (for the first accreditation) to 10 years (for each next accreditation).

In both cases expertise is provided by peers (experts, academics, professionals). Experts are carefully selected with the criterion of skills and competences to perform the task. They must be independent and have no conflict of the interest. The results of EQA are published on the web-sites of MESU.

The procedure to establish a category (level) of the Cycle 3 is not available now.

Chapter 3 – Main challenges of Cycle 3 Programs and its QA

3.1 At national /policy level

Cycle 3 program is an instrument of academic staff training. PhD graduates have enough research competences to generate new knowledge that is a significant competitive advantage for the current knowledge-driven economy.

Due to the highly dynamic environment, there is a need to develop an effective mechanism of science and business integration. The first step of such an integration must be the development of the priorities of national innovation-driven growth. The second one is the support to those researches that are relevant to the priorities.

There is a need to reform the system of research results' dissemination. The current Ukrainian system of research results' dissemination is pointed by the dominance of two scientometric databases – Scopus and Web of Science. They are only two that are recommended by the MESU. Only the publications in the journals included into these two databases are brought the real benefits to the researches (in terms of getting the academic title or gaining the funding for research). These two databases are not the most credible ones, especially in the sphere of social science. The JStor or RePEc (economic papers) databases are second to none. They also have much more free access articles that make them much more quoted. This situation brings to scare dissemination of the results of PhD researches, even if all of them are published

3.2 **For institutions**

a) *Does your university provide Cycle 3 Programs?* KNUTE Cycle 3 Programs trains about 200 postgraduate students per year. They let the University provide its own needs for academic staff and develop the scientific schools. Besides this, KNUTE Cycle 3 programs provide the needs of business entities for highly qualified personnel.

b) *What are the objectives of your Cycles 3 programs? What are their positioning in the university's strategies?* The doctorate studies take the prominent role in the scope of strategic objectives of KNUTE's development, being an instrument of providing the better qualitative composition of the staff. It is pointed in the draft of the KNUTE strategy for 2017 – 2030. It is planned to increase the share of professors in the total number of teachers in KNUTE, to start new Cycle 3 programs, to promote the internationalization of researches, etc.³⁴.

c) *How is Cycle 3 Program articulated with Master Programs and strategies and activities of your university?* The 2 and 3 Cycle programs differ from each other. KNUTE Cycle 3 programs consist of two components – educational and scientific ones, while the Cycle 2 programs – only educational one. 60 % of ECTS credits of Cycle 3 program is devoted to the scientific research, while the master thesis development takes only 20 % of ECTS credits of Cycle 2 program. Master thesis is much more practical than the PhD one. There are different procedures of their public defence.

The difference between Cycle 3 programs and research activities of University's academic staff arises from the fact that every PhD research is only a part of R&D activity of certain academic department, which is run alongside the main idea of the relevant scientific school within it.

d) *Describe how Cycle 3 is organized.* As the detailed description of KNUTE's Cycle 3 programs (from recruitment to Degree awarding) has already done in the section 2.1.3, let us stop only the challenges that University meet with.

KNUTE has no problems with the students' or professors' recruitment. However, there is a problem with the management of educational component of Cycle 3 programs with regard to students' group development. The wide range of specialties and the differences of students' scientific interests do not let us form the complete group for every academic course. There are many cases, when the only one student wishes to study a course, that is not effective from economic point of view. We have no this problem before 2016, because of the scarce educational component of the previous Cycle 3 programs (there were only two academic courses – philosophy and foreign language – that were the same for all the PhD students). We have not elaborated the effective remedies to cope with it yet.

e) *Is there any follow up system of the PHD graduates?* KNUTE tries to follow up the graduates. There is an Alumni Association in KNUTE that is committed to different KNUTE events and even finances some of them. Many PhD graduates cooperate with the relevant academic departments of KNUTE. They come to the University to deliver a lecture or a master-class for students. However, there is no regular monitoring of graduates in KNUTE.

For those graduates, who stay in KNUTE as teachers, there is the Scientific Community of Students, Postgraduate Students, Doctoral Students and Young Scientists of KNUTE, where they can share their scientific experience with the students.

f) *Can you explain if there are any mechanisms (internal or external) to guarantee quality assurance of Cycle 3 programs?* To provide the QA of Cycle 3 programs KNUTE arranges the processes of:

- development and publication at the KNUTE web-site (<https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/blog/read?n=Viddil%20aspiranturi%20i%20doktoranturi&uk>) all the regulations of Cycle 3 programs;
- detailed scheduling of the students' research and education activity;
- creation of the follow-up committees for every PhD student that consist of the professionals in the field of his research activity;
- periodical (twice a year) reports of the students about the progress in the research;
- delivering profession-oriented scientific seminars;
- delivering lectures by the eminent scientists, etc.

3.3 **For PhD Students**

³⁴ The Draft of KNUTE's Strategy for 2017 – 2030.

To answer the questions of this chapter we have interviewed 100 PhD students of KNUTE. They are from different Cycle 3 programs and years of study. The results are pointed below³⁵.

a) *What were the rationales for you to start a PhD in your country?* 48 % of the respondents point that the main reason of their studying the Cycle 3 program is the aim to get the higher qualification to find better business position. 47 % of them say that they do that to get the enough qualification to teach at the University. 25 % of the respondents point that the studying Cycle 3 program let them implement their researcher's aspirations.

b) *Is the information related to PhD programs: clear, easily accessible, transparent.* 57 % of respondents point that the information about the PhD programs in KNUTE is clear, transparent and easily accessible. 40 % tell about easy access to the information about the programs, but sometimes it is not clear enough. 3 % of surveyed students tell that this information is clear enough, but it is not easy to get it sometimes. Nobody tells that the information is inaccessible.

c) *Do you feel you have enough support from your professors? from the academic staff?* 98 % of the surveyed students tell that they feel enough support from the supervisor of their scientific research. 93 % of respondents also feels enough support from other academic staff – teachers, follow-up committees, other professors of KNUTE.

e) *What are your expectations after your PhD?* The plans of PhD students after the graduation divided in such a way: 41 % of them plan to stay in the KNUTE as teachers, 39 % - plan to get job in business; 10 % - to get a job in state agencies. Only 1 % of respondents tell about the plans to work in a research laboratory. Some students declare their plans to combine scientific and pedagogical work with business activity.

f) *What would you suggest to improve Doctorate studies in your university?* 67 % of surveyed students say that they are fully satisfied by the Doctorate studies of KNUTE. The other 33 % of respondents develop some recommendation to improve them. Their recommendations were rather different. We have summarized them into some groups.

The first group (6 % of surveyed students) comes up with the recommendation to minimize the educational component of PhD programs (today it amounts to 60 credits of ECTS). They say that it diverts their attention from scientific research and ask to decrease educational component, while increasing the scientific one.

The second group (10 %) develops the recommendation to change the content of some courses, to make some of them distant (e-course).

The third group of respondents (5 %) asks to optimize the class schedule to release more time for scientific research. This problem is urgent for the extramural students of Cycle 3 programs (before the reform of 2016 the PhD students could study at the extramural programs).

The fourth group (8 %) asks to organize communication and document flow between the students and the officials of Postgraduate and Doctoral Studies Department mainly on-line, to use mobile applications widely, to establish e-reports instead the paper ones, etc.

Another group (4 %) asks to increase the international mobility of students.

g) *What would you suggest to improve Doctorate studies in your country?* Among the scope of recommendation of students of KNUTE to improve Doctorate studies in Ukraine the most popular are:

- to increase correlation between science and business;
- to establish professional doctorate;
- to decrease the educational component of PhD programs;
- to increase state financing of scientific projects;
- to decrease the red type in the procedures of getting the PhD degree;
- to open the access of students to the publications in the scientometric databases Scopus and Web of Science;
- to add other databases (besides Scopus and Web of Science) into the list of the scientometric databases recommended by MESU for publications of the results of the scientific research;
- to arrange the problem with high prices for the publications in the journals included into the list of recommended by the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine.

3.4 For the socio-economic world

³⁵The results of the interview is available in Ukrainian at: <https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1Z364zjcEt6hKHBRU25yG470nn-hhxgmw3lkXZB-P5w/edit>

This chapter is also created with the results of interviews. It consists of the summarized results of the answers of 62 partners of KNUTE to the below-specified questions³⁶.

a) *Has somebody of your staff a PhD / candidate of Science Degree?* The answer “yes” has been chosen by 62.9 % of respondent, while others point the absence of Cycle 3 graduates within the company staff.

b) *Is there a need for PhD graduates in your socio economic sector?* 48.4 % of respondents tell about the need for the PhD graduates, while 51.6 % of them say “no”. There is no clear difference between the answers of companies from different sectors of the economy. Mainly all the sectors give both answers. For example, 80 % of surveyed companies from manufacturing sector testify the need for PhD graduates, while 20 % say “no”. In trade 42 % of respondents say “yes”, while others have no need for PhD graduates. 27 % of the respondents from financial sector is looking for PhD graduates, while 73 % need not them. The 80 % of the respondents from the sector of information and telecommunications show the need for PhD graduates while 20 % do not. And so on.

c) *Are the PhD graduated well adapted to your needs?* 21 % of business representatives, who has been interviewed, point that they are entirely satisfied with the competences of PhD graduates. 32.3 % of the respondents are almost satisfied with it. So, more than a half of the respondents testify that the KNUTE PhD graduates are well adapted to their needs. 16.1 % of the respondents point that they are mainly dissatisfied with the competences of PhD graduates and 4.8 % of the respondents say that they are totally dissatisfied. 25.8 % of the respondents have no considered opinion on the matter of the question.

d) *Are you associated to Cycle 3 programs?* Only 19.4 % of the surveyed companies are associated to KNUTE Cycle 3 programs. The most popular ways of companies’ involvement into the Cycle 3 programs are:

- providing the information and other resources for doctoral researches (53.3 % of the respondents, who are associated with KNUTE’s PhD programs);
- delivering lectures, seminars, trainings for PhD students (40 %);
- conducting of mutual scientific researches (33 %);
- implementation of the results of PhD researches (20 %).

e) *Would you like to be more involved in the training/research activities?* More than a half (50.9 %) of the respondents say that they would like to be involved deeper into KNUTE’s Cycle 3 programs. As for the forms of the involvement, there is a different breakdown of answers as compared to the previous para. 53.8 % of the respondents would like to implement the results of PhD researches into their business activity; 51.3 % of them would like to deliver lectures, seminars, trainings for PhD students; 35.9 % – would like to conduct mutual scientific researches and provide information and other resources for doctoral researches.

f) *Precise the positive aspects of Cycle 3, from your perspective.* The most evident advantage of the Cycle 3 programs from the businesspersons’ point of view is its commitment to create the critical thinking competences of the PhD gradutors (56.5 % of answers). 53.5 % of the respondents consider that Cycle 3 programs are good due to their ability to create professional skills and communicative competences. 46.8 % of them appreciate the Cycle 3 programs for their correlation with the needs of business environment. 32.3 % of surveyed KNUTE partners tell that combining of education and scientific research is the good practice for PhD candidates that should lead to enhancing the efficiency of Cycle 3 programs. 22.6 % of respondents appreciate that current Cycle 3 programs consider mastering of the methodology of scientific inquiry.

g) *Precise the negative aspects of Cycle 3, from your perspective.* The top disadvantages of Cycle 3 programs are found to be an excessive theorization of the science, its disconnect from the needs of the business (74.2 % of answers) and insufficient coordination with the business entities through the researches’ conducting (58.1 % of answers). 43.5 % of the respondents mention the problem of the scare access of PhD students to the newest research capacities. 33.9 % of them point as the Cycle 3 disadvantage the restricted access to commercial information of business entities, while 38.9 % of the respondents also point on the problem of scare dissemination of the results of PhD researches.

³⁶The results of the interview is available in Ukrainian at: <https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1YRipbJaI9mF-l1MC2B8FcpcYSy6G.70jXDS5-GMQK18/edit>

Chapter 4 – Good practice examples

The strategy of HE development in Ukraine provides the practice of the European principles to satisfy the growing needs of potential consumers of educational services. That's why, Quality Management System (QMS) at KNUTE was first among Ukrainian universities certified for compliance with ISO 9001:2009 in 2009. In 2016 there was restart of QMS at KNUTE in accordance with ISO 9001:2015, which came into a force in Ukraine in July 2016. An independent external audit, performed by the certification body, confirmed the effectiveness of SQM of KNUTE for compliance with ISO 9001:2015. The certificate of the conformity is issued for five-year period.

KNUTE has developed the internal HE standards through all the Cycle 1, 2 and 3 programs, which consists of the following sections: educational program; curriculum; availability requirements of internal quality assurance; professional standard requirements (if any); Additional requirements (if necessary), etc. All the standards were confirmed by interdepartmental working groups, which consist of lead professors, as well as by students' representatives and representatives of employers. Among the latter are public authorities, institutions, civic and business entities.